

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

Friday, March 4, 2016 - 7:30 a.m.

AGENDA

Public Works Building, 3rd Floor North Conference Room

201 North Stone Avenue

Tucson, Arizona

STUDY SESSION

Call to order

Roll call of DRB members

Robert Page (Chair)

Eric Barrett

Mike Anglin (Vice Chair)

David Marhefka

Approval of minutes from February 19, 2016

CONTINUED CASE

RNA-16-02 PUEBLO VIDA BREWING COMPANY-STOREFRONT MODIFICATIONS/NEW WINDOWS/GLASS GARAGE DOOR, 113-115 EAST BROADWAY BOULEVARD, OCR-2

The applicant's project is located within the Rio Nuevo Area (RNA) Overlay Zone, and is zoned OCR-2 "Office Commercial Residential". The storefront at 113 and 115 East Broadway Boulevard, both have been altered with proper required review and approval process. The alteration to the storefront at 115 East Broadway Boulevard has been completed and the 113 East Broadway alterations has a "stop work order" for lack of historic and DRB reviews. The alterations to the storefront have included and not limited to: (1) Replacement of broken and painted over windows with clear double pane windows to allow natural air into the store; and (2) Replacement of single man door with glass garage door. All materials are to match those used for windows and doors of adjacent tenants to maintain design aesthetics of the building complex and façade along Broadway Boulevard.

Tucson Unified Development Code (UDC) Sections applicable to the project include, but are not limited to, Section 2.2.6.C.14 which states that the DRB reviews for recommendation, all proposed development in the Rio Nuevo Area (RNA), as provided in Section 5.12.7. In formulating its recommendation, the DRB shall apply the design standards in Sections 5.12.7.C, *Building Design Standards* and 5.12.7.D *Site Design Standards*.

The Applicant's Request

The applicant is requesting a review of the proposed alteration of the existing storefront with new double pane windows and glass garage door for compatibility with Rio Nuevo Area design criteria.

THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE APPLICANT'S PROJECT FOR COMPLIANCE WITH RIO NUEVO DESIGN CRITERIA AND RECOMMENDS TO THE PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE PROJECT (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE BUILDING DESIGN STANDARDS SET FORTH IN UDC SECTION 5.12.7.C 1-15 AND SITE DESIGN STANDARDS IN SECTION 5.12.7.D (SEE ATTACHMENT 'A').

NEW CASES:

DRB-16-04 1ST AVENUE SELF-STORAGE II, 5010 NORTH 1ST AVENUE, C-1 [DDO-16-09]

The project is a self-storage facility located on 1st Avenue, north of River Road and is zoned C-1"Commercial. There is an existing personal self-storage building with one (1) story above ground

and a basement, for a total of approximately 33,000 square feet; new development will be approximately 1.2 acres and combined with the existing site to the south, the site is a total of 3 acres. The proposed development triggers compliance with all Tucson *Unified Development Code (UDC)* regulations applicable to new construction, including, but not limited to providing a five (5') foot high masonry screen wall along the northern interior property line (Foothill Drive) adjacent to a wash/floodplain (residentially zoned and vacant property). The applicant is seeking zoning approval necessary to substitute screening material.

Tucson *UDC* Sections applicable to the project include, but are not limited to Section 4.7.20 which provides the design criteria applicable to commercial development in the C-1, zone, Section 7.6.4; 7.6.5 and Table 7.6.4-1 which provides the landscape and screening standards, and Sections 3.11.1.C.2; 3.11.1.D.1 and 3.11.1.D.3 which provide the DDO regulations applicable to this screening substitution request.

The Applicant's Request

The applicant is requesting Design Review Board (DRB) review of a Design Development Option (DDO) request as follows:

1) In lieu of a 10' wide interior landscape border along north boundary with a five (5') foot high masonry screen wall, provide a 10' wide interior landscape border with tree screen (1 tree per 25' linear feet, 24' box size) and to grow to be approximately 25' in height, as shown and noted on the submitted site and landscape plans.

THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE PROPOSED DESIGN DEVELOPMENT OPTION REQUEST AND RECOMMENDS TO THE PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT (PDS) DIRECTOR (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE PROJECT (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE CRITERIA ESTABLISHED IN UDC SECTIONS 3.11.1.D.1 AND 3.11.1.D.3 (SEE ATTACHMENT 'B'); AND SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS.

DRB-16-05 NEW LIFE CHURCH OF GOD/NEW LIFE CHURCH OF GOD INC/424, 482, AND 504 WEST NEBRASKA STREET, C-2 AND R-2 [C10-16-04]

The applicant's property is an approximately 6.88 acre site zoned R-2 "Residential" and C-2 "Commercial". The property, located northeast of 12th Avenue, an arterial street identified on the Major Streets and Routes (MS&R) Plan map and Nebraska Street, is developed with a church. The applicant proposes to expand the site by providing additional parking to the west of the church building. The expansion requires the entire site to comply with current Tucson Unified Development Code (UDC) regulations.

