

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Here.

2 MS. FLORES: Commissioner Salcedo? Absent.

3 And Commissioner Sitzman?

4 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Here.

5 MS. FLORES: We have a quorum.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Thank you.

7 No. 2, Approval of Legal Action Report and Minutes from
8 January 29th, 2019, and February 4th, 2019. Did we get the Legal
9 Action Report?

10 MS. FLORES: Yes, it was part of the email with
11 the Minutes for both sets.

12 MS. MESICH: It's a two-page summary.

13 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: From Dennis McLaughlin?

14 MS. MESICH: No, from our office.

15 MS. FLORES: No, the Legal Action Report is what I
16 create after the meeting just summarizing --

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Oh --

18 MS. FLORES: -- what happened --

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- oh --

20 MS. FLORES: -- at the meeting.

21 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- oh, okay, okay, okay.

22 MS. FLORES: -- yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay, okay, okay. I'm sorry.

24 MS. FLORES: Okay.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So did everyone get the

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 Minutes from the first two meetings as well as the two-page Legal
2 Action?

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Does anyone have any
5 corrections, additions, to any of those, the Minutes?

6 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I don't think I got the
7 Legal Action. So I read the Minutes.

8 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah, I saw that. I didn't
9 know that's what that was called.

10 MS. MESICH: It has to go out within three days
11 after the meeting, three working days, so it's a --

12 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

13 MS. MESICH: -- very short summary of what
14 happened.

15 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

16 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Mr. Chair?

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Commissioner Anderson?

18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: The Minutes of the
19 February 4th meeting --

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yes.

21 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- will need to be amended
22 to reflect that actually Commissioner Sitzman made the comments
23 rather than I.

24 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Let Bambi know that, yeah.

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah. And we talked --

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 yeah -- a little bit earlier about that. So, when you have a
2 chance to amend it correctly, that'll be great.

3 MS. FLORES: Yes, I will -- so you guys can either
4 move to not approve them at this meeting and wait for the edits,
5 or approve them and then approve the edits.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So every place that it says
7 it's Commissioner Anderson is --

8 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: No, there were -- it was
9 just mixed up --

10 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- so it's really mixed up.

12 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

13 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I don't know that you'd
14 ever sift through everything to tell you the truth, so --

15 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

16 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So would it be your desire to
17 wait on approving the Minutes of February the 4th?

18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: We certainly could. I was
19 going to just say that -- to approve them with the amend- -- with
20 the provision that Staff will amend them to reflect the correct
21 speaker. The content was, I think, accurate --

22 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Mm-hmm.

23 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- it was -- it was just
24 who -- who speaking at the time.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: It that okay with you?

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: That's fine.

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. So do we have any
3 other changes, additions, corrections to the Minutes of those two
4 meetings or the Legal Action Report?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Hearing none, is there a
7 motion to approve all three of those items?

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Sure. I'll make a motion
9 to approve.

10 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Second.

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Second. Okay. It's been
12 moved, and seconded, that we approve the Legal Action Report and
13 the Minutes from January 29th, 2019, and February 4th, 2019. All
14 those in favor?

15 (Carried by a Commission voice vote of 5 to 0
16 [Commissioner Guymon and Vice Chairperson Salcedo being absent].)

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Anyone opposed?

18 (No response.)

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. They're approved.

20 Review Data and Develop Commission Recommendation. So,
21 as far as I know, we have nothing more than we had a week ago,
22 with the exception of two comments: one of them from a Staff
23 member of a Council office; and one of them saying we should have
24 meetings west of Alvernon and -- or east of Alvernon and south of
25 22nd, which we had last week; our meeting was both of those.

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 We don't have anything else new, right?

2 MS. MESICH: No, Mr. Chair. We didn't have the
3 Staff to go to the Records Center and pull more budget data, so
4 we're hoping --

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

6 MS. MESICH: -- to do that tomorrow and --

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: And --

8 MS. MESICH: -- then get it to you as we get it.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- and we still have replies
10 only from Councilman Kozachik and Mayor Rothschild?

11 MS. MESICH: That's correct.

12 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

13 MS. MESICH: The Mayor did let us know his
14 availability for meeting with the three of you. And Mr. Sitzman
15 asked earlier today. The Mayor is available on February 25th,
16 from 8:00 a.m. to 8:30; the 26th, from 3:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m.;
17 and the 27th, at 3:00 o'clock to 3:30. So I think 8:00 o'clock
18 on the 25th worked better for Mr. Sitzman --

19 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Mm-hmm.

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: And myself --

21 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

22 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- also.

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Who --

24 MS. MESICH: That's okay for you?

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- else was going? Mary,

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 you? Okay. So does the 25th, at 8:00 a.m., at City Hall work
2 for you?

3 COMMISSIONER KELSO: That'll work for me.

4 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

5 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Works for you? Okay. So --

7 MS. MESICH: So we'll let the Mayor's office know;
8 and send you a confirming email.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. And that's in his
10 office at City Hall?

11 MS. MESICH: Yes, sir.

12 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Okay. Is --
13 Commissioner Sitzman, are there things that you specifically want
14 to ask the Mayor to expand on his written responses or --

15 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: More opened-ended
16 questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

18 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Let him kind of expand on
19 his questionnaire, on his answers --

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- and kind of get a real
22 feel for the life of the Mayor --

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

24 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- you know, more than
25 anything else. And I imagine, Mary, you're probably going to

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 have some questions?

2 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Exactly.

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: But I -- I think -- let him
4 -- just let him speak and us listen.

