

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**National Register of Historic Places
Registration Form**

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. See instructions in *How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form* (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter, word processor, or computer to complete all items.

1. Name of Property

historic name Barrio El Hoyo Historic District

other names/site number N/A

2. Location

street & number Roughly bounded by W. Cushing St. on the north, W. 18th St. on the ___ not for publication
south, S. 11th Ave. on the east, and S. Samaniego Ave. and S. Osborne Ave. on the west

city or town Tucson ___ vicinity

state Arizona code AZ county Pima code 019 zip code 85701

3. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation act, as amended, I hereby certify that this ___ nomination ___ request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60. In my opinion, the property ___ meets ___ does not meet the National Register criteria. I recommend that this property be considered significant ___ nationally ___ statewide ___ locally. (___ See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature of certifying official/Title

Date

State or Federal agency and bureau

In my opinion, the property ___ meets ___ does not meet the National Register criteria. (___ See continuation sheet for additional comments.)

Signature of certifying official/Title

State or Federal agency and bureau

4. National Park Service Certification

I hereby certify that the property is:

Signature of the Keeper

Date of Action

___ entered in the National Register
___ See continuation sheet

___ determined eligible for the National Register
___ See continuation sheet

___ determined not eligible for the National Register

___ removed from the National Register

___ other (explain)

5. Classification

Ownership of Property
(Check as many boxes as apply)

- private
- public-local
- public-State
- public-Federal

Category of Property
(Check only one box)

- building(s)
- district
- site
- object

Number of Resources within Property
(Do not include previously listed resources in the count)

Contributing	Noncontributing	
68	28	buildings
		sites
		structures
		objects
68	28	Total

Name of related multiple property listing
(Enter "N/A" if property is not part of a multiple property listing)

N/A

Number of contributing resources previously listed in the National Register

0

6. Function or Use

Historic Functions

(Enter categories from instructions)
DOMESTIC/single dwelling, multiple dwelling
COMMERCE/TRADE/department store
RELIGION/religious facility

Current Functions

(Enter categories from instructions)
DOMESTIC/single dwelling, multiple dwelling
RELIGION/religious facility

7. Description

Architectural Classification

(Enter categories from instructions)
OTHER: Sonoran Tradition
LATE 19TH AND EARLY 20TH CENTURY
REVIVALS: Mission/Spanish Colonial Revival

Materials

(Enter categories from instructions)
foundation STONE, CONCRETE
walls ADOBE, BRICK, STUCCO
roof METAL, ASPHALT
other WOOD

Narrative Description

(Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets)

8. Statement of Significance

Applicable National Register Criteria

(Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing)

- A** Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- B** Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- C** Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.
- D** Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations

(Mark "x" in all boxes that apply)

Property is:

- A** owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.
- B** removed from its original location.
- C** a birthplace or grave.
- D** a cemetery.
- E** a reconstructed building, object, or structure.
- F** a commemorative property.
- G** less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.

Narrative Statement of Significance

(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets)

9. Major Bibliographical References

Bibliography

(Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more continuation sheets)

Previous documentation on file (NPS):

- preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
- previously listed in the National Register
- previously determined eligible by the National Register
- designated a National Historic Landmark
- recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey, No.
- recorded by Historic American Engineering Record, No.

Primary location of additional data:

- State Historic Preservation Office
- Other State agency
- Federal agency
- Local government
- University
- Other

Name of repository:

Areas of Significance

(Enter categories from instructions)

ARCHITECTURE
COMMUNITY PLANNING AND
DEVELOPMENT

Period of Significance

1908-1950

Significant Dates

N/A

Significant Person

N/A

Cultural Affiliation

N/A

Architect/Builder

N/A

10. Geographical Data

Acreage of Property approximately 22 acres

UTM References

(Place additional UTM references on a continuation sheet)

	Zone	Easting	Northing		Zone	Easting	Northing
1	12	502177	3564441	3	12	502332	3564074
2	12	502372	3564442	4	12	502293	3563947

Verbal Boundary Description

(Describe the boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet)

Boundary Justification

(Explain why the boundaries were selected on a continuation sheet)

11. Form Prepared By

name/title Morgan Rieder, Historical Architect, Paul Farnsworth Ph.D., Paul Rawson, M.A.

organization William Self Associates, Inc.

date December 19, 2007

street & number 2424 E. Broadway Blvd., Suite 100

telephone (520) 624-0101

city or town Tucson

state AZ

zip code 85719

Additional Documentation

Submit the following items with the completed form:

Continuation Sheets

Maps

A **USGS map** (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location.

A **Sketch map** for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources.

Photographs

Representative **black and white photographs** of the property.

Additional items

(Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)

Property Owner

(Complete this item at the request of the SHPO or FPO.)

name

street & number

telephone

city or town

state

zip code

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 1

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description

Barrio El Hoyo is a small residential neighborhood, located southwest of Tucson's downtown. Barrio El Hoyo, together with the National Register-listed Barrio Libre Historic District (listed October 18, 1978), comprise the locally designated Barrio Histórico Historic District. The City of Tucson has viewed Barrio El Hoyo as having the same architectural and historical importance as the National Register-listed Barrio Libre. The current nomination is to provide comparable State and National Register recognition of the district's significance. It possesses 68 contributing resources and 28 noncontributing resources; contributing resources reflect good examples of properties executed in Sonoran Tradition, and one religious structure in Mission style. Noncontributing resources mainly reflect infill after the period of significance. The barrio's period of significance is from 1908 to 1950, which was chosen to reflect the period of the development of the neighborhood. The neighborhood retains a considerable degree of intergrity of materials, workmanship, and a high degree of integrity in terms of location, design, setting, feeling, and association.

Barrio El Hoyo is located within walking distance of Tucson's downtown, to the southwest. The neighborhood is bounded on the north and northwest by the facilities of the Tucson Convention Center, on the west by industrial yards, on the southwest and south by Tucson Water facilities, and on the east by Barrio Libre Historic District, listed in the National Register on October 18, 1978. Other nearby barrios are Santa Rosa, to the south, and a remnant of El Membrillo, to the northwest. El Hoyo derives its name ("the hole") from its topography, because most of the neighborhood is on lower ground than the surrounding areas to the east and south. Until the late nineteenth century, this was cultivated land on the floodplain of the Santa Cruz River. In the early 1870s, Leopoldo Carrillo owned most of the property now occupied by Barrio El Hoyo and the area was developed as Carrillo's Gardens and, to the north, a ball field. In 1903, Emanuel Drachman purchased the Gardens after Carrillo's death, and, in partnership with Alex Rossi, opened an amusement park under the name Elysian Grove. Elysian Grove finally closed in 1915 due to financial problems and the land was sold and subdivided.

Barrio El Hoyo was formed from three blocks—221, 243, and 245—of the original 1874 Tucson Townsite. Block 245, between 17th and 18th Streets, was divided by Osborne Street and platted by 1905, but remained part of the City of Tucson plat; building here began by 1908 (e.g. 715 S. 11th Ave.). After the demise of Elysian Grove in 1915, Block 243, between 17th Street and Mission Road (now W. Simpson Street), was platted as the Elysian Grove subdivision; the plat was not filed until 1921, but lots were being sold and dwellings constructed from 1915 on. Most of Block 221, north of Mission Road (now W. Simpson Street), was platted as the Southwestern addition in 1920; in 1926, a portion of this addition was replatted as the Ball Park subdivision. The northern two-thirds of Block 221 was demolished in the 1970s for the Tucson Convention Center, but leaving two-thirds of the Ball Park subdivision intact. Approximately three-quarters of the barrio had been built by 1931, before the effects of the Great Depression; the remaining quarter was built during recovery from the Depression up to World War II, and in the immediate postwar years. Little or no home building took

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 2

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

place during the Depression years (for lack of funds) nor during wartime (for lack of materials). The barrio had been almost entirely built up by 1950; very little infill was constructed in the 1950s (5.2 percent of the total number of buildings in the present barrio). During the following two decades, the neighborhood underwent a period of decline and a number of buildings were abandoned and collapsed. The barrio's period of significance is, therefore, from the date of the earliest standing structure, 1908, to 1950, when the barrio had been almost entirely built up.

