



2016

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission

Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, June 23, 2016

**4th Floor North Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 12:05 PM, and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Patsy Waterfall (Acting Chair), Jim Sauer, Arthur Stables, Sharon Chadwick, Michael Becherer, and Helen Erickson.

Staff: Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, (PDSD) Alison Miller (Ward 6)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes from meeting of 5-26-16

Motion by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes from meeting of 5-26-16.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 6-0

3. Courtesy Review Cases

Revised Plan for Redeveloping La Placita Village: An Informational Presentation and discussion on the schematic/planning phase. No Action Required.

Presentation was led by Evan Eglin alongside Teresa Vasquez, Tatyana Bresler, and Matt Stuart. Discussion was held. Formal review by PRS in the future. No action was taken

4. **Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

- a. **HPZ-16-38** – Erbe/Schuerman- New Addition: Dining Room-230 South Herbert Avenue- (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku read into the record, the summary of the LAR/ Minutes from Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 5/17/16 to recommend approval as submitted. .

Project architect, Bob Lanning, Lanning Architecture presented the project on behalf of property owners. Discussion was held.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to recommend approval of the project as presented subject to (1) building setbacks on the north and west be waived.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- b. **HPZ-16-39-** Bancroft-New Buildings/Infill : Main Residence/Guesthouse/Studio Space-346 West 18th Street-(Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku read into the record, the summary of the LAR/Minutes and recommendations from the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) meeting of 6/20/16.

Property owner Paul Bancroft and Jim Sauer, Project Manager, Scott Neeley Architecture, presented the background on the project. Discussion was held. Subcommittee disagreed with some of the BHHZAB interpretation of the Barrio Historico Architectural Design Guidelines and recommendations. Subcommittee had handouts on Zoning Administrator's Determination (ZAD) of 12/10/13 in Case HPZ-13-38 and Board of Adjustment decision upholding the ZAD in Case C10-14-03 Appeal of ZAD, both for the property at 695 South Main Avenue. The Subcommittee discussed how, for that previous case, they interpreted the Design Guidelines for acceptable exterior wall materials to mean acceptable exterior finishes.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, to recommend approval as presented subject to (1) stucco on wood or steel frame construction are acceptable wall materials for the structure of the building; (2) windows in the east elevation along vehicular

access are acceptable as shown; (3) the designer seek further differentiation of the buildings as contemporary construction, perhaps focusing on the stone base; (4) the designer should also reconsider the garage doors in regards to the proportions of adobe versus the door openings; and (5) building setbacks be waived.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0. (*Commissioner Sauer recused himself from discussions and did not vote)

- c. HPZ-16-40- Valenzuela Residence-Demo/Remodel/New Additions: Doors/Windows/ Roof/Stucco-525 South Meyer Avenue-(Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone)**

Staff Taku read into the record, the summary of the LAR/Minutes and recommendations from the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) of 6/20/16.

Project drafter, Bobby Otero, Otero Design presented the background, rationale and design concept of the project. Discussion was held.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to recommend case be continued for applicant to return with requested documentation

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- d. HPZ-16-44- Weinstein-New Construction: Single-Family Residence-1040 North Arizona Avenue-(West University Historic Preservation Zone)**

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from the West University Historic Preservation Zone (WUHZAB) meeting of 6/21/16.

Property owner David Weinstein presented the design concept for the new dwelling. Discussion was held.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, to recommend case be continued pending a Zoning Administrator's Determination on development zone to be used for historic compatibility and with consideration to the hierarchy between alleys and streets.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- e. HPZ-16-45- Tyler-New Stucco/Windows/Doors/Wall Mounted Mechanical Units-628, 630 & 632 North Herbert Avenue--(West University Historic Preservation Zone)**

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from the West University Historic Preservation Zone (WUHZAB) meeting of 6/21/16.

Property owner Zachary Tyler presented an overview of the proposed rehabilitation, remodel and additions on the property. Discussion was held.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, to recommend approval as submitted subject to the following conditions: (1) Mechanical should be ground mounted; (2) Stucco finish to comply with the West University District Design Guidelines; (3) Encourage applicant to rebuild, reuse or salvage windows and doors if possible; and (4) Minor review to be conducted when windows and doors are selected.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff and Commissioner Sauer conducted on-site reviews in West University Historic Preservation Zone.

b. Appeals

None at this time

c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations within the City Historic Preservation Zones and Rio Nuevo Area. Infill porch at 600 East Speedway is being discussed with staff for a formal review.

d. Review Process for Approval of Complex Large-Scale and/or Multi-Phase Projects

None at this time

6. Call to the Audience (For Information Only)

No one to speak.

7. Future Agenda Items

Continued cases from 5/19/16 and Text Amendments.

8. Adjournment

2: 30 PM.