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Commissioner Kelso, is
6 there anything else that you specifically want to get into with
7 him?

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I just want to know exact --
9 you know, a little bit more what he does, you know, when he's not
10 doing Mayor and Council meetings. I -- I know he has a busy
11 schedule, I get that, but, you know, what else is he doing out
12 there, you know.

13 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

14 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I'd like to know a little bit
15 more.

16 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: You mean that is not City
17 business, but his personal business?

18 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, all City.

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Oh, City. Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Mm-hmm.

21 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

22 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I don't care about his
23 personal business.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So did we request, like, 30
25 minutes or did we --

1 MS. MESICH: It looks like that's his limit.

2 That's --

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: All right.

4 MS. MESICH: -- what he's got --

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

6 MS. MESICH: -- 8:00 to 8:30 on the 25th --

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Which I think that's plenty.

9 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: That's plenty of time.

10 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah, I think so, too. Okay.

11 So we will, the three of us, be there on the 25th. Okay.

12 I'm kind of at a loss, too, to ask you where we ought
13 to go now as far as recommendations. Anyone have any
14 suggestions? We're -- we're kind of waiting for more Council
15 Member responses -- although I don't know if we're going to get
16 any -- but you're going to lean on them or something tomorrow --

17 MS. MESICH: As much as I am allowed.

18 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- as -- as comfortable as
19 you can be about it?

20 MS. MESICH: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

22 MS. MESICH: I'm not certain they'll all respond.

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So how many -- when do --
24 when else do we have meetings? I don't have this written down in
25 front of me.

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Next two Mondays.

2 MS. FLORES: Monday, the 25th --

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

4 MS. FLORES: -- and then March 4th and March 11th.

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE:

MS. FLORES: And I think we said that -- last week
7 that, on March 4th, we would attempt to start writing or finish
8 writing our report, and then make any final changes to it on the
9 11th. So that gives us next week to kind of come up with what we
10 think our recommendation ought to be. Does anyone feel
11 comfortable at this point talking about what we think we ought to
12 be doing for a recommendation?

13 My recollection from previous talks is that there are
14 four or us here who feel that they should get a raise; and
15 there's one of us who does not feel that they should or -- or
16 that feels we should not put a recommendation for a raise on the
17 ballot. So does anyone want to talk about -- or does anyone feel
18 comfortable talking about what -- what kind of recommendation we
19 ought to have?

20 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: May I make a statement?

21 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Sure.

22 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Actually, my recollection
23 was -- was that you were on the fence and that --

24 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I was on the fence. I was
25 -- I missed last week's meeting, I apologize, but two weeks --

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Oh, I'm sorry --

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- two weeks ago --

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- I'm sorry if I
4 mischaracterized you.

5 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: That's all right.

6 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: And I also -- I don't know
7 what Commissioner Perez -- I don't know that you vocalized your
8 opinions and I'd like to hear from both of you.

9 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: I would say that I am in
10 support of a raise. I think that the fact that there are cities
11 with a smaller population than the City of Tucson, both by people
12 in area, that are getting paid -- with City officials getting
13 paid more, City Managers getting paid more, is not a great
14 reflection on the City of Tucson. And I think that if we want,
15 for the sake of our city, to progress in great ways that we also
16 need to compensate the City officials in certain circumstances.

17 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Well said.

18 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Commissioner Anderson, do you
19 want to --

20 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Well, just briefly. I
21 came into this undecided and up till two weeks ago I was still on
22 the fence, as -- as Commissioner Sitzman put it. I've given it
23 some thought, I've done some reading, you know, I think it's --
24 this Mayor and Council, whoever they are, they really need to be
25 compensated more for what they do. It's a tough job. I know a

1 little bit about it. And I'm -- I'm leaning towards an -- an
2 increase.

3 And, again, I think, you know, we -- maybe we'll have a
4 certain amount where we think they should be, but I'm not sure if
5 we make the jump from where they are now to whatever that point
6 -- point is in one -- you know, in one election, basically, but,
7 perhaps, going in the -- in that direction in -- in a modest
8 amount. I still think Tucson suffers from a lot of underpaid
9 jobs and poverty and I think that needs to be taken into
10 consideration as well.

11 And it's interesting about El Paso that it's similar to
12 Tucson, I think, in demographics, considerably, where they
13 increase their elected officials in a big jump. I'm not sure if
14 we're up for that or not. But I think I'm -- I'm leaning towards
15 a modest increase to take to the voters.

16 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I would agree with it 100%,
17 especially -- I think you -- you said it perfectly, "modest." It
18 can't -- it's got to be baby steps at the beginning and then grow
19 from there because you're not going to get a big increase. I
20 think we'll see exactly the same result, with a big defeat, if
21 you go for big money.

22 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: And just to -- to add a
24 little bit to what Mr. Perez said. I think I was the most --
25 most persuaded by comparing Tucson to Mesa --

1 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- Tucson with a population
3 of 535,000, Mesa with 496,000, slightly smaller, but -- and we
4 both have the same form of government, our Mayor makes \$42,000,
5 the Mesa Mayor makes \$73,000, our Council makes \$24, their
6 Council makes \$40, which is -- I think, the Town of Gilbert is --
7 is, also, right about the same salary as Tucson, with the
8 population substantially less than half of Tucson's salary.

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Do we have household
10 median income figures for those communities versus Tucson?

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I don't know that we do.

12 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I think that's where some
13 of the -- the -- for me, that's where some of the angst, I guess,
14 comes from, a reluctance, anyway, because I -- my guess is that
15 Mesa, and even Gilbert, perhaps, have higher household incomes
16 than Tucson may reflect and I think that's a consideration to
17 take into account as well.