El Hoyo is one of Tucson's "suburban" barrios, although it was (and is) very different from the Anglo-American motor-car suburbs that were being built east of downtown. Suburban barrios such as El Hoyo and Barrio Anita (north of downtown) are defined as those that developed outside Tucson's late nineteenth-century core, roughly bounded on the north by Sixth Street, on the south by Eighteenth Street, on the east by the railroad, and on the west by Main Avenue (Husband 1988).

The buildings constructed in El Hoyo during its period of significance are a continuation of the Hispanic vernacular building tradition known regionally as Sonoran. (Until the United States' invasion of Mexico and the subsequent treaties of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, and La Mesilla, in 1854, what is now southern Arizona was northern Sonora.) According to Nequette and Jeffery (2002), the typical, single-room adobe block house was the basic building unit of the early Sonoran house. In the second half of the nineteenth century this was a simple square or rectangle in plan, located at the front of the property line or street edge and contiguous with adjacent units. Shared walls saved time and materials. These rows lined the perimeter of the block, with a communal area in the center for gardening, cooking, livestock and outdoor living. A gate at the street allowed entry between units to the central area. In the late nineteenth century this gateway became enclosed as wide central hall called a *zaguán* from which other rooms were entered. A flat roof surrounded by a high parapet allowed people to sleep on the rooftops. Nequette and Jeffery (2002:272) state that there are no unchanged Sonoran houses, as all that have survived have been modified by American cultural attitudes and materials into what they call "Transformed Sonoran." Although small quantities of premanufactured building materials had been brought in by wagon freighters prior to 1880, the arrival of the Southern Pacific Railroad in Tucson that year enabled large quantities of these materials to be brought in. Bricks for coping, milled limber for window and door trim, as well as roofs, and tin for roofing were among the materials now widely available. The most common modification was the addition of a gabled or pyramidal roof.

New buildings also made use of the newly available materials. Nequette and Jeffery (2002) call these houses "Transitional." Transitional Sonoran style is the result of the transformation that occurred as Sonoran traditions began to incorporate non-Hispanic American traditions from the East. At the urban scale, this was manifested in changing land-use patterns. At the scale of the building, structures incorporated both traditions. Nequette and Jeffery (2002) identify two periods, early and

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 3

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

late. The earlier period is noted for simplicity and use of the Greek Revival pediment, while the later is noted for the use of wooden gabled roofs on adobe walls. Another change from early to late is that building placement shifted from the front of the property line to increasingly further back on the lot to create a zone of separation between public and private.

In Barrio El Hoyo, dwellings are modest in size and scale, with simple massing, ranging from row houses to isolated rectangles and ells. On any given street, flat roofs with parapets alternate with simple gabled, hipped, and shed roofs. The dwellings were built by their owners or by neighbors who worked in the building trades. Adobe continued to be the primary material for bearing walls until after World War II. Typically, the dwelling itself would be adobe, while the kitchen at the rear would be constructed of light wood frame, often using salvaged lumber, even though part of the original construction of the building. Early twentieth-century architectural movements and revivals—principally Craftsman and Mission/Spanish Colonial Revival (or Spanish Eclectic, as used by McAlester and McAlester (1997)—are in evidence, but more as influences on Sonoran than fully realized styles. These influences are subtle: Craftsman influence can be seen in the slatted vents of low-pitched gables; Spanish Eclectic can be seen in the occasional stepped parapet and use of Mission tile.

Building codes or conventions requiring uniform setbacks were unknown and building placement was highly variable. Dwellings were often built up to the street (zero lot line) in the manner of the traditional Sonoran row house, but many have a minimal front setback of 5 to 10 feet. The latter typically have a front fence (usually chain-link, but occasionally masonry and wrought iron) and chairs and benches creating an outdoor living space; the yard is usually swept dirt; flowers are often present, but usually in pots (Manger 2000). This contrasts with the Anglo-American convention, where unfenced front yards are reserved for a lawn (or, increasingly in Tucson, xeric landscaping) and the outdoor living occurs in the back yard. Side setbacks are highly variable, as dwellings were often built on the lot line on at least one side. In some cases, the dwelling is sited at the rear of the lot, like a rural *ranchito*. This is why the dwellings of the barrio are best understood as continuations of the Sonoran tradition (i.e. Sonoran Transitional, with input from contemporaneous Anglo-American modes) rather than as manifestations of specific Anglo-American architectural styles.

The one contributing element of the district that is not in the Sonoran tradition is the chapel of San Cosme (546 W. Simpson St.), a special ministry of the Diocese of Tucson. The chapel was built in 1931 to serve Barrio El Hoyo, and, until the 1960s, held regular Sunday Mass. Today the chapel is used monthly for Masses and regularly for both religious and secular activities, and reflects the traditional religious orientation of the barrio. Architecturally, the chapel was built in simple Mission style, with a low pitch, front-gabled roof edged with red clay-tile at the front to give the impression of a completely tiled roof from the street, projecting eaves with exposed rafter ends, smooth stucco

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 7 Page 4

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Description (continued)

walls painted white, arched window openings, simple visor-roofed porch with red-clay tiles, and a mission-like bell tower.

As a result of the varied responses to the interaction of traditional Sonoran and non-Hispanic American traditions, El Hoyo has a unique feel. It balances the limited urban space and dense lot layout, with a more open atmosphere like a rural village. The streets of Barrio El Hoyo tend to be narrow, noticeably narrower than the Tucson norm. Today, all the street surface asphalt is in good condition, except S. Osborne which is cracked and potholed, although originally they were not paved. The larger streets have space for sidewalks, but no paving of the sidewalks. The narrower streets don't have space where a sidewalk would be. The only paved sidewalk is a small patch in front of the Chapel San Cosme. The paving here is concrete slab, marked USA/WPA and so it is probably contemporary with chapel construction. The absence of sidewalks is very unusual in Tucson and contributes to the rural feel of the area.

El Hoyo is below the general grade of the landscape in surrounding areas to the north, east and south. Along the north edge of the district, Cushing Street is above the floor level of the adjacent houses, W. Simpson Street slopes quite markedly downhill from the east edge of the district, and the roads slope down into El Hoyo from the south. Drainage ditches run along the west side of the district, the ground is relatively level and does not slope into El Hoyo. The streets also have undulations. The undulations, especially the dips, in the road are distinctive; Tucson is generally a very graded town, and so the presence of topography is a noticeable feature of the street-scape. Also Tucson is mostly on a grid, so the angled street layout with few four-way intersections is distinctive and several streets lack traffic signs or even street signs. The narrow streets feel different, almost confined compared to most of Tucson. There is little traffic within the neighborhood, and of necessity it moves slowly.

