

**Barrio Histórico Historic Zone Advisory Board
Monday, October 19, 2015, 4 PM
Catalina Room, Second Floor
Joel Valdez Main Library, 101 N. Stone Ave.
Tucson, AZ 85701**

Legal Action Report

Agenda:

1. Roll call: A quorum was established including Jody Gibbs, Mary Lou Heuett, Armando Montano, Ken Bacher,, and William Balak Bob Vint and Ann Hazen was absent. Guests: Joel Leshefka, neighbor to 573 S. 9th, and Becky Pallack, Arizona Daily Star reporter.
2. Call to the audience: No comments
3. Minutes for 1-2-14, 4-16-15, 4-3-14, 5-28-14, 5-12-15, 8-14-14 meetings review and approval.

Motion 1: Ken Bacher moved and Mary Lou Heuett seconded motion to approve minutes. Vote was 5 yes – 0 no votes, to approve.

4. Formal Review of HPZ 15-77 Busbea/Stier Residence - New Single Family Dwelling - 573 S. 9th Avenue. Architect was not present so board went to next topic to give time for architect to arrive and discuss project.
5. Downtown Motor Hotel, 383 S. Stone. Discussion on the history of the review process by the City of Tucson. Board decided to delay further discussion until next meeting.

Motion 2: Move discussion to next Board meeting. Jody Gibbs moved and Mary Lou Heuett seconded motion. Vote was 5 yes – 0 no votes, to approve.

6. Formal Review of HPZ 15-77 Busbea/Stier Residence - New Single Family Dwelling - 573 S. 9th Avenue. Architect failed to show up so the Board did an review based on UDC Design Standards, Development Criteria, and the Barrio Historico Architectural Guidelines

The historic contributing property in the Development Zone is 570 S. 9th Avenue (across the street, west and slightly north of the property) as indicated by Pima County Assessor records and the Sanborne maps at the Arizona Historical Society. This property was apparently built of adobe in the 1920's, with a square building footprint approximately 28' x 28', and free standing within its property lines. The original roof type is unknown. There were no perimeter masonry privacy walls. Additions to the original

building appear to have been contiguous, enlarging the original square footprint to a rectangular footprint today.

The City of Tucson "Barrio Libre" map of historic contributing properties appears to be in error in identifying 590 S. 9th Avenue (also across the street and slightly south of the property). Both 570 S. 9th and 590 S.9th however are free standing buildings, within their property lines, and without 10 tall privacy walls on their property lines.

Motion 3. The Barrio Historico Advisory Board finds the proposed new project to be incompatible with the historic contributing property in its development zone in each of the following aspects, and for these reasons recommends the project be denied and the applicant revise plans and meet with the Advisory Board. Jody Gibbs moved and Mary Lou Heuett seconded motion. Vote was 5 yes – 0 no votes, to approve motion.

1) SETBACKS

The proposal does not maintain the setbacks of the historic contributing property in its Development Zone. UDC 5.8.6 C, 9-02.3.3. BHAG new construction.

2) SITE UTILIZATION

The proposal is not consistent with the site utilization of the historic contributing property in its Development Zone in setbacks, lot coverage, and open space. UDC 5.8.6 G, 9-02.3.7

3) BUILDING FORM

The proposal does not maintain the size, mass, or form of the historic contributing property in its Development Zone. UDC 5.8.6 J, 9-02.3.10

4) ENCLOSURES

The 10' tall perimeter privacy walls are not compatible with the architectural style and historic character of the historic contributing property in the Development Zone. BHAG new construction and site elements. UDC 5.8.6 L, 9-02.4.3

5) RHYTHM

Because of the 10' tall perimeter privacy walls the project does not reflect the proportions, patterns, and rhythms of the historic contributing property in the Development Zone. UDC 5.8.6 K, 9.02.3.11

6) BUILDING FORM

The proposed project does not maintain the size, mass, scale, or form of the historic contributing property in the Development Zone. UDC 5.8.6.J, 9.02.3.10

7) PROPORTIONS, DOORS AND WINDOWS, DETAILS, PROJECTIONS AND RECESSIONS

With the exception of the west elevation, the proposal's 10' tall privacy walls make the the project incompatible with the proportions, doors and windows, details, and projections and recession found in the historic contributing property. Proportions UDC 5.8.6 D, 9-02.3.4, Doors and Windows BHAG, UDC 9-02.3.1, 9-02.3.9, 9-02.7.3.C.5, 5.8.6 H,I. Details UDC 5.8.6.1, 9.02.3.9. Projections and Recessions 5.8.6 H

8) ROOF EQUIPMENT

The Roof equipment appears to be visible from the street and the neighbors. BHAG.

We would point out also that there is also no contributing property in either of the adjacent development zones (Main Avenue or Meyer Street) with 10' tall privacy walls on the perimeter lot lines largely surrounding an interior dwelling. If there were historic rowhouses, a building could be flanked by these, usually on either side. However this is not the case of this property. It a free standing lot without historic row houses around it. In the Development Zone the historic contributing property was a free standing dwelling, not a row house, nor was it ever surrounded by row houses.

7. Adjournment at 5:30pm