18 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I don't have those --

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Commissioner Kelso?

21 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- I don't have those current
22 figures, but I did a couple years ago, and they were bigger than
23 Tucson's if that's what happened.

24 And I know that the Commissioner -- or the Council
25 Members and the Mayor did vote in the last election to -- might

1 not have been the last election -- but during the last budget to
2 increase the City's employees' salaries. So they did get more of
3 a salary increase to try to get them back up to where they were;
4 whereas, Tucson growth, we're faltering, you know. We're still
5 behind, you know. And that's where -- that's what I was working
6 on, you know, with all these figures and everything.

7 And, you know, I've -- we've got employees here that
8 have been here for 52, 40 years, 38, and they're not even at the
9 top of their scales and that's -- and never get to the top, you
10 know. Well, some of them should've been retired; they just
11 can't.

12 So, I mean, we've got things like that; that, you know,
13 they've stuck with the City all this time trying to, you know,
14 stick this -- you know, stayed with them and I'm looking at them
15 as voters. Are they going to vote for them? Are they going to
16 have their families vote for this, you know? This is things I
17 got to look at, too, you know? Are they going to go up there and
18 say, you know what? They haven't done anything for us, are we
19 going to help them, you know?

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So are you --

21 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: That's right.

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- are you more persuaded
23 that we should come up with a proposal that will be approved as
24 opposed to a proposal that we feel is appropriate and right? Or
25 should we try to come to a -- and I think what you were saying,

1 Jerry, is we're going to have to weigh both those factors; that
2 we may feel this is where they should be but there's no way
3 that's going to get approved, so we'll go partway to that. But
4 do you -- are you more leaning towards finding something that
5 will get approved?

6 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Well, it'd have to be
7 something that would be approved if we want to put it out there,
8 you know, as far as I'm concerned, because, you know, you've got
9 a lot of City workers that have a lot of family and they're -- I
10 mean, they're just anti-Mayor-and-Council right now.

11 So if -- we've got to look at the fact that these
12 people, if -- if they're going to vote -- if they're going to go
13 out there and vote, they're going to look at, okay, well, it's
14 only this amount or, you know, maybe if we help them, they'll
15 help us kind of thing, you know? That's what I'm kind of looking
16 at, you know?

17 If we -- if we -- I think it should be modest, you
18 know. If we go that route, I think it should be modest and, you
19 know, just like the workers, you know, they got a 2.5 and a 2,
20 you know, after 13 years.

21 And when was the last time the Commissioners (sic) got
22 the raise, it was 1999?

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Twenty years.

24 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yeah, 20 years. So -- and,
25 grant you, I think they deserve it. I -- I really do. They put

1 a lot in, I get it. But you also have to look at the fact that
2 they haven't helped the -- the workers as much as those workers
3 think they should've, you know? We've got the budget there.

4 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Play devil's advocate --
5 because we think they deserve it --

6 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Mm-hmm.

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- should we go to bat for
8 them and tell the voters we think they deserve it?

9 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yes, depending on the amount
10 that we're going to be requesting for them --

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Right.

12 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- you know. I mean, if it's
13 an exorbitant amount, I'm going to have a big problem going out
14 and saying, well, they're only going to give you this, but you
15 should vote for them for this, you know? I -- I personally would
16 have a big problem with that.

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Last week, we were
18 talking about the average wage per City employee and we had this
19 figure where -- that takes the total amount paid in salaries
20 divided by the full-time equivalent employees that came up with a
21 figure of \$59,611 in salary for the average wage per City
22 employee. And, last week, you seemed to be casting doubt.

23 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Mm-hmm. Well, I mean, if you
24 look at what I've got here -- I mean, we've got \$3 million --
25 let's see, \$3,384,254.80 going out in Human Resources, that's

1 half of the salaries that is going out. Okay? So that doesn't
2 include the administrative or the blue-collar workers. So --

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I -- I'm sorry. I don't
4 understand what you're saying. We had what going out?

5 COMMISSIONER KELSO: We've got \$3,384,254 going
6 out in annual salaries for Human Resources' --

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Oh --

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- salaries.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- oh --

10 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Okay?

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- for the Human Resource
12 Department.

13 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right. Okay?

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

15 COMMISSIONER KELSO: So that, in itself, is about
16 half of the salaries that is going out there. So, whenever you
17 look at the median for all of the City of Tucson workers, you're
18 not really looking -- because if you look down to the lower, you
19 know, again, you're looking at \$11.42 an hour, \$13.06 an hour, up
20 to \$13.81. Some people that have been around for 40 years are
21 making \$21; that they're not making these kind of salaries.

22 So those median mid-grades are not \$59,000, you know?
23 You've got to -- to -- incomes of people that are working in the
24 City and they don't make \$59,000.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Right. It's not median.

1 It's just a flat average.

2 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right. Mm-hmm. But whenever
3 you take all these large salaries --

4 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Right.

5 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- and then --

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: That certainly tends --

7 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- you take --

8 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- to bump it up.

9 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- exactly, that will bump it
10 up.

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah. Thoughts from other
12 Commissioners?

13 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I would want to see it, I
14 think, a little bit -- no offense -- a little bit more scientific
15 approach to that to see exactly what those numbers reflect.

16 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Mm-hmm. And, you know, I've
17 been working on it. I just don't have it all totally now.

18 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Is that something you could
19 provide for us?