The diversity of house setbacks along the streets, with some houses at the front property line, others set back a short distance, with others at the rear of the lot, gives the area a more unplanned, open, even rural feel. The traditional religious orientation of the barrio is also reflected in the yard areas, with *nichos* in front yards with Roman Catholic iconography, most often an image of the Virgin of Guadalupe depicted on a small patch of tiles. There is also a painted plaster statue of Our Lady, and one painted mural of her. Other common images depicted in tile are Jesus or angels. The statue and tiles are industrial products, the tiles are printed with the picture, they are not mosaics. These images can be found in other Tucson neighborhoods, but they are more common in El Hoyo, while the scarcity of copper suns, wind chimes, coyotes and cattle motifs commonly seen elsewhere in Tucson, further distinguishes the neighborhood. Quite a few houses had chairs outside along the street for people to sit out on summer evenings; in most of Tucson this is not so.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 5

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

The vegetation/landscaping is also part of the semi-rural feeling. Although the yard is usually swept dirt, flowers are often present, but usually in pots. There are quite a few tamarisk trees, which need lots of water, and are therefore less common through Tucson. There are also mesquites, palms, and citrus, and, although these are seen throughout Tucson, the trees are less pruned and more natural looking than is typical. There is also a lot of prickly pear, some very large, and, in general, the vegetation grows better in the barrio probably because it is near the river. As Sheridan (1986:240) notes:

because of the proximity of the Río Santa Cruz, the ground was moister and more fertile than in most other parts of town. Vegetation flourished...The impression of still living in the country was particularly strong on winter mornings, when mesquite smoke drifting from the chimneys of wood stoves created a haze that mingled with the mist rising from the floodplain of the river. On those mornings, Anglo Tucson must have seemed very far away indeed.

The best introduction to Barrio El Hoyo is to turn west on Simpson at Main. The most prominent feature is the former Elysian Grove Market (400 W. Simpson St.), built in 1929 by Jose Q. Trujillo at the corner of W. Simpson Street. and S. Samaniego Avenue (Photograph 1). As the local store, this was a pivotal building in the barrio, and became a neighborhood meeting place. Although the store closed in the 1960s, and was converted into three apartments, the conversion retained the original exterior appearance and visually it still is a focal point of the neighborhood. It is a classic example of its type, with the characteristic angled corner entrance. Note that the original signage has been preserved. This building stands at the northeast corner of the former Elysian Grove subdivision, the largest of the barrio's subdivisions. Of the 41 extant buildings in this subdivision that date from the barrio's period of significance, 68.3 percent were built between 1915 and 1930, 19.5 percent between 1936 and 1941, and 12.2 percent between 1946 and 1950. The subdivision consists of four blocks with streets named for prominent Hispanic figures in Tucson's history. Photograph 2 shows a characteristic streetscape in the subdivision, looking down S. Elias Ave. from W. Carrillo St.

El Hoyo's irregular topography is most pronounced in the former Elysian Grove subdivision. On streets like Samaniego and 17th, the difference in grade from the front of the lot to the back was such that builders either had to construct a dwelling with the front at grade and the back raised well above, or they had to dig the front yard down below grade, so that the rear of the structure was at grade. This can be seen in Photograph 3, a view of the south side of W. 17th Street.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 6

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

South of the former Elysian Grove subdivision is Block 245 of the City of Tucson, the oldest part of the barrio. Over half of the 11 dwellings on this block were built in the 1910s. Photograph 4 shows some of these along S. Osborne Street. This photograph illustrates the different building setbacks found throughout the district. In the immediate foreground, 704 S. Osborne Avenue is slightly set back from the street, to the left, 706 (a recent, noncontributing building) is set back further and barely visible, but 708 and 730 are at the street front of their properties. Meanwhile further to the left, 732 and 734 are both set further back on their lots, with 732 not visible in the photograph, and only the front, southeast corner of 734 barely visible.

North of the former Elysian Grove subdivision, in the Southwest and Ball Park subdivisions, are 25 extant buildings dating from the barrio's period of significance, most of which were built in the 1920s and 1930s. Photograph 5 shows S. El Paso Avenue, which runs between these subdivisions. On the right is 400 S. El Paso, one the neighborhood's examples of the Sonoran row house. The slope down into El Hoyo is also apparent. Photograph 6 shows W. Simpson St. On the left is the chapel of San Cosme (546 W. Simpson St), the other major social and visual focal point of Barrio El Hoyo. Note the only paved sidewalk in the district is the small patch in front of the chapel. Also apparent is the irregularity of house placement relative to the street, with 440 W. Simpson set back and completely hidden by the chapel, while 438 is at the street line (although partially hidden by 440's front yard vegetation). The other houses on the left side of the street are all set back from the road and thus completely obscured.

Barrio El Hoyo, together with the National Register-listed Barrio Libre Historic District comprise the locally designated Barrio Histórico Historic District. The City of Tucson has viewed Barrio El Hoyo as having the same architectural and historical importance as the National-Register-listed Barrio Libre. The current nomination is to provide comparable State and National Register recognition of the district's significance.

Assessment of District Integrity

Location

Barrio El Hoyo was formed from three blocks—221, 243, and 245—of the original 1874 Tucson Townsite, a short walk southwest of Tucson's downtown area. Modern development has destroyed some of the original area occupied by the barrio to the north, west and southwest of the district, but the core remains intact. As a result Barrio El Hoyo retains a high degree of integrity of location.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 7 Page 7

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Description (continued)

Design

Barrio El Hoyo retains many of the elements that made the original barrio distinctive. The barrio had been almost entirely built up by 1950; very little infill was constructed in the 1950s (5.2 percent of the total number of buildings in the present barrio). During the following two decades, the neighborhood underwent a period of decline and a number of buildings were abandoned and collapsed. In the 1980s, revitalization (or gentrification, depending upon one's perspective) of the barrio began. Buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico, the City historic district (historic preservation zone) that contains both Barrio El Hoyo and Barrio Libre (listed on the National Register, October 18, 1978). The development standards are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines, and are applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design. Consequently, while not contributing to the district's integrity, they do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same elements. As a result, Barrio El Hoyo retains a high degree of integrity of design.

Setting

The physical environment within Barrio El Hoyo has seen relatively little change. The ground surface slopes down into the barrio on three sides, and the undulating topography within, remain unchanged. The street layout with its lack of a regular, right-angled grid, as well as the narrow streets themselves also remain unchanged. The area to the east of El Hoyo is a National Register District (Barrio Libre), and while the areas to the north, west and south have been impacted by modern development, none of this development is high-rise buildings which would visually impact El Hoyo. The vegetation also remains much the same, generally more well-watered than areas further from the river, with little evidence of the gravelling used to make the xeric landscaping that has become popular elsewhere in Tucson. Buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico. These standards are applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design, so the new buildings do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same elements. Overall, Barrio El Hoyo retains high degree of integrity of setting.

Materials

The buildings of Barrio El Hoyo retain much of their original materials, i.e. adobe walls covered in stucco, wooden double-hung sash windows, stone and concrete foundations. Roofing materials,

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 7 Page 8

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Description (continued)

however, do show considerable variation with composition, asphalt roll, corrugated and sheet metal roofs all being common. However, in most cases, these roofing materials were in use during the district's period of significance and do not detract from the integrity of the structures. Two particularly common impacts on the integrity of the houses of El Hoyo are the use of mechanical cooling systems visible on many of the roof tops and the appearance of iron security bars over the windows. Another significant impact on the integrity of materials is the relatively widespread use of metal chainlink and other non-traditional fencing around yards. Visually, these fences probably represent the most dramatic impact on the integrity of the district. In four cases (4.2%), as a result of high, non-traditional, fences obscuring them, houses are not considered to be contributing elements to the district. Because buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico, these buildings do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same materials. These standards have served to reduce the loss of traditional materials in the district despite the loss of historic fabric between 1950 and 1980. Overall, Barrio El Hoyo still retains considerable integrity of materials, although less so in this respect than others.

