

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

Minutes

Thursday, April 11, 2019

Basement (Lower Level) Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library, 101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:00 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Arthur Stables (Acting Chair), Jim Sauer, Michael Becherer, Helen Erickson, Sharon Chadwick and Jill Jenkins

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Terry Majewski

Staff Members Present: Jodie Brown, Andrew Connor, John Beall (PDSD) and Crystal Dillahunty (Ward VI)

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 1-24-19

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0, to approve the Legal Action Report from meeting of 3-28-19.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/ Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

- a. HPZ-19-10 – Marshall Foundation-Geronimo Plaza Shade Structure/Patio Addition– 820 East University Boulevard - (West University Historic Preservation Zone)**

Staff Brown summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) meeting of 2-19-19.

Project architect Cindy Hogan from CDG Architects presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval of the project as presented, noting, (1) the design of the roof shelter shall be light in structure; (2) the fence shall be as transparent as possible; (3) the same recommendations presented by West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) (a) Remove scroll ornamentation at top of columns. Such ornamentation does not comply with West University Neighborhood design guidelines; (b) Scale and massing of the outdoor metal storage element does not complement the existing historic building or new awning design. Rolling shutters are not allowed per West University Neighborhood design guidelines. Remove and replace with a lower scale display element; (c) East columns for awning/shade structure not shown. Show and coordinate the location of these columns with the back bar.

- b. HPZ-19-15- Olympus Holdings, LLC-La Suprema Building /Adaptive Re-Use to Offices– 319 W Simpson Street - (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone)**

Staff Brown summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) meeting of 3-11-19.

Project architect Bob Lanning with Lanning Architecture and attorney Tim Kinney presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval of the revisions to the project as presented, noting (1) that there is a differentiation of material at the sidewalk to wall connection. The motion was amended and the second agreed to include that the differentiation would allow the adobe to breathe.

- c. HPZ-19-17- Schindler Residence- Demolition, Basement Addition to Main House; Detached Garage/New Construction– 733 S 3rd Avenue-(Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)**

Staff Brown summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 3-19-19.

Project architect, Michael Ritzenthaler with Organic Architecture Systems, LLC., presented the plans.

Discussion was held.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval with the following conditions from APHZAB (1) Tucson Historic Preservation Office must determine that the garage and existing addition to be non-contributing before issuance of a demolition permit; (2) windows on proposed addition should be side-by-side, wood double hung (single post between) to match existing (except the wood casement and double hung wood dormer window which are approved as presented); (3) wood folding doors on basement should have a single light fenestration rather than multi paned fenestration in keeping with the style and age of the structure, subject to review at the PRS; (4) Repair and replace (as needed) original stucco and finish on the principal historic structure (new finish on the addition approved); (5) reduced setbacks as presented are approved; and (6) return to the APHZAB for minor reviews if required for a) egress issues from the basement area requiring design modifications, or b) modification of the opening size/dimensions/proportions of approved windows on the proposed addition if they need to be modified for access issues. Additionally, the subcommittee recommended that the ridge of the dormer sits below the ridge of the addition and that the proposed metal roof shall be painted.

4. Rio Nuevo Area and Historic Landmark Sign Review Cases

UDC Sections 5.8; 5.12.7 & 7A.10.5/TSM 9-02.0/Historic Landmark Signs (HLS)

HLS-19-01/HPZ-19-28 – Lemonds Holdings LLC- “Diving Girl” Change of Copy to an Adaptive Reuse of Non-Character Defining Text on a Panel of a Designated Historic Landmark Sign; 8 sq. ft. Panel Change of Tenant Name in New Neon/Color [From “Piccarreta Davis” to “Aveda Institute”]- 145 South 6th Avenue-(Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core, Infill Incentive District)

Staff Connor summarized the project and the review process.

Jude Cook, from Signmaker, presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval of the project as presented.

5. **Courtesy Review**

Tucson Convention Center (TCC) Hotel - An Informational Presentation and Feedback-No Action Required-260/280 South Church Avenue- (Rio Nuevo Area /Downtown Core, Infill Incentive District)

Staff Brown and Beall summarized the project and the review process.

Project architect, Ed Marley, from Swaim Associates, and Eric Barrett from ARC Studios presented the project.

Discussion was held. Commissioner Erickson requested that the project team meet with the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Historic Landscapes Subcommittee to discuss the planting plan. Commissioner Stables asked that the project team consider more horizontal elements to reduce the scale of the building. The subcommittee requested that they be consulted earlier in the process to provide more meaningful feedback. Staff Beall agreed to investigate further the relationship of PADs and historic preservation overlays and report his findings to the subcommittee.

5. **Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff provided an update on zoning violations

d. Review Process Issues/Discussion

Staff provided information on the recent Mayor and Council action to remove the chair of the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board.

e. Front Yard Swimming Pools in Historic Districts-Update from Historic Preservation Officer/Letter/Discussions

Staff provided an update on the recent meeting with neighborhood representatives, Ward 3 and Ward 6 to discuss front yard pools.

- f. Impacts of Proposed Rule Change on Regulations for National Register Nominations

Staff provided information on the proposed changes to the rules that govern National Register nominations.

6. **Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

John Burr had some concerns about the proposed process changes regarding the advisory boards.

7. **Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings**

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS.

8. **Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:50 P.M.