



Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the CLIMATE CHANGE COMMITTEE and to the general public that THE CLIMATE CHANGE COMMITTEE will hold the following meeting which will be open to the public:

2015  
**CLIMATE CHANGE COMMITTEE**  
October 21, 2015

**MINUTES**

The CLIMATE CHANGE COMMITTEE (CCC) held a meeting on Wednesday, October 21, 2015, 3:00 PM, at the Tucson Parks and Recreation Administration Office (900 S Randolph Way), Tucson, Arizona. The meeting took place in the Mesquite Conference Room.

---

**1. Call to Order/ Roll call**

Quorum was established and the meeting was called to order at 3:11 PM. In attendance were Gregg Garfin, Dick Reeves, Ben Champion, Phil Swaim, James Sell, Ron Proctor, Linda Ellinor, Nicole Sweeney, Lisette DeMars, John Schwarz, Joanie Sawyer, Barbara Warren.

**2. Action: September 16, 2015 Minutes**

Barbara made a motion to approve the September minutes. Phil seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

**3. General Announcements**

Nicole

- Tucson Clean and Beautiful Annual Meeting is tonight at the TMA. Peter Byck, Writer/producer/director of the film Carbonation, faculty at ASU, is the Speaker.
- Arizona Recycling Coalition annual conference in Phoenix on October 28. Speaker from California to speak about commercial recycling regulations.

Ben

- Oct. 5<sup>th</sup> UA signed a new national Climate Commitment. Involves commitment to reducing carbon emissions and adding climate resilience and adaptation component, commitment to working with the community.

**4. Status: CCC Membership update**

Staff provided an update that Dr. Linda Ellinor was appointed to the Committee by Mayor and Council at the October 8, 2015 M/C meeting. The committee reviewed the bio and resume of Madeline Kiser. Barbara made a motion to nominate her for the vacant primary Social Services seat. Phil seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

**5. Action: Co-chair elections for term beginning January 2016**

Ben Champion and Gregg Garfin had been previously nominated for the Co-Chair positions of the Climate Change Committee at the September meeting. Joanie made a motion to conduct the election by a roll call vote. Ben seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

A roll call vote of the eligible voting members present at the meeting was conducted for Ben Champion's appointment to one of the Co-Chair positions. The results were as follows:

Gregg Garfin – Yes	Dick Reeves – Yes	Ben Champion – Yes
Phil Swaim – Yes	James Sell – Yes	Ron Proctor – Yes
Nicole Sweeney – Yes	John Schwarz – Yes	Nicole Sweeney – Yes
Lisette DeMars – Yes	Joanie Sawyer – Yes	
Barbara Warren – Yes		

A roll call vote of the eligible voting members present at the meeting was conducted for Gregg Garfin's appointment to one of the Co-Chair positions. The results were as follows:

Gregg Garfin – Yes	Dick Reeves – Yes	Ben Champion – Yes
Phil Swaim – Yes	James Sell – Yes	Ron Proctor – Yes
Nicole Sweeney – Yes	John Schwarz – Yes	Nicole Sweeney – Yes
Lisette DeMars – Yes	Joanie Sawyer – Yes	
Barbara Warren – Yes		

## 6. Adaptation subcommittee report and discussion

Gregg

- Interim plan needs further research, something that can be built upon, a living document.
- Commitments the committee wants to make to this?
- Adaptation plan should make connections with efforts and initiatives to reduce greenhouse gasses.
- Six focal areas
  - Built Environment
  - Food and Nutrition Systems
  - Health and Human Services
  - Land Use and Transportation
  - Urban Natural Resources
  - Water Resources
- Focal area climate challenges
  - Projected Temperature
  - Projected Precipitation
  - Drought
  - Snow Pack
  - Water Supply
  - Wind
- This is the structure for the document, refining is needed. Scope and context laid out for each of the six areas with linkages between the areas.
- Connection to the language in Plan Tucson.
- Aimed to identify short, intermediate and long term strategies without a timeframe.
- Subcommittee still needs to:
  - Replace/refine introduction sections that currently contain placeholder language from the Denver plan to make it Tucson specific. Built Environment, Urban Natural Resources, Water Resources. Edit redundancies and flesh out the references.
  - Put together a two page summary for M/C, short list of actions they can potentially endorse, get recommendations from the committee about implementing the plan and at least one more review from the full committee.