Workmanship

Barrio El Hoyo is primarily characterized by the Transitional Sonoran style, in which local builders blended traditional Sonoran traditions and with Non-Hispanic American elements. As such, the level of workmanship was originally that of the local Hispanic builders, and has largely remained so to the present. Because buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico and which are applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design, the new buildings do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same elements. Thus, while they represent loss of original historic fabric, they do not dramatically compromise the integrity of workmanship in the district. Of the older houses, 4 (4.2%) of the buildings in the district were judged to have become noncontributing elements due to inappropriate alterations which do not fall within the range of elements used during the period of significance. Nonetheless, Barrio El Hoyo still retains considerable integrity of workmanship.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 7 Page 9

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Description (continued)

Feeling

Barrio El Hoyo retains its feeling as a distinct and different neighborhood within Tucson. It combines the density of a typical urban settlement with a feeling of a more rural village through the combination of street width and layout, building spacing and setbacks, topographic variation, and vegetation. It also retains a feeling of its period of significance through the high proportion of stylistically similar historic buildings and the fact that buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico, based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines. As these have been applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design, the result has been the retention of a high degree of the historic and aesthetic feeling despite loss of some historic fabric.

Association

Barrio El Hoyo retains a strong association with the criteria of architecture, and community planning and development, for which it is nominated to the National Register. The historic buildings in Barrio El Hoyo are best characterized as continuations of the Sonoran tradition, with influences from Anglo-American architectural movements and revivals. This architecture of cultural convergence characterizes the survival of the Sonoran tradition in southern Arizona until the middle of twentieth century. Overall, 69.8% of the buildings in the district represent this architectural tradition from its period of significance. In regard to community planning and development, Barrio El Hoyo was essentially self-created and reflects the socioeconomic status of its builders. The barrio was only minimally planned, yet the builders of the barrio, relying for the most part on their own resources, created a unique environment which it still retains today. This survival has been facilitated by the inclusion, since the 1980s, of Barrio El Hoyo in Barrio Histórico, the City historic district (historic preservation zone) that contains both Barrio El Hoyo and Barrio Libre (listed on the National Register, October 18, 1978). As a result, the characteristic features of the district have not been compromised by modern development. Consequently, Barrio El Hoyo retains high degree of integrity of association.

Contributing and Noncontributing Buildings

The following list provides the National Register status of all resources within Barrio El Hoyo. Of the 96 buildings in the district, 68 (70.8 percent) are contributing. Noncontributing resources total 28 (29.2 percent); most of these are recently constructed dwellings. Numbered streets are listed consecutively, followed by named streets listed alphabetically. For each entry, the initial date of

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 7 Page 10

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Description (continued)

construction is also given. Dates are based primarily on data from the Pima County Assessor's property record files, as well as from conversations with long-time residents of the barrio.

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	<u>S. 11th Ave.</u>			
104	715	1908	contributing	
105	719	1911	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
	<u>W. 17th St.</u>			
100	449	1920	noncontributing	Obscured by high fence
079	502	1924	contributing	
101	505	1915	contributing	
080	508	1930	contributing	
083	510	1923	contributing	
084	514	1923	contributing	
087	516	1920	contributing	
088	518	1922	contributing	
090	520	1937	contributing	
091	522	1920	contributing	
094	534	1941	contributing	
095	536	1938	contributing	
098	538	1918	contributing	
	<u>W. 18th St.</u>			
109	508	1915	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 11

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
<u>W. Carrillo St.</u>				
081	407	1922	contributing	
082	415	1955	noncontributing	After period of significance
092	431	1992	noncontributing	After period of significance
093	435	1948	contributing	
085	503	1923	contributing	
089	521	1923	contributing	
086	525	1919	contributing	
096	537	1939	contributing	
097	545	1959	noncontributing	After period of significance
<u>S. Elias Ave.</u>				
055	412	1986	noncontributing	After period of significance
056	416	1922	contributing	
041	423	1953	noncontributing	After period of significance
042	427	1928	contributing	
045	431	1991	noncontributing	After period of significance
062	432	1925	contributing	
063	434	1920	contributing	
058	436	1925	contributing	
066	438	1924	contributing	
047	441	1982	noncontributing	After period of significance
048	445	1950	contributing	
000	446	1927	contributing	
051	449	1984	noncontributing	After period of significance
039	521	1930	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 12

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
<u>S. El Paso Ave.</u>				
025	400	1927	contributing	
004	403	1924	contributing	
009	421	1930	noncontributing	Moved & obscured by a high wall
005	437	1925	contributing	
026	442	1927	contributing	
<u>S. Osborne Ave.</u>				
099	704	1915	contributing	
102	706	1991	noncontributing	After period of significance
103	708	1915	contributing	
106	730	1919	contributing	
107	732	1936	contributing	
108	734	1930	contributing	
<u>S. Otero Ave.</u>				
073	426	1936	contributing	
061	431	1949	contributing	
064	435	1949	contributing	
074	438	1938	contributing	
065	439	1953	noncontributing	After period of significance
067	445	1946	contributing	
075	452	1940	contributing	
076	456	1997	noncontributing	After period of significance
077	460	1951	noncontributing	After period of significance
054	505	1919	contributing	
057	511	1995	noncontributing	After period of significance
060	515	2000	noncontributing	After period of significance
069	529	1915	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 7 Page 13

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Description (continued)

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
<u>W. Rosales St.</u>				
027	409	1927	contributing	
024	410	1925	contributing	
028	411	1925	contributing	
023	412	1927	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
022	414	2001	noncontributing	After period of significance
029	427	1940	contributing	
021	428	1946	contributing	
030	429	1925	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
031	431	1935	noncontributing	Most of street façade dates after period of significance
032	433	1925	contributing	
019	448	1927	contributing	
<u>S. Samaniego Ave.</u>				
036	420	1918	contributing	
037	428	1919	contributing	
043	550	1925	contributing	
044	552	1994	noncontributing	After period of significance
049	560	1991	noncontributing	After period of significance
050	570	1981	noncontributing	After period of significance

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 14

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	<u>W. Simpson St.</u>			
007	340	1920	contributing	
008	344	2000	noncontributing	After period of significance
010	350	1925	contributing	
001	357	1909	contributing	
034	400	1929	contributing	
018	402	1940	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
035	408	1936	contributing	
017	410	1936	contributing	
016	416	1936	noncontributing	Recent addition and high wall obscures dwelling
014	426	1931	contributing	
015	430	1937	contributing	
013	438	1936	contributing	
012	440	1931	contributing	
052	445	1930	contributing	
053	455	1918	noncontributing	Obscured by high fence
011	546	1931	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 8 Page 15

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Statement of Significance

Barrio El Hoyo is a historic district significant under National Register Criteria A and C in the areas of community planning and development, and architecture. The district's period of significance is from 1908, when the first dwellings were constructed within the district, to 1950, when the neighborhood was almost entirely built up and had fully acquired its historic character as one of Tucson's suburban barrios. Barrio El Hoyo is significant as an example of community planning and development by a marginalized group that protected them against some of the most overt manifestations of subordination and discrimination. Barrio El Hoyo is a living barrio that has maintained its connections with the traditions that created it. This is evident in the closely-knit family connections that still exist, and in community traditions that have created a strong sense of neighborhood in the area. Barrio El Hoyo is significant for its architecture because as all of its contributing dwellings are examples of the continuation of the Sonoran architectural tradition in the early twentieth century, with influences from Anglo-American architectural movements and revivals, that is sometimes called "Transitional." Barrio El Hoyo, together with the National Register-listed Barrio Libre Historic District (listed October 18, 1978), comprise the locally designated Barrio Histórico Historic District. The City of Tucson has viewed Barrio El Hoyo as having the same architectural and historical importance as the National Register-listed Barrio Libre. The current nomination is to provide comparable State and National Register recognition of the district's significance.

