



2015

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

SUMMARY OF MINUTES

Thursday, June 25, 2015,
4th Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call:

Meeting called to session at 1:01 PM

Commissioners: Terry Majewski (Chair), Arthur Stables, Sharon Chadwick, Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson

Staff: Michael Taku, Alexandra Hines (PDSD), Jonathan Mabry (CHPO), Elaine Becherer (City Manager's Office)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 5-28-15

Motion by Commissioner Erickson to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 5-28-15. Motion seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

a. HPZ-15-17 - Bernal Properties LLC - Detached Steel Carport - 517 South Main Avenue (Barrio Historico)

Staff Taku provided background and read the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) legal action report into the record with a recommendation for metal posts not wood as shown on the plans and to

Minutes: 6/25/15 Minutes Approved: 7/8/15

deny the project for inaccurate plans and lack of landscaping and screen per UDC Section 5.8.9.N.

Chair Majewski pointed out that the commissioners did not receive plans for the case. Staff informed that the case was initially scheduled as a minor review but BHHZAB preferred a detail review and applicant had not complied with requested revised plans.

The applicant assured the Subcommittee that posts would be metal and not wood. Commissioner Stables noted that landscape and screening is not addressed in the plans as requested by the BHHAB. Chair Majewski said BHHZAB may file a code violation if landscaping is not included, for this reason, the motion can include the condition and request an on-site review.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to recommend approval of proposal as presented with the following conditions: (1) Revise site plan to show all 12 carport posts to be metal not wood; (2) Submit a landscaping & screening plan per code requirements; (3) Contact staff to arrange for an on-site review prior to any landscaping & screening work. Seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

b. HPZ-15-19 - Barrio Holding LLC - Windows - 721 North 4th Avenue [Zoning Violation] (West University)

The applicant, Eric Oxman, provided background to the case explaining that the zoning violation on the new windows.

Staff Taku provided background of minor review with onsite approval conditions. Those conditions were not respected by the owner and became a zoning violation. Staff read the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) legal action report into the record with a motion to recommend approval with a condition to install mullions on metal windows. Commissioner Stables who represented the Subcommittee with a WUHZAB member at a minor review updated Commissioners on the project and its outcome.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to recommend approval of the proposal as presented and to adhere to WUHZAB condition. Seconded by Commissioner Erickson.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

c. HPZ-15-40 - Pima County Urban Loop and Bank Protection Project - Archaeological Data Recovery - Pantano Wash between Tanque Road and Fort Lowell Park - 5802 East Fort Lowell Road (Fort Lowell)

Applicant not present. Case will be set for a future date.

- d. **HPZ-15-41** - Spicker - Replacement Windows on Duplex Structure - 1018-1020 N.1st Avenue (West University) [Zoning Violation]

Applicant not present. Case will be set for a future date.

- e. **HPZ-15-42** - Kouvel - Façade Improvements: Doors/Windows - 220 North Meyer Avenue (El Presidio)

Staff Taku provided background and read the El Presidio Historic Zone Advisory Board (EPHZAB) legal action report into the record. EPHZAB recommended wood sliding windows in lieu of proposed aluminum window. This review is limited to the proposal on 220 North Meyer Avenue only. The applicant will return to the Plans Review Subcommittee for review on any proposed work on 77 West Washington Street.

The applicant presented the scope of the project that included restoring brick chimney; wood store front panels; doors and windows to be remade in the original all wood style.

Kacey Carleton stated for the record that she will no longer be the architect for the project.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to recommend approval of proposal as presented for 220 North Meyer Avenue and to include the condition of EPHZAB. Seconded by Commissioner Erickson.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

- f. **HPZ-15-45** - Lex - Metal Framed Window Awning Additions - **620** South 3rd Avenue (Armory Park)

(Correction Property Address is: 620, not 630 as on the Agenda.)

Staff Taku provided background and read the Amory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) legal action report into the record with a motion to recommend approval of project as presented.

The applicant, Michael Lex, presented the proposal for three metal framed awnings along the south windows which are taken down for the winter. Mr. Lex explained that the material is canvas with aluminum square channel.

Commissioner Erickson asked about the impact on the building. Mr. Lex said the buildings would have holes for the permanent aluminum clips.