Tucson UDC sections applicable to this project include, but are not limited to, Sections 4.7.9 and 4.7.21 and Tables 4.8-2 and 4.8-4 which provide the criteria for development in the R-2 and C-2 zones; and Sections 7.6.4, 7.6.5 and Table 7.6.4-1 which provide the landscaping and screening standards for the site and Sections 2.2.6.C.5 which provide the DRB reviews, for recommendation to the B/A.

The Applicant's Request

The applicant is requesting Design Review Board (DRB) review of the following variance:

- (1) Allow the existing (30") screen wall to remain located within the required landscape border, as constructed within the landscape border, all as shown on the submitted plans.

THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE PROPOSED LANDSCAPE AND SCREENING VARIANCE REQUEST AND RECOMMENDS TO THE BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT (B/A) (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE APPLICATION (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE CRITERIA ESTABLISHED IN UDC SECTION 3.10.3.K 1-7 (SEE ATTACHMENT 'C'); AND SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS.

RND PRE-APPS

The purpose of the pre-application portion of the meeting is to allow potential Rio Nuevo Area (RNA) applicants an opportunity for non-deliberative discussion with the DRB about the project and the RNA process, prior to actual submittal of the application.

Call to the Audience

Adjourn

If you have any questions concerning this DRB meeting, please contact Michael Taku at 837-4963.
S: zoning administration/drb/030416agenda.doc

ATTACHMENT A: RNA DESIGN CRITERIA

Development within the RNA is required to comply with the following building design standards. Compliance with these standards will ensure that development complies with the design principles set forth in UDC Section 5.12.7 Please describe how the project complies with each of the following:

5.12.7. C Building Design Standards

1. The proposed buildings shall respect the scale of those buildings located in the development zone and serve as an orderly transition to a different scale pursuant to Section 5.12.8.B, *Development Transition Standards*. Building heights with a vastly different scale than those on adjacent properties should have a transition in scale to reduce and mitigate potential impacts. In areas undergoing change, long range plans should be consulted for guidance as to appropriate heights;

2. All new construction must be consistent with the prevailing setback existing within its development zone except that the PSDS Director may approve a different setback than the prevailing setback upon a written finding during the review process that a different setback is warranted by site conditions or applicable development design goals consistent with Section 5.12.1, *Purpose*, and the proposed setback will not be incompatible with adjacent properties, as defined in Section 11.4.2.A;

3. All new construction shall provide scale defining architectural elements or details at the first two floor levels, such as windows, spandrels, awnings, porticos, cornices, pilasters, columns, and balconies;

4. Every commercial building frontage shall provide windows, window displays, or visible activity within and adjacent to the building at the ground floor level, with a minimum of 50 percent of the building frontage providing such features;

5. A single plane of a façade at the street level may not be longer than 50 feet without architectural relief or articulation by features such as windows, trellises, and arcades;

6. Building façade design shall include pedestrian-scaled, down-shielded, and glare controlled exterior building and window lighting;

7. The front doors of all commercial and government buildings shall be visible from the street and visually highlighted by graphics, lighting, marquees, or canopies;

8. Modifications to the exterior of historic buildings shall complement the overall historic context of the Downtown and respect the architectural integrity of the historic façade;

9. Buildings shall be designed to shield adjacent buildings and public rights-of-way from reflected heat and glare;

10. Safe and adequate vehicular parking areas designed to minimize conflicts with pedestrians and bicycles shall be provided;

11. Adequate shade shall be provided for sidewalks and pedestrian pathways, using shade structure or vegetation, where permitted by the City ;

12. Colors may conform to the overall color palette and context of the Downtown area or may be used expressively to create visual interest, variety, and street rhythms. The rationale for an expressive or idiosyncratic use of color shall be described in the site plan submittal;

13. New buildings shall use materials, patterns, and elements that relate to the traditional context of the Downtown area;

14. Twenty-four-hour, street-level activity is encouraged by providing a mixture of retail, office, and residential uses within each building; and,

15. Primary public entries shall be directly accessed from a sidewalk along a street rather than from a parking lot. Public access to commercial and governmental buildings shall be provided at

sidewalk grade. The primary floor of, and access to, residential structures may be elevated. Secondary access may be provided from off-street parking areas.

5.12.7. D **Site Design Standards**

1. Vehicular Circulation

a. All parking area access lanes (PAALs) adjacent to buildings shall have pedestrian circulation paths between the PAAL and the building, with a minimum width of six feet.

b. The locations of all points of vehicular ingress and egress shall be perpendicular to the intersecting street. Points of ingress and egress points shall be designed to minimize vehicular/pedestrian and vehicular/bicycle conflicts. Adequate storage for vehicular queuing at parking facilities shall be contained on site. Right turn bays are strongly discouraged. Points of ingress and egress shall be minimized wherever possible. Additional temporary ingress and egress locations may be permitted for parking structures when occasional high peak period traffic flows (i.e., parking facilities for event venues) are anticipated.

2. **Parking**

a. General Parking standards are listed in Section 7.4. Some properties in the RNA may also be located in the Downtown Parking District, which allows a reduction in the number of parking spaces as provided in Section 7.4.5.B.

b. Screening of Parking All new parking shall be designed so that vehicles are not visible from the adjoining street level, through incorporation of pedestrian arcades, occupied space, or display space.

c. Employee Parking Employee parking for all uses should be provided at remote locations in order to maximize the availability of space for development .

