



Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board
Monday, June 10, 2019 at 4:00PM
Joel D. Valdez Main Library
Santa Rita Room
2nd Floor
101 North Stone Avenue
Tucson, Arizona 85701

Legal Action Report/Minutes

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Members present: Karen Costello (chair), Joseph Patterson (vice chair), Paul Horbatt, Mary Lou Heuett. A quorum was established and the meeting was called to order at 4:02PM.

2. Approval of Legal Action Report/Minutes—May 30, 2019

Patterson made a motion to move the approval of the minutes to the next BHHZAB meeting due to members not reviewing the minutes prior to the meeting. Costello seconded the motion. Motion passed 3-0-1 (Heuett abstained as she was not present at the May 30th meeting).

3. Call to the Audience

None.

4. Reviews

a. HPZ 19-37, 508 W. 18th St.

Construction of a new single family home. One wall of the historic home remaining. (Code Violation)
Full Review

The applicant, Troy Williams, provided a presentation on changes that had been made to the plans based on the May 30, 2019 meeting. Changes included the addition of the brick coping at the parapet, change of fixed windows to double hung windows and the removal of the carport on the east side of the property.

The board members were concerned about parking on the east side of the property. The carport was removed, but the fencing remained and parking would still be placed on the east side. The board had previously suggested that parking be placed on the west side off of 11th Avenue and if possible that the addition be shifted to the east. The applicant explained that there was a tree at the corner of 11th Avenue and 18th Street that the property owner wanted to maintain. The board explained that while the design guidelines indicate that parking should be at the rear or at the side, the preference is for the rear.

The board also indicated that the windows were not drawn correctly. When viewing the photos one of the windows is taller than the others. On the plans all of the photos are shown equally.

The board had questions about notes on the plans that indicate sliding glass doors and glass block. The applicant explained the notes were a requirement of the City of Tucson and those items would not be used on the house.

Additional questions by the board include placement of the HVAC. The applicant indicated that mechanical had not yet been drawn, but assured the board members that it would not be visible. Continuing the conversation the board members asked about the height of the parapet and was informed that it was 2'. The board stated that added screening for the HVAC was not acceptable.

Horbatt made a motion to deny the project. Heuett seconded the motion. The vote on the motion was 3-1 with Patterson against the motion. Patterson was unclear on the grounds that the project was being denied.

The motion was amended by Horbatt to include additional information on why the project was being denied. Reasons for denial included that the applicant did not take the board recommendations on parking on the west side and not the east side, the windows have not been drawn correctly, and it cannot be guaranteed that the HVAC will not be seen without screening. Heuett seconded the amended motion. The motion passed 4-0 to deny the proposal.

b. HPZ 19-47, 530 S. 9th Ave.

Construction of a new addition (master bedroom/bath) to a single family residence. Change from asphalt to corrugated steel roof. Change from chain link to corrugated steel fence. Repair and replace windows.
Full review

The applicant, Mark Donatelli, provided a presentation on the proposed project. The project includes a new rear addition attached to an existing rear addition, the replacement of the of an existing asphalt shingle roof to a corrugate metal roof, the change from an existing chain link fence to a steel fence, and the replacement of the windows.

The board had several questions about the project. They had concern about the proposed south side windows and why they were small. The applicant explained that the particular windows were located in the master bedroom and that they were very close to the neighboring property. The proposed windows are not visible.

Board members asked if the east (front) elevation was going to be modified and the applicant explained that it would be repaired but not changed. The applicant indicated that a new small gable vent would be added to the front façade. The board asked for clarification on the sliding glass doors. The applicant indicated that the doors in question were going to be French doors. The applicant also indicated that all doors and windows on the existing house would be replaced. The applicant provided information on the type of doors and windows. The board asked if the corrugated metal roof was galvanized. The applicant noted that it would be patinaed.

Patterson made a motion to recommend approval of the proposed project. Horbatt seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

6. Future Agenda Items

Patterson requested that a future agenda item involve an informational session with 2 local architects and a builder to discuss their experience.

7. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:17PM.