- Subcommittee needs from the full committee
  - Review the text for major issues, things that are unclear
  - Contradictory statements
  - Short list of actions that M/C could get behind. An overall list and for the individual sections, ideas on what should be highlighted and why including audience it may pertain to.

Barbara

- Report needs to be shortened to get M/C and administration to read this
- Information is very dense and could lose the fine points by not listing in bullets.

Ben

- Document has been produced by brainstorm of a few people. Not a full fledged plan
- Needs to include a wrap up section, with endorsable action for community outreach to create a full plan.

Barbara

- Needs to include other municipalities in the region

John

- Need to develop a two page document that refers to the whole document, so the entire document does not need to be shortened.

James

- Should not skimp on research, people will look at this report very hard and we need to be able to justify everything in it. Agree with a plan and a summary

Ben

- Should have provisions and disclaimers early in report stating the issues identified in each section, we are not declaring these as the scientifically identified vulnerabilities. These are the areas of concern from the committee, for others in the community to evaluate.

Phil

- Important to have the footnotes and backup.
- Agree with bullet points, easier to find specific information.
- Items are so integrated that redundancy is needed and ok.

Gregg

- Want the full committee's input on what should be highlighted in 2 page summary

Linda

- Important to spell out the process used here; add the steps of stakeholders input. Lends more legitimacy to the report

Gregg

- Need to think about strategies implement/ how to work this through M/C, coalition building.
- Strategies highlighted in 2 page summary, obvious path forward, who to partner with, will help make case for moving forward
- Committee needs from the subcommittee
  - More information about the procedure and process
  - More data and information as you review the draft
  - More information about the formatting of the document as it is prepared for M/C
  - M/C outreach plan, full committee or subcommittee
  - Public outreach strategies

James

- A retreat for the review of the document? Full discussion

Nicole

- Important to remember that the City asked us to do this for them. Once the text is done, should meet with Leslie/OIP for review and send to City graphic dept. to design and make it look like a real plan. The City w/ the CCC should ask for it to be on Study Session, M/C request for public outreach by directing Leslie/OIP/CCC to conduct outreach. Bring back to M/C for them to review and take action. This is one possible long term strategy for moving forward.

Ben

- Add Ryan Anderson to list of people committee engages.

James

- This looks like a strategic plan, and should look like a professional strategic plan. One shot deal to present.

Nicole

- Have a designed plan when meet with Leslie, get blessing from the city and then the CCC takes to outside organizations (ex. Sustainable Tucson).
- Need to strengthen relationships with other governmental bodies. PAG, sustainability Council.

Ben

- Denver plan has extensive appendices and tables, organized by impact, which agencies have issues with those impacts. Matrix of governmental and private sector entities with checkboxes whether they are affected by a particular issue.
- Gregg and I have been invited to PAG environmental committee in November to discuss climate adaptation. Start of conversation with them.

Nicole

- Proposed actions in the report require M/C to engage in a regional level. CCC responsibility on the front end to develop plan, City's role to implement in a regional sense on the back end that the CCC supports.

Linda

- Julie Robinson is getting ready to launch county wide mitigation.

Phil

- At regional level of infrastructure, TEP and Tucson Water are proceeding, would give report credibility to say we will engage them. Tucson Water has been doing adaptation for years. Should be included in the Plan

Gregg

- Tucson Water's Climate Change plan is called a "Drought and Climate Variability Plan". Do not use the term Climate Change.

James

- Tucson Climate Change Committee should be the lead in the discussion

John

- Is there a major political actor who denies Climate Change?