20 MS. MESICH: And in what format would you want it?

21 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I guess --

22 MS. MESICH: What numbers do you --

23 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- well, I guess --

24 MS. MESICH: -- are you looking for?

25 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- what I'm thinking is

1 just based on what Mary's saying, is, you know, she's saying --
2 well, Mary, maybe you could explain it better. What -- what --
3 what value are you using?

4 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Well, maybe if -- I've got --
5 well, hold on.

6 MS. MESICH: If it's pages out of the budget book
7 --

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: This is my blue-collar list.

9 MS. MESICH: Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Okay? The dates --

11 MS. MESICH: So you did a Public Records Request
12 --

13 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

14 MS. MESICH: -- for the salaries?

15 COMMISSIONER KELSO: And this is their salaries.
16 Okay? And then this is the Human Resources list. Okay?

17 MS. MESICH: Okay.

18 COMMISSIONER KELSO: And their -- their salaries.
19 I'm still waiting for Administration and all them. So -- but
20 this is very time-consuming.

21 MS. MESICH: Yeah.

22 COMMISSIONER KELSO: So what I'm trying to do is
23 try to lay it out so that we can see, okay, we have employees
24 that are here for 52 years and they're still not up to their --
25 their -- because for 13 years they didn't get anything.

1 So this man is sitting here at the same salary,
2 stagnant for 52 years, you know? Well, not 52 years, but for the
3 last 13, you know? And this poor man should be retired. But, I
4 mean, it's just an example.

5 And then, you know, I'm trying to show that, you know,
6 it's your median range of people that have been here anywhere
7 from ten to 20 years that got hit the hardest; that they didn't
8 get any raises because they weren't -- they weren't involved in
9 any of the merit increases because those had stopped and because
10 of the constraints that the City of Tucson has been under; so
11 there was nothing for them and so they got hurt.

12 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So is your data exclusively
13 blue-collar employees?

14 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, I'm trying to get all of
15 them --

16 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. But --

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- so that we --

18 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- but --

19 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- can show -- this is --

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- that is --

21 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- just the --

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- blue --

23 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- blue collar.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- collar?

25 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yes.

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: What percent of the City
2 workforce is blue collar?

3 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I've got 600 right here.

4 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Six hundred --

5 COMMISSIONER KELSO: So --

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- individuals?

7 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- we have 1,000 -- how many?

8 MS. MESICH: Thirty --

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Well, this says there are
10 almost 4,500 full-time equivalent employees.

11 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I don't know how accurate it
12 is.

13 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I guess my point is: I agree
14 with you that the figures are being -- can be unfairly skewed
15 upward by a few people at the very top. But if you are focusing
16 only on blue collar in those papers you have, does that tend to
17 skew down --

18 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, I'm doing --

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- anything?

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- it all the way through so
21 that I can show that, okay, these -- this group -- because we got
22 new salaries that have been set up, up in this group. Okay?

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: The Human Resources --

24 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- Department?

1 COMMISSIONER KELSO: We have new positions that
2 were set up in here. Okay? We have new positions that were set
3 up in Administration, also, in this time that, you know, we've
4 been trying to get back on track. So I'm not understanding that.

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So what is the average salary
6 in the Human Resources Department?

7 COMMISSIONER KELSO: The average salary is
8 probably about \$48; because it goes from -- we've got \$71, \$60,
9 \$100, \$57, \$43, \$67, \$31, \$89, \$35, \$30; so maybe about \$50.

10 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So it's not grossly off from
11 the average salary of the City as a whole?

12 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, not as a whole because
13 that's what brought it up, you know, brought the average up.

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

15 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Just to clarify: What do
16 you mean? What -- what brought it up?

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: These larger salaries that
18 are up in this area like, you know, you're not going to find any
19 of these \$79,000 salaries over in this area. Okay? They're all
20 in the supervisory, which is understandable, we're going to have
21 those and you're going to have some maybe in Administration over
22 here; but, I mean, there's a lot of them in here that have been
23 created.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: But even by your figures, the
25 Mayor now makes less than the average employee in the Human

1 Resources Department?

2 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yes. Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Which may or may not be
4 relevant of anybody, but it's -- it's what -- what we have.

5 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right.

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: So if it's been 20 years
7 since the Mayor and Council received a salary increase, in those
8 20 years, how many -- how much -- percentage-wise, how much has a
9 City employ- -- what -- what percentage of an increase has a City
10 employee received over a 20-year period, you know, how many
11 times, you know, 2-1/2, what, last year?

12 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Two-and-a-half, 2, 1%.

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I mean, I wonder how much
14 it's gone up in those 20 years for the City employees --

15 COMMISSIONER KELSO: In that 20 years --

16 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- just as a comparison.

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- I couldn't tell you what
18 -- in the previous ten --

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah, it was a lot.

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- but I know they were doing
21 merit raises.

22 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Something else, yeah.

23 COMMISSIONER KELSO: So I don't know if they --

24 MS. MESICH: Up until --

25 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- were doing --

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 MS. MESICH: -- about 2007, there were merit
2 raises available.

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Okay.

4 COMMISSIONER KELSO: So I don't know if they did
5 actual across-the-board raises.

6 MS. MESICH: That's what we were trying to find in
7 the budget books --

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Oh, okay.

9 MS. MESICH: -- stored in the Records Center and
10 --

11 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Okay.

12 MS. MESICH: -- so that's tomorrow's project, but
13 I think that would be faster than asking HR to go back through;
14 because I'm not sure what type of records they have of strictly
15 COLAs versus merits --

16 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

17 MS. MESICH: -- and that kind of thing.

18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Well, Commissioner, you had
20 some figures for the past ten years last week, not for the City
21 but for the communities.

