

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, August 22, 2019

**Basement (Lower Level) Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

1. **Call to Order and Roll Call**

Meeting called to order at 1:03 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Michael Becherer, Jill Jenkins
Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson, and Jan Mulder

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Sharon Chadwick

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Maria Gayosso (PDSD), and Crystal
Dillahunty (Ward 6).

2. **Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 8-08-19**

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner
Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to approve the Legal Action Report
from the meeting of 8-08-19, as submitted.

3. **Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised
Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

HPZ 19-67- Bachman-Williams Family Rev. Trust – Demolish an existing
sleeping porch, add new stairs, change roof materials from existing
wooden shingles to either wood shingles or stamped metal shingles or
standing seam metal roof, replace windows, add new steps and railing
and porch screen with a screen door – 337 S 4th Avenue - (Armory Park
Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the
recommendation from the APHZAB meeting of 8-20-19. **Note:** staff
suggested and subcommittee concurred that this case be taken out of
order as applicant on first case was not ready.

Property owners, David and Sarah Bachman-Williams presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend that the case be continued to allow the applicants to respond to the issues raised in discussion today, in particular to: (1) provide more information on the proposed stairs and railings on the north and southeast sides of the building; (2) provide more information on the proposed fence; (3) clarify the proposed window materials (wood vs. wood clad); (4) provide more information on the proposed demolition, which may require a different review process; and (5) provide more information on the door labeled as "New Door" on the east facade.

HPZ 19-48- Murphy Residence – Remodel of Primary Residence, New Additions [Revision to Plan to attach a Studio to a Non-Contributing Resource] – 637 N 6th Avenue -- (West University Historic Preservation Zone). **Clarification:** Original agenda listed this property as a Contributing Resource. The property is a Non-Contributing Resource.

Staff Taku summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) meeting of 8-20-19.

Property owners, Alex and Rob Murphy presented the project.

Discussion was on lack of appropriate documentation on for Development Zone for compatibility review, lack of historic context photos; height with same roof type; design detail, and materials. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend that the case be continued to allow the applicant the opportunity to provide PRS with more information about the historic context and design details.

HPZ 19-72- Lee Residence – Demolish an existing accessory structure located at the rear of a contributing building– 419 S 5th Avenue- (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku advised that case not ready for review

No action taken.

4. **Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases**

UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

IID-19-07//HPZ-19-62 – The Station on 6th Avenue LLC- Microbrewery- Pueblo Vida: Rehabilitation/Adaptive Re-Use of existing tire shop/automobile mechanic shop and an existing historic building (Contributor to Armory Park Historic District). Restaurant and microbrewery accessory storage use; construct a new restroom building and two new patios. Review for compatibility with adjacent historic structures and per Secretary of Interior’s Guidelines – 901 South 6th Avenue- (Downtown Infill Incentive District).

Staff Taku advised that the case was not ready for review.

No action taken.

IID-18-05/HPZ-19-66 – New Coffee Shop: Presta Coffee Roasters – Compliance review for existing exterior modifications without appropriate review process. No exterior changes are proposed to existing. Review for compatibility with adjacent historic structures [Contributor, Iron Horse Expansion District] – 501 E 9th Street - (Downtown Infill Incentive District).

Staff Taku and Gayosso provided an overview of the project. Staff commended the applicant for documenting and providing detailed plans on all exterior modifications to the historic building. Staff Taku read into the record the City’s Design Professional’s comments recommending approval of the project.

Project architect, Jenni Van Brocklin, from Repp McLain Design and Construction presented the project

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval as presented, noting that owner be required to restore the crenellations and chamfers on the canopy at the corner of the site for compatibility with the historic fabric.

5. **Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

- a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park (solar roof panels). New review at 516 S 5th Avenue. Commissioner Jenkins volunteered.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff updated on the status of violation in the Barrio for addition of canales and light fixtures at Convent/17th Street and new double door opening along the west elevation at 746 S. Osborne Avenue.

d. Review Process Issues: Staff will send a poll on rescheduling PRS from 9-12-19 to 9-19-19.

6. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

John Burr updated on Revisions to Armory Park Design Guidelines, Intent of HPZ maximum height of 48 feet to be clarified by Mayor and Council. The Temple of Music addition does count for its height.

7. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting will be 9-12-19 or 9-19-19 depending on responses from PRS members.

8. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:39 P.M.