Linda

- Might want to have a few people brainstorm how to help this plan gain traction both with outside entities and community and integrate other levels of government.

Gregg

- Moving from the phase of subcommittee to the full committee and will need more active participation from the full committee.

Nicole

- Larger scale public engagement should be at M/C direction. Should have OIP's backing to go to M/C

Gregg

- Clear strategy on who are key people, when to talk hen not to.

Nicole

- CCC does not have the authority to move this forward in terms of the recommended strategies, this is after M/C approves it. Work to get support for M/C support is partially CCC with OIP.

Gregg

- Cascadia work involved public meetings; we could do more of this.

Barbara

- What can be done to ensure that this does move forward? The Climate mitigation plan is in the hands of OIP to implement but we are told there is not staff and support to do it. How do we get beyond this?

Ben

- Document is a bunch of hypothetical action steps. Not specific actionable items. Interim plan, it's a framework of a plan. Nothing to move forward other than the process to develop a real plan. Need convening power to bring others together to create plan. Need to work with OIP and M/C to develop process of outreach. CCC needs to present a vision of what we are trying to produce.

Linda

- Need to make sure we are not doing something being done at another level. A process plan to create an actionable plan, here is our recommendation having checked with various stakeholder groups.

Ben

- This is what Denver has done, their first action steps are a collection of things already being done.
- Medium steps are vague, input from entities of what they plan to implement
- Long term steps even more vague

Nicole

- Public by-in is part of the public outreach piece that needs to be done prior to M/C adoption.

Phil

- Need to show a shared effort, coalition of work with other entities

Gregg

- Have a plan for a plan, but want lots of ideas behind it.

Nicole

- Need to be very clear about what is in this document, need for disclaimer that this is a recommendation for a plan
- Lots of stuff in there are things that Plan Tucson has in the works.
- UA would be more inclined to work with a plan that they were part of creating.
- Need for collaboration with other entities to create. M/C inviting others to collaborate.
- How does a plan look differently than this framework?

Things to do with report:

- Refine the content
- Brainstorm/research on process moving forward
- Timeline?
  
- Can we (CCC) refine the content and framework and then go to OIP (Leslie)?
- Look at this as a stage in a multi-decade process for our whole community. How do we leverage work in this document to actions taken by community to address climate adaptation?
  
- Committee please read through the draft, if you have edits please use track changes or edit and scan the document and send to Juan for distribution.

## **7. Action: Mitigation measures and Carbon Neutral Communities Project discussion**

Ben Champion provided a presentation of the slides from the below link, highlighting slides 1, 4, 8, 16, 19-20, 24, 26-27, 31, 32, 33-37, 48, 52, 54, 55-62, 100:

<http://carbonneutral.in4c.net/files/Carbon-Neutral-Presentation-FINAL.pdf>

- This could be the bulk of what we bring to a potential study session.

## **8. Future agenda items**

The committee requested that the next agenda include:

- Adaption report discussion
- Mitigation measures
- TEP Franchise agreement discussion

## **9. Call to Audience**

Kris Basil - Am a member of the Tucson Association of Realtors, they would be good to bring in and talk to.

Good to have a funding fee at close of escrow that buyer and seller could pay, Could be voluntary in the first year as low as \$25 - \$50, a way for the realtor to educate the consumer. This would help get the word out, and start a savings account for some of the funding issues we have. Weatherization is a big deal, 60% of the greenhouse gas emissions come from buildings. Mental health is another issue, persons are vulnerable, biggest obstacles they face are transportation and housing. Health care is a large budget item for the city, if it can be alleviated by housing and transportation in some way, it would fold into how we try to sell climate change. I think you are underestimating the community, there are some great groups/ local alliances that need to hear about what we are trying to do. Need to include them, have an open house, and engage them. Make meetings more open to the community; at least one meeting at a more convenient time, not everyone can make it at 3:00 PM.

Christopher Scott Ortiz v Pino – First year planning graduate student at the UA, would like to continue coming to these meetings to learn and network.

## **10. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 5:05 PM