22 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Consumer Price Index,
23 inflation, and I think it was TUSD teachers' salaries --

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: And do you --

25 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- yeah.

1 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- have those with you?

2 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right here. They --

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Oh, okay.

4 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- they all -- they all ran
5 about 18 to 20% --

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: For ten years?

7 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- over a ten-year period.
8 The Consumer Price Index -- and, again, not a math major -- but,
9 roughly, you know, I think 18, 19%. And then the teachers'
10 salaries went from \$32 to a posted salary this year of \$39, which
11 was 20%, so -- over that ten-year period. And the inflation rate
12 was -- over that time period about a 20% increase. So that is
13 just roughly.

14 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I was just -- you know,
15 going back just a step if I can, Mr. Chair, to the Mesa/El Paso
16 comparison. I was just looking up here -- and, again, this is --
17 what I'm seeing online is -- at least for the Tucson Metro area
18 which is, I would assume, taking in, you know, everybody else --
19 but what they're saying -- that we were around \$48,600 as of two
20 years ago; and only El Paso, at \$43,000 a year, was lower in this
21 comparison body they had; and Mesa was at \$52,400 a year as a
22 median income, household income. So I give you some unofficial
23 comparisons as far as the communities go.

24 I sure would like to know more about how El Paso did so
25 well in the election that boosted their elected officials as much

1 as they did with that fairly low income.

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah. So does anyone have
3 any feeling about -- well, let me start with a premise -- and I
4 know this is not accurate for you, Commissioner, but -- and this
5 may not be accurate for the two of you. But if we were going to
6 propose a raise, how much a raise should we propose?

7 Now, I don't think we're going to propose -- even
8 though the cost of living and other metrics, if you have a
9 (unintelligible) of 20% in ten years -- and they haven't had a
10 raise in 20 years -- a 20% raise for -- for \$42,000 would be --

11 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: It's about \$49.

12 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- \$49.

13 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I think I do have that.

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: And I think, Commissioner,
15 you would argue that that's not going to get approved?

16 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So what do you think is fair
18 and that will get approved?

19 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Well, I -- I think, you know,
20 what they gave to the City of Tucson employees, you know, maybe
21 that's what we should offer to them, you know, the 2.5%, or the
22 -- 2.5 and the 2% or -- that's 4.5%.

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: But that's only what they
24 gave to them this year.

25 COMMISSIONER KELSO: They haven't given them

1 anything else for --

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: They haven't gotten any
3 raises in the past 20 years?

4 COMMISSIONER KELSO: They got a 1% --

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: They didn't get any merit --

6 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No.

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- in 20 years?

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No merit -- well, in 20
9 years, they might.

10 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Twenty years --

11 MS. MESICH: It's up --

12 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I don't know.

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- yeah.

14 MS. MESICH: -- until 2007.

15 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yeah --

16 MS. MESICH: So --

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- the merit, I -- I couldn't
18 tell you. But --

19 MS. MESICH: -- for the last --

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- there were no --

21 MS. MESICH: -- 12 years.

22 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- raises, you know, across
23 the board, no. And they got a 55-cent raise but it was taken
24 away by the insurance, you know, the insurance went up.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Well, yeah, but that's

1 something that the insurance goes up for the Mayor and Council,
2 too.

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I'm struggling --

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I know you're --

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- with some thought --

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- it's not easy.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- some thoughts here.

10 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

11 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Well, you know -- and just
12 -- again, just my thought, I know. But the inflation rate -- we
13 got a way to calculate it, it was 18- -- actually 18.2%. That
14 would be -- that would put the Mayor at about \$49,600. And for
15 that -- for that small amount, if you think about this: \$7,000,
16 roughly, a year, that's, basically, \$500 or \$600 a month.

17 If we're talking about 4.5 -- and no offense to what
18 you're saying --

19 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, not at all.

20 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- that's just so -- it's
21 so minimal, that -- that it almost doesn't matter.

22 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

23 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: For the City Council, at
24 18.2%, that would raise them to \$28,368, it's a \$364 a month
25 raise, which is, again, very minimal. If you look at what it

1 would cost the City to implement those raises, the net increase
2 would -- you'd never see it in the budget. It'd be so small. I
3 mean, we're not talking about a lot of money.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: But isn't it going to be sold
6 or aren't people opposed to it going to say, "A 20% raise?"

7 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Mm-hmm. No, I'd go up,
8 "That's 18.2."

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

10 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: But I get your point. I do
11 get your point, yes. They may, you know. If you put it in terms
12 of the dollars, you know, the real dollars that they're making
13 now versus what we propose, if you put it in that structure, it
14 might not be quite as hard to swallow.

15 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So do you think we ought to
16 give any consideration or minimal consideration to how saleable
17 this is?

18 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Absolutely.

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: And -- and that's -- my
21 point being in my mind: This is saleable.

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

23 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: These numbers are saleable.

24 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Mm-hmm.

25 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Any more than that, I don't

1 think is.

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I think if we exceed --

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

5 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- \$50,000 for the Mayor,
6 and we exceed \$30,000 for Council, it would -- then it's
7 untenable, they -- we won't --

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And I think --

9 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- it won't pass.

10 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- 18.2 is important to --
11 to highlight if we -- if, indeed, we went with a number like
12 that, it's not 20%, it's not just a number we're picking out of
13 the air. It's based on what you were just --

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Well, what is it --

15 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- talking about.

16 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- based on?

17 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: This was the inflation
18 rate.

