

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

Minutes

Thursday, July 11 2019

**Basement (Lower Level) Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:00 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Jim Sauer, Michael Becherer, Helen Erickson, Jan Mulder, and Sharon Chadwick

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Jill Jenkins

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, Maria Gayosso, John Beal, Nick Ross, and Michael Kat (PDSD); Derek Hicks (University of Arizona, Student Intern); and Crystal Dillahunty (Ward 6).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 6-20-19

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0, to approve as submitted, the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 6-20-19.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/ Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

HPZ-19-47 Davis Residence—Construction of a new addition (master bedroom/bath) to a single family home. Change from asphalt to corrugated steel roof. Change from chain link to corrugated steel fence. Repair and replace windows. – 530 South 9th Avenue - (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) meeting of 6-10-19.

Mark Donatelli from Barrio Properties LLC presented the project. Mr. Donatelli discussed the concerns of the BHHZAB and responded to inquiries from the subcommittee.

Subcommittee had several concerns related to the overall project. In particular, the lack of consistency in the drawings and insufficient keynotes from staff and the one presented; the configuration of the roofline on the existing and new addition; differentiation between the new and old roofing; window and door sizes; addition of false gable vent to the front façade; proposed fence location and material; lack of distinction between the old and new addition; use of expansion joint between additions; location and size of French door; and exact date of construction of existing rear addition. Subcommittee provided additional guidance to applicant on how to satisfy these concerns.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend that the project be returned to the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) and Plans Review Subcommittee (PRS) for further review. The subcommittee requested that the applicant address the concerns raised at this meeting, including but not limited to: (1) provide consistent drawings; (2) provide clarification on the date of construction of existing rear addition by verifying from Sanborn maps; (3) resolve the roofline configuration between the existing building and proposed new addition; (4) roofline on proposed new addition to be lower than that of the contributing building; (5) remove false gable seen on front facade; (6) clarify location and materials for proposed fencing; (7) clarify location and size of French door; (8) call out all doors and windows including materials on elevations; (9) distinguish new from old with an offset not an expansion joint.

4. Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases

UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

IID-19-01//HPZ-19-54 – Equilibrium Real Estate Investments (EQ): Rehabilitation/Adaptive Re-Use of bungalow styled Chambers House (Contributor to Barrio Libre Historic District). Review per Secretary of Interior's Guidelines; Demolish and replace an existing auto repair garage/shade structures and storage building with new multi-use development comprising of single family units and retail. Review for compatibility with adjacent historic structures – 18th & 28 West 18th Street- (Downtown Infill Incentive District)

Staff Taku informed the subcommittee that at the request of the applicant the case will be scheduled for a future review.

No discussion was held. No action taken.

RNA/DRB-19-11/HPZ-19-55 Indian Trading Post : Exterior renovations, new first-floor steel sash storefronts for restaurant; new second-floor single-hung metal clad wood windows for offices; stucco (clean & patch); repaint with similar colors; new elevators; new stairs; new roof; structural improvements; replace sidewalks with combination of concrete and pavers - 72 East Congress Street-(Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District)

Staff Brown provided an overview of the project including the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) concerns and recommendations. Staff stated that the applicant will be presenting for Design Review Board (DRB) on 7-12-19 as part of the review and recommendation process.

Andy Karic from Bourn Companies along with Bill Gansline from Gansline & Associates presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval as presented, noting: (1) the westernmost bay on the north facade have same treatment as the two adjacent bays, having a solid panel at the bottom of the storefront; (2) it is left to the applicant to choose between full glass doors, or doors with solid base as presented; and (3) it is also left to the applicant, but they are encouraged to see if they are able to preserve some of the existing tile in the southernmost bay on the Scott Avenue elevation.

Note: Bathroom break at 2:27 P.M. and reconvened at 2:30 P.M.

5. Historic Landmark Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8.5 & 5.8.6

HL-19-02 –Proposed Historic Landmark (HL) Designation: “Benedictine Monastery.” PRS review to recommend approval or denial of the nomination proposal to the PDSO Director. -800 North Country Club Road (Poster Frost Mirto, Inc.)

Staff Taku summarized the steps to establish a Historic Landmark as a two-part process. First, application is reviewed by the HPO and PDSB with a recommendation to TPCHC PRS to formally consider the nomination. PRS votes to recommend approval or denial of the nomination. If approved, applicant gets a recommendation letter from PDSB Director. This letter acts as a formal notification that the nomination proposal has been recommended for approval, and the applicant may proceed with the submittal of the HL rezoning application and materials. Second, the application and nomination materials are reviewed by the Zoning Examiner (ZE) in a public hearing for a change of zoning. The ZE forwards a recommendation to the Mayor and Council (MC). The MC makes a decision on the HL designation and change of zoning. Additionally, if designated, the site will be within a proposed Planned Area Development (PAD).

Staff Brown reviewed and commented on the application to ensure compliance with eligibility criteria and completeness for the definition of an HL and the Standards for Establishing HLs as provided in the UDC.

Nomination preparer, Jennifer Levstik from Logan Simpson and project architect Savannah McDonald from Poster Frost Mirto, Inc. presented the nomination proposal to the subcommittee.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee asked for some clarifications, which were provided. Subcommittee complimented the preparer for a thorough application submittal, especially the quality, clarity, and detail of the nomination proposal.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval of the nomination proposal as an HL as presented.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff updated on compliance reviews in West University and the Barrio and possible violations in the Barrio for addition of canales at convent/17th Street and rooftop mechanical unit and new double door opening along the west elevation at 746 S Osborne Avenue.

d. Review Process Issues

Staff discussed upcoming combined Historic Zone Advisory Boards training, with date and time to be determined.

Chair Majewski requested volunteers to review proposed National Register Nominations that are being submitted by Pima County to the Historic Sites Review Committee for review later this month. Commissioner Erickson volunteered to review the Tucson Mountain Park nomination. Commissioner Chadwick volunteered for the Johnson House Viewpoint nomination.

7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

John Burr mentioned resignations and appointments in Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board and review of revised Design Guidelines.

8. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next meeting will be 7-25-19. Commissioners Majewski and Becherer out of town for the next review meeting.

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:52 P.M.