3. **Plazas and Open Space**

The fundamental objective of the design standards in this Section 5.12.7.D.3 is to encourage public and private investments to enhance the character and function of Downtown's pedestrian environment.

a. **Plazas and Pedestrian Nodes**

Five percent of the gross floor area of new construction shall be provided in public plazas or courtyards. Open space plazas, courtyards, and patios are landscaped outdoor areas designed to accommodate multiple uses, from large gatherings of the people for performing arts to smaller gatherings. The plazas and courtyards will be one of the ways that spaces and uses can be linked. The requirement of this section may be waived or reduced by the PDSD Director upon a written finding during the review process that the development enhances the downtown pedestrian environment even with a smaller percent or elimination of the requirement.

b. **View shed Corridors**

Views of all historic properties and all natural elements surrounding the Downtown should be considered during design. Plazas, courtyards, and open spaces shall be sited to include views to other public spaces, where feasible.

c. **Linkages (Physical and Visual)**

Neighborhood linkages shall be maintained throughout Downtown.

4. **Streetscape**

a. Streetscapes must be consistent with the Streetscape Design Policy. In streetscape design, priority is given to pedestrians.

b. **Shade**

Shade shall be provided for at least 50 percent of all sidewalks and pedestrian pathways as measured at 2:00 p.m. on June 21 when the sun is 82° above the horizon (based on 32°N Latitude). Shade may be provided by arcades, canopies, or shade structures, provided they and their location and design characteristics are compatible with the prevailing and design context of the

street and the architectural integrity of the building. Deciduous trees, as proposed in the Downtown Comprehensive Street Tree Plan, are encouraged to supplement existing evergreen trees. The use of plantings and shade structures in the City right-of-way are permitted to meet this standard with the approval of the Department of Transportation. The shade provided by a building may serve to meet this standard.

ATTACHMENT B: DDO FOR LANDSCAPE & SCREENING SUBSTITUTIONS

UDC SECTION 3.11.C.2 For landscaping and screening modification requests as provided in Section 3.11.1.B.3, the Design Review Board shall review the request and make a recommendation prior to a decision by the PDSB Director.

SECTION 3.11.1.D.1 "GENERAL FINDINGS FOR DDO"

For all modification requests, the PDSB Director may approve a DDO request only if the request meets all of the following findings:

- a. Is not a request previously denied as a variance;
- b. Does not modify a conditional requirement or finding to determine whether the use should be allowed in the zone;
- c. Is not to a condition of approval for a rezoning or Special Exception Land Use application;
- d. Does not modify a requirement of an overlay zone, such as, but not limited to, Scenic Corridor, Environmental Resource, Major Streets and Routes Setback, or Airport Environs;
- e. Does not result in deletion or waiver of a UDC requirement;
- f. The modification applies to property that cannot be developed in conformity with the provisions of this Chapter due to physical circumstances or conditions of the property, such as irregular shape, narrowness of lot, exceptional topographic conditions, or location.
- g. Does not create a situation where proposed development substantially reduces the amount of privacy that would be enjoyed by nearby residents any more than would be available if the development was built without the modification;
- h. Does not create a situation where proposed development will block visibility within the required visibility triangle on adjoining streets for either vehicular or pedestrian traffic;
- i. Does not create a situation where the proposed development will cause objectionable noise, odors, trespass lighting, or similar adverse impacts adjacent properties or development; and
- j. Does not create a situation where the development will result in an increase in the number of residential dwelling units or the square footage of nonresidential buildings greater than would occur if the development was built without the modification.

SECTION 3.11.1.D.3 "SPECIFIC FINDING FOR SCREENING MODIFICATION REQUESTS"

For screening modifications, in addition to the findings in Section 3.11.1.D.1, the PDS Director shall make a finding that the modification does not lower the height of a required screening device to a point where it does not accomplish its purpose.

ATTACHMENT C: BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT FINDINGS

BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT FINDINGS

The Board of Adjustment can hear and decide a variance request from the regulations listed in the Unified Development Code. The Board may grant a variance only if it finds the following:

1. That, because there are special circumstances applicable to the property, strict enforcement of the UDC will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed by other property of the same classification in the same zoning district.
2. That such special circumstances were not self-imposed or created by the owner or one in possession of the property.
3. That the variance granted is subject to such conditions as will assure that the adjustment authorized shall not constitute a grant of special privileges inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which such property is located.
4. That, because of special circumstances applicable to the property, including its size, shape, topography, location, and surroundings, the property cannot reasonably be developed in conformity with the provisions of the UDC.
5. That the granting of the variance will not be detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to other property or improvements in the neighborhood in which the property is located.
6. That the proposed variance will not impair an adequate supply of light and air to adjacent property, substantially increase congestion, or substantially diminish or impair property values within the neighborhood.
7. That the variance, if granted, is the minimum variance that will afford relief and is the least modification possible of the UDC provisions which are in question.