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right. I mean, if -- if
20 -- whatever that number -- whatever number we can agree to, if we
21 can have that -- something to hang our hat on, whether it's for
22 that reason, or whatever reason we decide on --

23 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: What is -- just to -- well,
24 what -- what does 4.5% work out to? Let's see here.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Eighteen-point-two-percent is

1 the increase in the Consumer Price Index from when to when?

2 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Well -- well, we have the
3 Consumer Price Index actually in the file. And so, again, not
4 being a math major, what I did is I just took '07, which was
5 207.34 and compared it to 2018, which was 250.77, just did the
6 simple math and divided it, and it came out to 20%. Hopefully,
7 my math will reflect that again tonight. You're -- you're
8 probably better at this than I am.

9 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: No, no, worse -- worse than
10 it.

11 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Uh-oh.

12 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Let's see here. No, I
13 think it's about 18%. Excuse me.

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Where are those figures? Are
15 they --

16 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: They're under Tab No. 1.
17 And it says -- we got, "Salary History, Budget Information,
18 Community Profile, Consumer Price Index."

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And no matter what they're
20 getting, you -- I can just hear people saying, "When was the last
21 time I got an 18% raise, you know."

22 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Oh, absolutely.

23 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I mean, you know, that's
24 going to -- that's certainly going to -- whatever --

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah, but when was the last

1 time you went 20 years without a raise?

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Well, that's right. Yeah,
3 I mean, it -- Mr. Chair, it goes both ways.

4 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: So, if I'm good at math,
5 correctly, that's actually 20.9% --

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Mm-hmm. Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- Consumer Price Index
8 increase.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Oh, okay. I found what you
10 were talking about were, "Cumulative Inflation Rate from 2007 to
11 2017."

12 Do you have figures from 2009 to 2019?

13 MS. MESICH: We could look.

14 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: We have -- we have the
15 Consumer Price Index here for '09 through '18. It's --
16 Commissioner Kimble, it's here.

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Oh, oh, yes, yes. I
18 --

19 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: It's right in front of
20 Legal Opinion.

21 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: So that -- that, again,
23 that's not strictly the inflation rate. I -- I believe I just
24 looked up online what the inflation rate was during those years
25 and did the calculation; it kind of all tracked along the same

1 path.

2 There's such publicity of -- you know, for teachers, no
3 matter where they're teaching, California, Arizona, Colorado, and
4 I also looked at that, you know, just to see what's happening
5 with teachers and that was about 20%, also. So, between '09 and
6 -- '07 and '17, ten years.

7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I was just reading --
8 again, just to throw a little bit more into the mix to further
9 confuse the Chair -- (laughter) -- looking at El Paso's
10 successful election last year of the increases.

11 They went up to -- they -- City Council received a
12 \$16,300 pay increase, from \$29 to \$45,300. And they -- just
13 really briefly in here -- it was based on the median household
14 income, which is \$45,300, and that's what, apparently, just real
15 superficially --

16 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right.

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- they hung their hat on
18 as far as -- and it was like a 57%-to-43% approval rate on the --
19 in the election.

20 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: You have to wonder what the
21 impetus was to get the population to vote for that big of a pay
22 increase.

23 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

24 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Was it pride in the City of
25 El Paso? Is there a greater pride right now? I don't know.

1 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: (Unintelligible) may have
2 have had something to do with it. I don't know.

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: There you go.

4 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Didn't the minimum wage also
5 go up in Texas?

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Might have. I think I
7 remember something about that I think.

8 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: I think right before that
9 (unintelligible).

10 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: So if we did a -- and I
11 don't mean to interrupt anybody -- if we did a 4.5% increase for
12 the Council, it'd be about \$90 a month I believe. Let's see
13 here. Times 4.5% divided by 12, \$90 a month, versus an 18.2%,
14 you're -- I believe I said \$364.

15 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Now, what was that
16 percentage? Four --

17 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: That was -- 4.5 was the --
18 that's what Mary was talking about. And the 18.2 was kind of
19 based on the Consumer Price and inflation.

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Well, this CPI calculator I
21 found online -- this is nationwide from 2009 to 2018, which is
22 only nine years -- was 17.67, so it's in the same
23 (unintelligible).

24 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Mm-hmm. Correct.

25 It's hard for us to know what the voters are going to

1 vote for.

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: What they're going to say.
4 If we agree -- I mean, there's two -- there's two different ways
5 to look at this: Number one, you can say, "Here's what they
6 really deserve," and we would approach that -- approach it that
7 way and be -- and fail.

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Maybe.

9 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: And -- right. Exactly.
10 And here's another way, as you said, modest, you know,
11 a modest increase that would make a difference and maybe that
12 would pass. So -- but maybe they deserve more than that. So,
13 you know, are we going to go by principle or by reality?

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I think most people would
15 probably say both --

16 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Mm-hmm.

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- to some extent.

18 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Mm-hmm.

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Mm-hmm.

20 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right. If we can -- if we
21 can find that --

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah.

23 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- happy medium.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah. I should've spent more
25 time doing this today. But it would be nice if we could come up

1 with like some kind of a CPI Index for Arizona. This just said
2 there's not for Tucson, but there must be one for Arizona for the
3 last ten years and we could -- and I guess the argument would be:
4 They haven't had a raise in 20 -- we can't fix that.

5 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: We can go halfway to fix it.

7 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: No, I was also just thinking
8 about that, that the Legal Opinion was dated 2005, and before us
9 they were probably under the understanding that we weren't
10 allowed to advocate for an increase. I don't think you were
11 here, but we are able to do that now.

12 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Oh, okay.