Historic Context

Tucson was founded by Spanish-speaking pioneers in 1775. It remained a frontier garrison of Sonora until the Gadsden Purchase transferred it to the United States in 1854. Even thereafter, Mexicans composed the numerical majority in Tucson throughout the nineteenth century. *Tucsonenses* continued to exercise considerable economic and political power into the 1890s. However, the coming of the Southern Pacific Railroad in 1880 began the transformation of Tucson from a bicultural, bilingual town into one in which Hispanics and Anglo-Americans were increasingly divided. Tucson changed from the major settlement on a relatively little-used transcontinental wagon freight route connecting the East Coast with California (ocean steamers and the transcontinental railroad through Utah and Nevada carried the vast bulk of the freight west), to a major settlement on one of the two transcontinental railroads connecting the East with the West Coast. Arizona underwent a major boom in the 1880s with the cattle and sheep industries as well as mining taking full advantage of the railroads to export their products to markets east and west. The railroad became the major employer of Hispanics in Tucson, although almost entirely in low-paid, unskilled jobs.

By 1897, Anglos controlled the central business district, owning approximately 80% of the business in Tucson and living in 80-90% of the houses in that area. Most Hispanics lived south of downtown,

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 8 Page 16

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Statement of Significance (continued)

but the area to the east of downtown began to develop Anglo settlement. Between 1880 and 1900 Tucson's population grew only slightly from 7,007 to 7,531, but over the next 20 years it increased almost three-fold from to 20,337. In the next 20 years the population almost doubled again to 36,818 in 1940. At the same time, the number of Hispanics declined slightly from 4,469 in 1880 to 4,122 in 1900, but then almost doubled by 1920 to 7,489 and by almost half again to 11,000 in 1940 (Sheridan 1986:3). While the Anglo population spread out to the east and north, decreasing the overall population density of the city, Hispanics became increasingly concentrated in the area south of downtown., although there was some expansion to the west of the river as well (Gourley 1992, Sheridan 1986). Throughout the same period the proportion of the Mexican workforce employed in unskilled labor remained high, though it declined from almost 60% in 1880 to just above 40% in 1900, remaining at that level through 1940. Overall, the percentage of Mexicans employed in "blue collar" jobs fluctuated between 70% and 80% between 1880 and 1940 (Sheridan 1986:264-266).

Barrio El Hoyo was formed from three blocks—221, 243, and 245—on the western margin of the original 1874 Tucson Townsite, southwest of downtown. Until the late nineteenth century, this was cultivated land on the floodplain of the Santa Cruz River, beyond the limits of urban settlement. In 1870, Leopoldo Carrillo owned most of the property now occupied by Barrio El Hoyo and by the early 1870s, the area had been developed as Carrillo's Gardens on Block 243. This was a popular venue with an artificial lake and ponds, caged animals and birds, and a park for concerts, dances, and general recreation. Adjacent, to the north on Block 221, was a ball field which saw, among others, baseball games, University of Arizona football games, and the first Tucson Air Show in 1911. In 1903, Emanuel Drachman purchased the Gardens after Carrillo's death, and, in partnership with Alex Rossi, opened an amusement park under the name Elysian Grove. A half-mile speed track was built and bicycle races were a popular attraction. In 1906 Nat Hawke purchased a half interest in the park, and together, Drachman and Hawke built a new pavilion that could seat 500 – 600 people in 1907. Baths and a swimming pool were other popular features. Elysian Grove finally closed in 1915 due to financial problems and the land was sold and subdivided.

After the demise of Elysian Grove in 1915, Block 243, between 17th Street and Mission Road (now W. Simpson Street), was platted as the Elysian Grove subdivision; the plat was not filed until 1921, but lots were being sold and dwellings constructed from 1915 on. Block 245, between 17th and 18th Streets, was divided by Osborne Street and platted by 1905, but remained part of the City of Tucson plat; building here began by 1908. Most of Block 221, north of Mission Road (now W. Simpson Street), was platted as the Southwestern addition in 1920; in 1926, a portion of this addition was replatted as the Ball Park subdivision. As a result of this history, Barrio El Hoyo was settled first at the south end in 1908 in Block 245 and generally later as one moves north and west. For example, as one heads west along W. Simpson Street the buildings get progressively younger (though still

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 8 Page 17

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Statement of Significance (continued)

within the barrio's period of significance), and most of the houses on W. Ottero Street date from the 1930s and 1940s. That said, on most streets, there was not construction in sequence along the street from one end to the other, but houses built at different times throughout the block, later houses filling in between earlier houses.

One of the neighborhood landmarks is the former Elysian Grove Market (400 W. Simpson St.), which was built in 1929 by Jose Q. Trujillo at the corner of W. Simpson Street and S. Samaniego Avenue. As the only local grocery store in Barrio El Hoyo, this was a pivotal building in the barrio, and became a neighborhood meeting place. Although the store closed in the 1960s, and was converted into three apartments, the conversion retained the original exterior appearance and visually it is still a focal point of the neighborhood.

Another major neighborhood landmark is the chapel of San Cosme (546 W. Simpson St.), a special ministry of the Diocese of Tucson. The chapel was built in 1931 to serve Barrio El Hoyo, and, until the 1960s, it held regular Sunday Mass as well as doctrine classes after school. Thereafter, the chapel was used for catechism classes and the occasional memorial Mass to honor deceased residents of the barrio. Beginning in 2003, efforts were made to re-invigorate the chapel. The chapel is currently in regular use, with a weekly Cursillo, monthly Mass and a Vigil of Sunday Mass held on the first Saturday of the month. Other periodic events, for example the Saint Augustine Cathedral Posadas procession, also use the chapel.

The other major landmark for the residents of El Hoyo is Carrillo Elementary School. Carrillo Elementary School was built in 1930. The school is just outside the Barrio El Hoyo Historic District, on the east side of S. Samaniego Avenue, and it is in the adjacent National Register-listed Barrio Libre Historic District, but it has been a mainstay of the El Hoyo community. The school was designed by M. H. Starkweather and built by R. H. Martin for \$72,114.20. Originally it consisted of a twelve-classroom building. The school was built on part of the former Elysian Grove amusement park and when the School Board purchased the property they inherited the swimming pool and decided in 1930 to continue to operate it, in conjunction with the City of Tucson. In 1934, the School Board decided to abandon its share of running the pool. In a 1970s survey of children of the barrio, the pool featured prominently in their perception of the area, along with the school, of course (Bell 1972). In 1939 the school was enlarged with four additional classrooms, a workshop and a nurses office, and remodeled again in 1957 and 1966. In 1937, Marguerite Collier, a teacher at the school originated the Las Posadas nativity procession. Each Christmas, the students of Carrillo School form a procession through the streets of El Hoyo, re-enacting the pilgrimage of Mary and Joseph seeking shelter on the eve of Jesus' birth (Fimbres 2004). The rite was once an essential component of Hispanic Catholicism that has been forgotten or misinterpreted elsewhere, but, the tradition is alive in Barrio El Hoyo.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 8 Page 18

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Statement of Significance (continued)

