



2016

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, May 26, 2016

**4th Floor North Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 12:03 PM, and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Jim Sauer, Arthur Stables, Patsy Waterfall, Sharon Chadwick, Michael Becherer.

Staff: Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, John Beall, Andrew Connor, Heather Thrall (PDSD)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes for 5-19-16

Motion by Commissioner Waterfall, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 5-19-16.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 5-0 (*Commissioner Becherer joined after vote)

3. Historic Landmark Sign Review Case

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0/Tucson Sign Code Section 3-71.G.7 and 8/3-71.D.2
Review for Compliance with HLS Cultural/Historic/Design Designation Guidelines*

HLS-16-02 –“Hacienda Motel” New Historic Landmark Sign (HLS): Treatment Plan/Restoration, Two (2) Pole Sign Cabinets-1742 N Oracle Road

Staff Andrew Connor, Sign Code Division summarized the technical guidelines. This project is part of a program by the City of Tucson Historic Preservation Office to preserve neon signs working in partnership with

willing owners. According to a letter by Russlyn Wells, Acting Sign Code Administrator, the proposed Treatment Plan submitted for the restoration of two (2) pole signs at the Hacienda Motel is in compliance with all HLS Technical Designation Guidelines.

Applicants Jude Cook and Wendy Martin, seek to restore and designate two (2) separate nonconforming freestanding pole signs as Historic Landmark Signs for each pole sign (Sign One and Sign Two); discussed all character-defining and text-defining features.

Sign One: Transitional HLS currently on site, near the pool, was constructed circa the 1960s. The sign consists of an internally illuminated, round yellow cabinet with black silhouetted bronc-riding cowboy, two red neon arrows just below, with a rectangular cabinet underneath lit with yellow neon "Hacienda."

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to recommend approval of the treatment plan as presented, noting the following- character-defining features:

- shape
- bronc-rider on V-3 background
- neon
- arrow
- word Hacienda in custom font
- open faced panel channel letters with inline neon.

The character defining text of the sign to be:

- "Hacienda "

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

Sign Two: Classic HLS was on site originally near the pool, where Sign One is currently located, was constructed circa 1950. The sign renderings consist of a metal rounded cabinet top with painted bronc-riding cowboy, which sits atop a geometric backed neon "Hacienda Motel". Just below the main signage reads "Refrigerated" in neon text, and at the bottom of the cabinet is a cut out arrow listing "No Vacancy", also in neon.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to recommend approval of the treatment plan as presented, noting the following- character-defining features:

- shape
- bronc-rider logo

- colors including wood grain
- neon including the arrow
- Hacienda Motel in existing custom font

The character defining text of the sign to be:

- "Hacienda " and "Motel"

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

4. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

- a. HPZ-16-27** – Global Community Communications Alliance- Profile on Windows/Doors and Proposed Replacement Plan [Zoning Violation]–630 North 4th Avenue-(West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku read into the record, the summary of recommendations from PRS on 5/19/16 to continue review on 5/26/16 to allow the applicant time to address the materials for the doors and windows per West University Historic District Design Guidelines; fence top design; and remove tile over stucco at columns with details and documentation.

Project representative Catherine Lilly presented revised drawings for windows and doors to be all wood double hung, fence design with round tops and removal of tile over stucco at columns.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to recommend approval of revised plan as presented.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

- b. HPZ-16-37-** Mata Residence- Porch Enclosure/Window/Door/Stucco-1004 North 6th Avenue-(West University Historic Preservation Zone) [Continued Case]

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) on 5/17/16. *This case was taken out of order because the applicant was not present when the case was first called.

Property owner Eddie Mata presented the background on the project.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval as submitted subject to (1) new wood window matches the existing adjacent wood double hung window; (2) door to be wood; and (3) new door and window addition be differentiated from existing by an offset.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

c. HPZ-16-28- Trinity Presbyterian Church Preservation Boundary Amendment and Mixed Use Development-400 East University Boulevard- (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) on 5/17/16.

Staff Mabry, City Preservation Officer, reiterated his presentation to the WHZAB on this application as follows:

- a. Existing Art Brown additions proposed to be removed are not contributing historic properties to the West University National Register Historic District as they are not within the district's defined period of significance (1890-1930).
- b. Proposal being presented is to amend the boundary of the HPZ for church site to achieve additional height to lessen the building footprint (in lieu of the massing/volume currently allowed) and the new conceptual development plan. Additional WUHZAB and Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS) reviews will be required as the design is further developed.
- c. Rezoning review processes will apply (i.e.: PRS, neighborhood meeting, public review/comment period, Zoning Examiner hearing, Mayor and Council public hearing).

Staff Beall, summarized relationship between the Planned Area Development (PAD) and Rezoning processes and explained the role of PRS in subsequent reviews if Mayor and Council decides to initiates the requested boundary amendment.

Project architect Rob Paulus, and Randi Dorman, R+R Development, presented the background on the project, explained the rationale for the application, and discussed the new design concept.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to recommend initiation of the Historic Preservation Zone boundary amendment as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Draft PAD(h) proposal to be reviewed by PRS prior to any approval;
- (2) Any future amendments (minor or major) to the PAD(h) to be reviewed by PRS;
- (3) Agreement with an owner in the West University National Register District for a relocation of contributing duplex that does not affect eligibility of the duplex;
- (4) PAD(h) proposal to include application of all current Unified Development Code 5.8 HPZ zoning requirements to all contributing historic buildings on the site;
- (5) Proposed new construction to be reviewed for compatibility by PRS using West University Historic District Design Guidelines and Unified Development Code, in consultation with SHPO when necessary; recognizing that the proposal will be looking for exceptions based on height and setbacks, and possibly other exceptions to the design guidelines;
- (6) WUHZAB representative be involved in the boundary amendment and PAD(h) creation processes.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff will visit on-going project sites in West University Historic Preservation Zone.

b. Appeals

None at this time

c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations within the City Historic Preservation Zones and Rio Nuevo Area.

d. Review Process for Approval of Complex Large-Scale and/or Multi-Phase Projects

None at this time

6. **Call to the Audience (For Information Only)**

Chris Gans as a citizen expressed concerns on precedent, height, and traffic in regard to case HPZ-16-28-Trinity Presbyterian Church. The PAD may become a tool to dilute historic boundaries and wondered if any mitigation was being considered.

7. **Future Agenda Items**

Continued cases from 5/19/16 and residential new construction/additions.

8. **Adjournment**

2: 24 PM.