13 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: I'm not saying we're going to
14 be champions of an increase for compensation, but I -- I think
15 that -- that could play a big part in how the vote might've
16 turned out in previous years.

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Getting civic --

18 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: City.

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- groups to support it
20 would be really important.

21 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Yeah.

22 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I mean it.

23 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: I'll ask.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So, Mary, what do you think
25 about this whole discussion? You don't agree with it? You see

1 --

2 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I --

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- some logic to it?

4 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- I see some logic to it,
5 but, you know -- and I really appreciate what you're saying about
6 the Price Index and about it going up. But you said that was a
7 joke, \$90.

8 Well, when a guy gets 35-cents on his check, you know,
9 that was a joke, too, that wasn't even 90 cents -- \$90 a month,
10 so that's a joke, too. So I kind of took offense to -- you know,
11 when we're comparing, you know -- I get they deserve it, but I
12 get that these guys deserve it, too. And I have to look at both
13 sides, you know?

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: But, I guess, the -- my
15 answer to that would be: That's not our charge.

16 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

17 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: If we were elected to
18 Council, then I think you have a good point where we ought to
19 start to raise this so that people at the bottom get more
20 percentage-wise and, you know, there's a lot of things that --
21 that we could do that's beyond our scope and our scope is only,
22 you know -- and other people are saying you ought to set some
23 conditions for them to get a raise --

24 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- and something has to be

1 done --

2 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No.

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- and that's not in our
4 scope.

5 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I mean, our scope is very
7 narrow.

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: We just have to recommend
10 salaries for the Mayor and Council.

11 COMMISSIONER KELSO: And, you -- you know, and I'm
12 also looking at the fact of what they have done and what they
13 have voted on, you know, in the past because I've been involved
14 for the last five years, you know, and what they've actually
15 committed to the City, you know? They've done a lot of good.
16 But I've seen them not do as much as I think they could have, you
17 know?

18 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: I think that's also very
19 circumstantial --

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Oh?

21 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: -- based on what's concerning
22 at the time. But, I don't know, I think that this would set a
23 precedent. I mean, you were saying that -- I don't know who
24 (unintelligible) but you said there was a 35-cent increase. Did
25 it take him 20 years to get that increase?

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Actually, it took him 13
2 years to get that increase.

3 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Interesting.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I mean, it's been tough
5 times in Tucson.

6 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Yeah --

7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah --

8 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- and --

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- we know. I mean --

10 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- City of Tucson employees
11 have --

12 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- it -- it has --

13 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- have stuck --

14 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- you know.

15 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- with it, you know. That's
16 why you've got 40-year employees here.

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: In 1999, times were good,
18 people were more, you know, at -- but, again, if you look at the
19 elections over the years, there were times that it was good and
20 they still didn't get the approval.

21 So, I -- I think what you're saying is accurate,
22 circumstantial as far as -- I mean, you're looking at the seven
23 people that are there now, what they've done or not done, and I
24 think it's important to --

25 COMMISSIONER KELSO: To spread --

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- sometimes set --

2 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- that --

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- that aside and say,
4 okay, we're looking at a little bit bigger picture --

5 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Right.

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- and trying to --

7 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I think you're --

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- do it --

9 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- absolutely right.

10 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- you know --

11 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I have to look at the whole
12 picture, you know, of --

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- it's a juggling act,
14 you know. And this Committee could be -- set for six months to
15 look at this -- and that'd probably be more appropriate than two
16 months -- we're supposed to piece something together, you know.

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Well (unintelligible; voices
18 overlap) --

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: It's not an easy task.

20 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- approve.

21 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- to be -- yeah, it's
22 kind of --

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Well, how about this: How
24 about for our meeting next week that whoever wants to come in
25 with a specific number and some justification --

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Mm-hmm. Yeah.

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- and I think you can come
3 in with a number, or you can say zero, but have some
4 justification for it. And your 18.2%, or whatever it was -- and
5 I'll do some research and I'll come up with a number I think and
6 --

7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah, get it to you.

8 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- mail them to you --
9 whatever you think is a relevant way to do it, let's come up --
10 everyone, if you can, come up with a number and come up with a
11 reason that you can explain to the rest of us why that should be
12 the number and maybe then we can get off the dime on this.

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I think it's a good idea.

14 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: But, again, we can't do
15 metrics because that's not our scope, right?

16 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: What do you mean? Well, we
17 can't say --

18 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Base it off --

19 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- it goes up more if the
20 City economy improves or something, no. It's got to be just the
21 raise.

22 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: That's all.

24 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Sounds good.

25 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I would just say this: I'm

1 not married to 18.2%; that's just -- that was just --

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Whatever you're married to --

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- statistically --
4 statistically that points in that direction. That's all.

5 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Sure.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah.

7 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I might rethink the whole
8 thing.

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: And, perhaps, the other
10 two members could be communicated to that maybe they could --
11 because it'd be -- I think they would both bring in interesting
12 perspectives as well.

13 COMMISSIONER KELSO: That's another thing.

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Do you want me to do that or
15 --

16 MS. FLORES: We can -- we can do that, so that way
17 it doesn't --

18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Right.

19 MS. FLORES: -- start --

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

21 MS. FLORES: -- that -- that wheel.

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: So you're --

23 MS. FLORES: And I was actually going to ask if
24 you wanted me to reach out --

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Sure.

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 MS. FLORES: -- and give them that direction --

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Sure.

3 MS. FLORES: -- for the next meeting.

4 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. So that's clear
5 enough, isn't it? It's not hard --

6 MS. FLORES: Yeah.

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- to explain --

8 MS. FLORES: Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- what we want there? Okay.
10 Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Commissioner Anderson, I
12 think you weren't here last week, right?