Motion by Commissioner Erickson to recommend approval of proposal as presented with qualification that the material and connection are provided on the submitted plans. Seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

- g. HPZ-15-48** - Mougeot - Replacement Windows - 410 East Speedway Boulevard (West University) [Zoning Violation]

Staff Taku provided background and read the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) legal action report into the record with a motion to deny replacement windows with metal.

The property is a contributing property. The applicant, Christopher Mougeot, noted that some windows were aluminum when house was purchased so replacement was to match existing windows.

Staff Taku said that WUHZAB member volunteered to look into wood window suppliers and quotes. To adequately abate the violation, when the windows replacement has been executed, then, staff will conduct minor review to ensure appropriate materials were installed.

Motion by Commissioner Erickson to recommend approval of proposal as presented with qualification that applicant work with staff on a reasonable time schedule for the replacement aluminum for wood windows. Seconded by Commissioner Stables.

Motion passed. Vote 5-0.

4. Rio Nuevo District Review Cases

- a. RND-15-08** - Downtown Community Theaters and Historic Cultural Landscape - Renovation of the TCC Leo Rich Theater, Music Hall, Theater, and Eckbo Landscape - Presentation of recommendations made by the Historic Landscapes Subcommittee for appropriate replacement plant materials (trees and shrubs) - 260 South Church Avenue.

Commissioner Sauer recused from participation the case due to his involvement in the project and likely potential conflict of interest.

Commissioner Erickson presented the case and provided a summary of the T-PCHC Historic Landscaping Subcommittee deliberation. Chair Majewski recognized the serious attempt to review and consider the landscape and Commission Erickson and the T-PCHC Historic Landscape Subcommittee has worked really hard.

Motion by Commissioner Stables to recommend approval of proposal as presented by the T-PCHC Historic Landscape Subcommittee. Seconded by Commissioner Chadwick.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0 (Commissioner Sauer recused and did not vote).

Elaine Becherer, from the City Manager's Office, noted that the Historic Landscape Subcommittee has truly vetted the proposal. Ms. Becherer displayed the snapshot of the TCC process to conduct work and review proposals. Ms. Becherer provided a summary of the presentation made by Staff Greg Jackson on May 28, 2015, like the focus on safety where there will be a refeathering of brick to meet the concrete level.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

a. Minor Reviews

Staff Taku updated Subcommittee on minor reviews conducted and acknowledged the volunteer efforts of Commissioners to assist in minor reviews. Commissioner Stables volunteered to join staff for a minor review on Friday, June 26th on 112 East 16th Street.

b. Appeals

Nothing at this time.

c. Zoning Violations - Update on Windows (West University)

Staff continues to assist on abatement of window violations in the Historic Districts.

Staff Mabry provided a summary of the meeting with City Council Member, West University attendees, and PDSD staff at Ward 6 on June 24th, 2015 regarding window violations in West University Historic District. The PDSD Director committed to mailing notification to the property owners and renters in each Historic Preservation Zone. Staff Mabry also noted that it would be beneficial to reach out to the Better Business Bureau and Tucson Association of Realtors. Staff Taku noted that West University is going to release a newsletter letting property owners know about the Historic Preservation Zone.

Commissioner Chadwick indicated that the building inspector does not abide by the recommendation and inquired if the Director's approval letter is attached to the plans. Chair Majewski said that the plans need to be precise and updated for review and inspection.

Staff Mabry said that a 'best practices' analysis of how other cities review windows in historic zones can be conducted and brought forward to the T-PCHC PRS. Chair Majewski requested that the analysis be scheduled for a study session when the Agenda is light. Staff Mabry noted that each zone would have the option to revise their guidelines on window treatment. Commissioner Stables noted that it is environmentally and socially sustainable to look into alternatives.

6. **Call to the Audience**

Mary Roth, Owner of property in West University Historic District and currently in violation for inappropriate windows, asked the commissioners to consider new materials for windows as technology has changed. Mrs. Roth also expressed willingness to go to meetings and garner neighborhood support.

7. **Future Items**

Staff Taku informed the Commissioners that pending infill porch violation on 600 East Speedway will be coming to the PRS for review.

8. **Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:41 p.m.