After World War II, in the late 1940s and early 1950s, there was some minor infilling of the few remaining vacant lots, but for the most part the 1950s mark the beginning of outmigration from El Hoyo. By 1960 Tucson's population had boomed to 221,200, a six-fold increase over 1940, while its area had increase ten-fold! The post-war boom brought massive Anglo in-migration. The direction of growth was primarily northeast of the Southern Pacific Railroad. North and east of the railroad were new, mainly Anglo suburbs, to the south were new industrial areas and a major air base. This left the old core of the city, including Barrio El Hoyo, on the wrong side of the tracks from the most dynamic and economically prosperous part of the city. Downtown Tucson and the barrio immediately to the south, including El Hoyo, were mutually dependant for their economic survival, isolated from the "new" Tucson on the other side of the railroad tracks. Both areas stagnated in the 1950s and the construction of the Tucson Community Center Complex in the late 1960s isolated each from the other and severe economic decline set in to both districts. The new suburbs presented economic opportunities and housing for the younger residents of El Hoyo, resulting in out-migration to new Hispanic suburbs to the west and south, leaving the older and poorer residents behind. Only when proposed freeway construction in the early 1970s threatened to completely obliterate the barrio was attention refocused on the area and steps taken to preserve and reinvigorate the area through the creation of the City of Tucson's Barrio Hist3rico local historic district.

Community Planning and Development

Prior to 1880, Tucson was developing as a bicultural, bilingual community, but after the railroad arrived in that year Hispanic and Anglo-American relations deteriorated (Luckingham 1982). By the turn of the century, Tucson was divided into ethnic enclaves: mostly Hispanic on the south and west, mostly Anglo-American on the north and east (except for Barrio Anita). Hispanics still constituted a majority of the city's population—54.7 percent in 1900—but as more Anglos arrived the percentage steadily dropped (to 29.9 percent by 1940) (Sheridan 1986). Anglo-Americans had acquired most of the agricultural fields—more land for development—and were in the process of acquiring most of the grazing land. As the traditional agropastoral economy disappeared, most Tucsonenses—with the exception of the Hispanic upper and middle classes—adapted to an Anglo-American commercial economy by working as an ever-increasing proportion of a low-paid labor force. As marginalization in the economic sphere was accompanied by similar marginalization in the social and political, "neighborhoods like Barrio Anita and El Hoyo offered Tucsonenses both identity and security, protecting them against some of the most overt manifestations of subordination or discrimination" (Sheridan 1986:252).

El Hoyo is only one of Tucson's suburban barrios that was created during the early twentieth century. This neighborhood may have been the site of an earlier settlement of Mansos (peaceful Apache

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 8 Page 19

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Statement of Significance (continued)

allies) in the early nineteenth century, but there is no evidence of a definable Hispanic barrio before 1903 (Rieder 1998). As Tucson grew during the early twentieth century, Anglo-Americans generally settled in subdivisions east of the railroad, while Hispanic barrios were generally created to the south and in the west across the Santa Cruz. Most of these had been established by the 1940s (Sheridan 1986) (Map 5).

By the early 1930s, Barrio El Hoyo had developed a significant population, resulting in the construction at this time of the three major landmarks of the neighborhood: Elysian Grove Market (1929), Carrillo Elementary School (1930) and Chapel San Cosme (1931). Each provided a focal point for the residents to come together at different times and for different purposes to reinforce the inhabitants sense of community in El Hoyo.

Data from the city directory for 1930 provide a glimpse of the socioeconomic status of the barrio's inhabitants at the midpoint of its period of significance, just before the Depression. Of the 89 households listed for Barrio El Hoyo, 75 individuals' occupations are noted; of these 70 were men and 5 were women. Well over a third of the men (37.1 percent) were listed as only as "laborer," which meant they counted as unskilled labor at the lowest wages. As Sheridan (1986) points out, many of these workers had multiple skills, but this was the only work they could find. For the other residents whose specific jobs were listed, 21.4 percent were involved in the building trade, as masons, plasterers, and carpenters. Many of these would have been involved in the construction of the barrio's dwellings. Ten percent of the men were employed by the Southern Pacific, which during the early twentieth century was the largest single employer of Hispanics in Tucson, but mostly at the low end of the wage scale because the railroad unions that controlled access to the skilled, well-paid jobs blocked Hispanics from these positions until the 1960s (Sheridan 1986).

Of the remaining men, a few (5.7 percent) had jobs as craftsmen, from silversmith to cabinetmaker, and one had attained a job as mechanic at the Apache Buick agency. Most of the others were drivers or stockers for the city's warehouses along the railroad, such as Steinfeld's (Tucson's largest department store) or the Tucson Ice Company, or in building products industries like the Tucson Pressed Brick Company. Only one had a position as a clerk, at a local wholesalers. The only individual in the barrio who owned his own business was José Miranda, who operated the Elysian Grove Market. Of the women whose occupations were listed, three worked at the Tucson Steam Laundry, two were clerks, and one was a waitress. All told, only 4 percent of the barrio's workers had "white collar" jobs, as they were defined at that time.

This profile provides a picture of hard work with a relatively slim margin of economic security and within the following decade even this was imperiled. The Depression of the 1930s was called in Spanish *la crisis*, and with good reason: on many jobs, Hispanics were the first workers to be laid

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 8 Page 20

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Statement of Significance (continued)

off and "the slight [economic] gains of the first two decades of the century were reversed by poverty and unemployment during the third" (Sheridan 1986:235). Yet Tucson's Hispanic community rallied and relief efforts were organized, among them the *Comité Pro-Infantil* formed by the *Alianza Hispano-Americana* and other groups; the committee provided food for children at Carrillo School and other barrio schools (Sheridan 1986). Federal relief efforts, primarily jobs with the Civilian Conservation Corps, helped also. People simply got by as well as they could. The 1940s brought a slight recovery before the war, and the many barrio residents who served in the U.S. forces during the war returned to share—albeit partially—in the postwar boom.

After 1950, Barrio El Hoyo suffered a steady decline. Younger generations moved out to seek their fortunes elsewhere, parents died, and dwellings were abandoned. Many of the new houses in the barrio are built upon the sites of old adobe dwellings that collapsed or were demolished. Yet a core of Hispanic families have remained here, so that the neighborhood can still be considered a barrio as defined by Officer (1964) as a closely knit, traditionally Hispanic neighborhood. Bell (1972) and Gourley (1992:133-153), as well as various newspaper articles, provide excerpts from interviews with former residents of El Hoyo that emphasize the important sense of the community and neighborhood that existed in El Hoyo. In part this may have been a result of the high proportion of property ownership among El Hoyo residents, where, according to Bell (1967:52), the majority of residents owned their homes, which is atypical in the Tucson barrios in general and especially of Barrio Libre to the east where almost all were renters (Gourley 1992:121). Bell states that "The majority of people living . . . in El Hoyo seem to know and be friendly with everyone in that area. A strong sense of neighborhood exists only in that area. Most people in El Hoyo also have relatives in the immediate area, and they are described as 'close'" (Bell 1967:53).