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: No, I wasn't.

14 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: And I thought Michael made
15 a good point and what we're talking about is -- and I think you
16 were kind of going that direction -- this is the CEO of Tucson
17 and the -- you know, people that are really, you know, they're
18 important for it to -- in leadership, in a leadership role. So
19 it's important I think to look at it that way, too, as to --

20 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Sure.

21 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- what their real role is.

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah. And, in coming up with
23 a number, I think all of us are both (sic) going to have to take
24 into account what we think is appropriate and also what we think
25 we can sell to people; because there is no point in saying they

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 ought to get a 75% raise --

2 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right.

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- even if you think that
4 because that's DOA.

5 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Exactly. Agreed.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Any more discussion on this?
7 I've lost my Agenda.

8 MS. MESICH: Mr. Chair, could I ask if you do want
9 us to continue to look for those budget figures --

10 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: What budget --

11 MS. MESICH: -- specific --

12 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- figures don't --

13 MS. MESICH: -- to raises and how many raises
14 employees have gotten over the last 20 years?

15 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: On the scale of one to ten,
16 what's the difficulty while we're doing this?

17 MS. MESICH: Nine-point-eight. So --

18 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I would say no.

19 MS. MESICH: It's --

20 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah.

21 MS. MESICH: -- just very time-consuming.

22 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah.

23 MS. MESICH: So --

24 COMMISSIONER KELSO: It is time-consuming.

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Unless someone disagrees, I

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 would --

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah --

3 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Yeah.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: -- not necessary.

5 MS. MESICH: Thank you. That will help.

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Call to the Audience.

7 I don't see anyone named clamoring to speak.

8 Future Meetings. We're meeting the next three Mondays;
9 is that correct?

10 MS. FLORES: Correct.

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: And we are meeting?

12 MS. FLORES: So, next Monday, the 25th, we are
13 meeting at the Patrick K. Hardesty Multi-Service Center --

14 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Twenty-Second and Alvernon.

15 MS. FLORES: -- 22nd and Alvernon.

16 March 4th, we're meeting at City Hall with the laptop
17 because -- see if you guys are ready to start your
18 recommendation.

19 And then a tentative of March 11th, which was
20 originally scheduled for this location, but I think we might want
21 to do that at City Hall as well if you haven't finished your
22 recommendation; that way we have access to the printers and the
23 laptop as well.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Is that okay with everybody,
25 the meeting locations?

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Sorry. So we don't have a
2 meeting on the 25th or 26th?

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yes, we have one on the --

4 MS. FLORES: On the 25th --

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- 25th.

6 MS. FLORES: -- Monday, the 25th.

7 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Twenty-fifth. Okay.

8 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: That's the one at the
9 Hardesty Center.

10 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Anything else?

12 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: I feel that -- like if --
13 that maybe I should apologize if you took it the wrong way --

14 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, not at all.

15 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- for -- for the record, I
16 didn't mean to offend you in any way --

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: You --

18 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- so that --

19 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- nobody needs to apologize
20 to me for anything, trust me. I've got very, very thick skin.

21 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: It wasn't meant to be.

22 COMMISSIONER KELSO: No, not at all. I love to
23 disagree.

24 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. Is there a Motion to
25 Adjourn?

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Did everybody see the
2 commentary that was passed around?

3 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: The two comments?

4 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Yeah.

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah.

6 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: I was just making sure.

7 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Interesting.

8 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Yeah. And we were talking
9 about we did have a meeting east of Alvernon and south of 22nd.

10 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Mm-hmm. Yeah.

11 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Yeah, that's why I said it
12 was interesting.

13 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: They're always south of 22nd.
14 Always south of 22nd.

15 COMMISSIONER KELSO: I make a --

16 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay.

17 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- Motion to Adjourn the
18 meeting.

19 COMMISSIONER PEREZ: Second that motion.

20 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: All those in favor.

21 (Carried by a Commission voice vote of 5 to 0
22 [Commissioner Guymon and Vice Chairperson Salcedo being absent].)

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Anyone opposed?

24 (No response.)

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: Okay. See you next Monday at

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 6:00 at the Hardesty Center.

2 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: We will see you at 8:00
3 o'clock.

4 COMMISSIONER KELSO: Oh, yeah --

5 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: We'll see you --

6 COMMISSIONER KELSO: -- 8:00 o'clock a.m.

7 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: -- at 8:00 o'clock Monday.

8 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Yes.

9 COMMISSIONER KELSO: That's Monday --

10 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Right.

11 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- yeah.

12 MS. MESICH: Definitely --

13 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Now, if we --

14 MS. MESICH: -- get that email confirmation to
15 you.

16 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- if we come up with some
17 specific questions, should we send them to you so you can
18 distribute them to the other Commissioners instead of --

19 MS. MESICH: We'd probably --

20 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: -- communicating directly?

21 MS. MESICH: -- like to see them in advance if
22 there are any, right?

23 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: We would?

24 MS. MESICH: Would you?

25 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: No.

City of Tucson - Citizens' Commission on
Public Service and Compensation Meeting - 2/19/2019

1 MS. MESICH: Okay.

2 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: I thought you said -- you
3 meant the Mayor would like to see them.

4 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: No, if I -- if I present --
5 come up with a couple questions, would you like to see them?

6 CHAIRPERSON KIMBLE: No.

7 COMMISSIONER SITZMAN: Okay. Very good. No
8 problem.

9 (The meeting was adjourned at 7:00 p.m.)

10 * * * * *