Other than the fact that this neighborhood was platted in blocks and lots as part of the original Tucson townsite and subsequent subdivisions thereof, Barrio El Hoyo was essentially self-created and reflects the socioeconomic status of its builders. The plats filed with the City show precise lot measurements, but on the ground these are only approximate, as can be seen comparing the 1921 plat of Elysian Grove (Map 4) with the actual district map. Boundaries were agreed upon by mutual consent, rather than paying for verification by civil surveyors. As a result, many dwellings impinge on lot lines, as well as on the City right-of-way. As noted in Section 7, the conventions (and, eventually, codes) that governed Anglo-American neighborhoods within the city did not apply. On several streets, as can be seen in the district map, even the house numbers are not sequential. Not only are there no sidewalks, but several streets still lack street signs or stop signs. And, whereas most of the other parts of Tucson were included in the Sanborn fire insurance maps that documented the city's buildings from 1883 to 1961, most of Barrio El Hoyo was never included on the maps. Essentially, with the exception of the establishment of Carrillo Elementary School in 1930, which was funded by a bond issue approved by the Tucson electorate, the Anglo-American establishment

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 8 Page 21

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Statement of Significance (continued)

ignored this working-class Hispanic neighborhood. As such, it is an example of community planning and development by a marginalized group that protected them against some of the most overt manifestations of subordination and discrimination. Barrio El Hoyo is a living barrio that has maintained its connections with the traditions that created it. This is evident in the closely-knit family connections that still exist, and in community traditions like Las Posadas, a highly significant spiritual rite that unites the neighborhood.

Architecture

Sonoran Tradition

The barrio's architecture must be understood within the context of the Sonoran building tradition. Tucson was founded as a Spanish presidio in 1776; in the community's early years, the Hispanic settlers survived "largely because they understood the limitations imposed by a harsh environment, and learned to live within them" (Sheridan 1986:14). Their architecture during the Spanish Viceregal and Mexican Republic periods was characterized by adaptation and expediency and was composed, quite literally, of earth and timber (Bunting 1976). Bearing walls were built of adobe brick and mud mortar with (or, often, without) foundations of stone rubble masonry; brick dimensions varied, but tended to be larger than those of adobe bricks used today. Walls were typically of bonded two-wythe construction, with a one-to-ten ratio of thickness to height. Dwellings were limited to a single story, but with high walls; thus a typical 15-foot wall would have a thickness of 18 inches or more (Sobin 1975). Openings, generally limited to doorways, were spanned with pairs of roughly hewn mesquite lintels. On the exterior, walls were plastered with mud or (commonly) left exposed.

Roofs were built of logs (typically cottonwood) with diameters of 9 to 12 inches, stripped of bark and laid on 20- to 40-inch centers and covered with a decking of saguaro ribs, followed by multiple layers of brush or other organic material and earth, ranging in depth from 8 to 24 inches. The roof surface was graded to channel rainwater to drains that pierced the parapet. In this building tradition, the essential unit, or module was a rectangular room 12 to 15 feet wide, depending on the span of the roof beams, and not much longer. At the most basic level, the room was a self-sufficient multipurpose living space (Wilson and Kammer 1989). The traditional floor plan was linear, formed incrementally of these modular units, each with its own exterior door. The households of presidial Tucson lived in a contiguous series of such rooms built along the interior of the presidio walls (Gallegos 1935).

As Tucson, the largest settlement in the U.S. Territory of Arizona, grew from the 1860s through the 1880s, this frontier model was expanded into the traditional Hispanic urban model: blocks formed of

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 8 Page 22

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Statement of Significance (continued)

contiguous rooms built up to the street. The model was oriented inward to the family space of the courtyard, and street facades were accented only by the rhythm of apertures along the uniform continuous adobe walls. Functions other than domestic, such as stores or offices, were distinguished only by the occasional sign. In Tucson, the largest surviving concentration of these Sonoran row houses is in the Barrio Libre Historic District (Giebner and Sobin 1973) which was listed on the National Register on October 18, 1978. As the city became a distribution node within the U.S. market economy, particularly after 1880 when the Southern Pacific Railroad arrived, manufactured building products and materials became increasingly available. For walls, adobe brick remained the structural material; when fired common brick became available, it was used primarily to cap adobe brick parapets. Cylindrical metal roof drains replaced wood troughs. Glazing and ready-made window sash and paneled wood doors became available, as well as milled lumber for door and window frames. Yet the basic form remained and initially, at least, Anglo-American influence did not alter the essential Hispanic nature of Tucson's architecture.

However, as Anglo-American building techniques and Anglo-American concepts of architectural space were gradually introduced, basic changes occurred. The first was manifested in the introduction of wood frame technology: earth roofs were covered with (and, in new construction, eventually displaced by) lightweight gabled or hipped roofs framed of milled lumber, and clad in wood shingles, terne plate, or corrugated iron (Nequette and Jeffery 2002). The second and more fundamental introduction was the Anglo-American idea of the house subdivided into rooms as the basic building unit, as contrasted with the traditional Hispanic idea of the self-sufficient room as the basic unit; furthermore, Anglos introduced the concept of the residential suburb with its uniform lots and setbacks (Veregge 1993). Hispanic builders selectively borrowed these ideas and concepts, just as they borrowed new materials and building techniques, while at the same time retaining key elements of their regional tradition. This architecture of cultural convergence would characterize the survival of the Sonoran tradition in southern Arizona until the middle of twentieth century. This is why the historic buildings in Barrio El Hoyo (all built as dwellings except for the former Elysian Grove Market and San Cosme) are best characterized as continuations of the Sonoran tradition, with influences from Anglo-American architectural movements and revivals.

Nequette and Jeffery (2002) refer to this as "Transitional" and define Early and Late periods, although in El Hoyo houses with elements of both "periods" appear to have been built throughout the district's period of significance (1908 – 1950). The characteristics of the Early Transitional are: building placement at the front property line with adjacent units; walls usually lime-stuccoed; expansion of the simple one- or two-room plan into either a *zaguán* or shotgun type; brick coping at the parapet for buildings with flat roofs; pyramidal wooden gabled roof with metal sheathing; stone veneer added to the base to stop erosion; doors set deep but windows and shutters at the exterior face of the wall; simple wooden trim of milled limber at windows and doors, use of pediments; and glass

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 8 Page 23

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Statement of Significance (continued)

added to window openings. Many buildings in El Hoyo reflect this style such as the Elysian Grove Market, and the western half of W. 17th Street (particularly #s 518, 522, 534, 536, 538). Other examples can be found on W. 18th St. (# 508), W. Carrillo Street (# 407), S. El Paso Avenue (#s 400, 437, 442), W. Elias Street (#s 436, 521), S. Osborne Avenue (# 708), S. Samaniego Avenue (#s 428, 550), W. Simpson Street (# 438).

The characteristics of Late Transitional are: structure set back from the property line to accommodate the front porch and create zones of separation between public and private; adobe walls covered with lime stucco; highly articulated or complex roof forms with deep overhangs for shade; fired-brick features such as coping and chimneys with corbelled tops; dimensioned limber used for panel doors, wooden floors, and porches; sash windows either double hung or divided light, often with leaded glass; Victorian wooden trim on both the exterior and the interior; and landscape material of imported species. Many of the buildings in El Hoyo also reflect these elements, such as the eastern half of W. 17th Street, for example (particularly #s 502, 508, 510, 514, 520). Other examples can be found on W. Carrillo Street (#s 435, 503, 521, 525, 537), S. El Paso Avenue (# 403), W. Elias Street (#s 416, 427, 445, 446), S. Osborne Avenue (#s 732, 734), W. Otero Street (#s 426, 431, 435, 438, 445, 505), W. Rosales St. (#s 409, 410, 411, 427, 428, 433), W. Simpson Street (#s 340, 350, 357, 408, 410, 430, 440, 445).

A unique aspect of El Hoyo's architecture, as noted in Section 7, is its builder's response to the topography. Many of the buildings were constructed with concrete stem walls, often as much as 4 feet above grade, to compensate for the irregular terrain within a given lot. Forms were built of scrap lumber, then filled with large cobbles up to the full width of the form; the interstices were then filled with home-made cement. Once cured, the forms were removed and the dwelling's adobe-brick walls were constructed. Surprisingly, most of these walls have held up well over the years, considering the periodic flooding to which the neighborhood was formerly subject. This is just another example of expedient but effective vernacular construction methods. Similarly, framed roofs often have only 2 by 4 rafters on 24- or 30-inch centers, but they too have held up.

Mission Style

The one contributing element of the district that is not in the Sonoran tradition is the chapel of San Cosme (546 W. Simpson St.). The chapel was built in 1931 to serve Barrio El Hoyo. Architecturally, the chapel was built in simple Mission style, with a low pitch, front-gabled roof, projecting eaves with exposed rafter ends, smooth stucco walls painted white, arched window openings, simple roofed porch (*toldo*) with red-clay tiles, and a mission-like bell tower (*espadaña*). In many ways, the chapel is reminiscent of the earliest mission churches, which lacked the architectural elaboration found on later ones. Rather than the classic clay-tile roof, the building has

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 8 **Page** 24

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Statement of Significance (continued)

an asphalt shingle roof edged with red clay-tile at the front gable eaves to give the impression of a completely tiled roof from the façade facing the street. The building is typical of other chapels and small churches built in southern Arizona at this time period by the Diocese of Tucson.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 9 Page 25

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Plats, Pima County Recorder's Office, Old Pima County Courthouse, Tucson.

Property Record Files, Pima County Assessor's Office, Old Pima County Courthouse, Tucson.

Sanborn Fire Insurance Map of Tucson: 1909, revised 1914; 1919, revised 1922, 1930, 1942, 1947. On file, Arizona Historical Society, Tucson.

Tucson City Directory, 1930. On file, Arizona Historical Society, Tucson.

Tucson Historical Society, Tucson, Barrios and Districts, El Hoyo file.

Secondary Sources

Arizona Daily Star

1977 Displacement feared by residents of now-'desirable' areas. April 10, 1977:I1

1988 'Cool at the Grove.' March 9, 1988.

1988 Elysian Grove is a tranquil enclave of adobe. November 13, 1988.

2003 Old Chapel might get new life. May 2, 2003:B3

2007 Hispanic rail blazer. March 19, 2007:E1.

2007 Long-Time Barrio Store is Transformed. May 10, 2007:B2.

Bunting, Bainbridge

1976 *Early Architecture in New Mexico*. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.

Cooper, James F.

1967 *The First Hundred Years: The History of Tucson School District 1, Tucson, Arizona, 1867 - 1967*.

Fimbres, Gabrielle

2004 In the Footsteps of Little Angeles. *Tucson Citizen* December 4, 2007.
www.tucsoncitizen.com/print/living/120404d1_lasposadas accessed 6/7/2007.

United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet

Section Number 9 Page 26

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Bibliography (continued)

Gallegos, Hilario

1935 Reminiscences of an Arizona Pioneer. *Arizona Historical Review* 6(1):75-81.

Giebner, Robert C., and Harris J. Sobin

1973 Tucson's Barrio Histórico. *Arizona Architect* 16:8-13.

Gourley, John

1992 The Pueblo and the Public: Urban Realities in Counterpoint. Doctoral dissertation, Department of Geography and Regional Development, University of Arizona, Tucson.

Husband, Eliza

1988 *Tucson's Suburban Adobe Row Houses*. Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission, Tucson.

Kimmelman, Alex

2004 Tucson's Oldest Historic, Non-Historic Historic District, Perhaps the Oldest in the U.S. *Tucson History Forum* 1(3):1, 8-10.

Luckingham, Bradford

1982 *The Urban Southwest*. University of Texas Press, El Paso.

McAlester, Virginia, and Lee McAlester

1997 *A Field Guide to American Houses*. Alfred A. Knopf, New York.

Manger, William F.

2000 The "Idealized" Mexican American Housescape. *Material Culture* 32(1):1-36

Nequette, Anne M., and R. Brooks Jeffery

2002 *A Guide to Tucson Architecture*. University of Arizona Press, Tucson.

Officer, James E.

1964 *Sodalities and Systemic Linkage: The Joining Habits of Urban Mexican-Americans*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Arizona, Tucson. University Microfilms, Ann Arbor.

Rieder, Morgan

1998 *Historical and Architectural Survey of Barrio Anita, Tucson, Arizona*. Technical Report No. 98-26. Aztlan Archaeology, Tucson.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 9 **Page** 27

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Bibliography (continued)

Sheridan, Thomas E.

1986 *Los Tucsonenses: The Mexican Community in Tucson, 1854-1941*. University of Arizona Press, Tucson.

Sobin, Harris J.

1975 From *Vigas to Rafters: Architectural Evolution in Florence, Arizona*. *Journal of Arizona History* 16:357-382.

Veregge, Nina

1993 Transformations of Spanish Urban Landscapes in the American Southwest, 1821-1900. *Journal of the Southwest* 35:371-459.

Wilson, Chris, and David Kammer

1989 *La Tierra Amarilla*. Museum of New Mexico Press, Santa Fe.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number 10 **Page** 28

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Geographical Data (continued)

Additional UTM References

	Zone	Easting	Northing		Zone	Easting	Northing
5	12	502246	3563946	6	12	502148	3564087

Verbal Boundary Description

Boundaries are indicated on the accompanying Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Map.

Boundary Justification

The boundary roughly correspond to the boundaries of the neighborhood known traditionally as Barrio El Hoyo. The northern, western and southern boundaries also generally conform to the boundaries of the western part of the locally designated Barrio Histórico. The eastern boundary is contiguous with the western boundary of Barrio Libre Historic District (listed on the National Register on October 18, 1978), which is also part of the locally designated Barrio Histórico. The Barrio El Hoyo District southern boundary is Barrio Santa Rosa. The western and northern boundaries are defined by land cleared by construction of I-10, modern industrial yards and by the Tucson Convention Center, which have destroyed the historic fabric in these areas. The northeastern corner of the district cuts south from W. Cushing Street to exclude a vacant property that has lost its historic fabric. While the southern boundary appears to jut out to include the block bounded by S. Osborne and S. 11th Avenues, in fact this block is the surviving remnant of the oldest part of Barrio El Hoyo which originally included two additional blocks to the west that were destroyed by construction of the modern Tucson Water facilities, water treatment plant, and are, therefore, excluded from the historic district.

**United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service**

**National Register of Historic Places
Continuation Sheet**

Section Number -- **Page** 29

**Barrio El Hoyo Historic District
Tucson, Pima County, AZ**

Maps

USGS Quadrangle: Tucson, Arizona 1996.
Map of Barrio El Hoyo Historic District.
Portion of 1905 City of Tucson map
Barrio Histórico Historic District.
Plat of the Elysian Grove Subdivision.
Tucson Barrios, 1940 (Sheridan 1986:Figure 14.2).

Photographs

Photograph data

1. Street address: (refer to list)
District: Barrio El Hoyo Historic District.
2. City, County, State: Tucson, Pima County, AZ
3. Photographer: Morgan Rieder
4. Date of photographs: June 2007
5. Location of existing negatives: State Historic Preservation Office.
6. View indicating direction of camera: (refer to list)
7. Photograph number: (refer to list)

Photograph list

1. Intersection of W. Simpson St. and S. Samaniego Ave.; view SW.
2. S. Elias Ave. at W. Carrillo St.; view NNE.
3. South side of W. 17th St.; view NE.
4. West side of Osborne Ave.; view SW.
5. S. El Paso Ave. at W. Cushing St.; view SSE.
6. W. Simpson St.; view ENE.