



Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board
Tuesday, September 17, 2019
Parish Hall, St. Andrew's Church
545 S. 5th Avenue
E. 16th Street and S. 5th Avenue
Tucson, Arizona

Legal Action Report/Meeting Minutes

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 6:33pm. A quorum was initially established with nine board members present: Ms. S. Bachman-Williams, Mr. J. Burr, Ms. P. Factor, Mr. G. Furnier, Mr. S. Grede, Ms. M. McClements, Mr. P. O'Brien, Mr. M. Roberts and Ms. G. Schau. (Mr. M. Crum joined the meeting at 6:44 pm, following item 2.) Absent: Mr. T. Beal.

2. Approval of Minutes

Action Taken: A motion was made by Ms. Factor to approve the meeting minutes as presented, seconded by Mr. Roberts. Nine votes in favor: Ms. S. Bachman-Williams, Mr. J. Burr, Ms. P. Factor, Mr. G. Furnier, Mr. S. Grede, Ms. M. McClements, Mr. P. O'Brien, Mr. M. Roberts and Ms. G. Schau.

3. Call to the Audience

None.

4. Reviews

a. HPZ 19-76, 720 S. 5th Avenue

Demolish an existing (non contributing) detached accessory ramada, paint apartment complex exterior walls, fascia, railings, pool area fences and gates; repair and restore windows and doors. Full Review/Non-Contributing Resource/Estimated time: 30 minutes.

Mr. Katz, the architect/builder presented his latest version of the project. The project was initially presented during a courtesy review on 7-16-19 (see LAR). The project is now scaled down and is largely an exterior finish restoration and repair, but the information is now provided for the review of the demolition of the 1980's or later ramada in the pool area which is in disrepair. At this time, no replacement is envisioned. The palm trees on site will be retained. Mr. Katz believes nearly all doors, windows, and screen doors can be repaired rather than replaced. He believed any replacements could be duplicated if necessary.

The board had very few questions or discussion because of the fairly straightforward nature of the project as presented. Mr. Roberts recused himself on the item, as an adjacent property owner.

Action Taken: The board recommends the project as presented including the ramada demolition and restorations/painting of the primary structure/elements, noting that any necessary replacements will be made in kind to match existing.

Motion made by Mr. J. Burr, seconded by Mr. S. Grede. Nine votes in favor: Ms. S. Bachman-Williams, Mr. J. Burr, Mr. M. Crum, Ms. P. Factor, Mr. G. Furnier, Mr. S. Grede, Ms. M. McClements, Mr. P. O'Brien and Ms. G. Schau. One abstention via recusal, Mr. M. Roberts.

b. HPZ 19-78, 524 S. Herbert Avenue

Rehabilitation of an existing building: new stucco, roof repairs and shingle replacement, fencing and gates; repair and restore windows and doors; new rear addition. Full Review/Contributing Resource/Estimated time: 20 minutes.

Mr. Dennis Gonzalez, builder/representative of the family estate which owns the property, (and 526 S Herbert Ave., which was reviewed separately on 1-15-19 (see LAR), presented an overview of the project. A design narrative, area photographs, site plan and elevations were shown. Mr. Gonzales conceptualized the project as a renovation of the existing building, with a new smaller rear addition and porch and a partial roof extension as a parapeted roof over the larger building starting about 2-3 feet west of the principal gable (height 17'3"), to incorporate the addition. He plans on replacing the windows and doors. The project includes new and replacement stucco to match existing finish and color. He noted that the new roof line height will now match a building to the north (518-20 S. Herbert Ave) that was similarly remodeled and extended sometime in the past. Setbacks would be 5' east, 0' north, 8" south, and 20'10" west. Utility relocations will be to the south side facade.

The board was concerned about the window and door replacements, noting that the wood doors illustrated on the elevations have no contextual relationship to the historic building/style/age. Similarly the window replacements proposed are for a modified form of the original 2 over two wood double hung windows. All new windows were proposed to be horizontally sliding Jeldwen vinyl windows with wood exterior trim, which are not compatible with the code/guidelines. The board noted that all replacements should match the remaining original 2/2 window, and new windows should be compatible vertical openings with appropriate materials.

The board noted that the project actually appears to involve substantial demolition of the existing contributing structure with replacements and that a demolition plan would be needed for further review. It was of concern of how much of the historic fabric would remain. It appeared that only the front wall and a portion of the two front sidewalls would be retained. All interior (adobe/other) walls were to be demolished. All replacements would be framed stucco.

The roof profile was discussed. The current plan is to add a new roof in parapet form with flat rolled roofing on top of the remaining building about 2 to 3 feet back

from the front ridge gable, to a height of about 15'. Only the southern portion of the current eave line would be retained within the new wall/reconstruction.

The site utilization was also discussed. The replacement of all but 16' of the north wall would now push the new building/addition to the north property line, up against the adjacent property building wall. Currently most of the existing rear portion of the building is set back 2'9" from that property line. The southern property line is 0 to 8 inches and appears problematic for a new proposed door and bedroom window, exterior stairs and new utility connections. Mr. Gonzales noted that he owns the adjacent property.

The western portion of the lot will only be accessible from the interior of the new structure. The board noted that the proposed building is now substantially larger than the original dwelling (1106 sq. ft.) and also to the house to the north, and would be only about 3 feet away from the structure at 526 S. Herbert. The proportion of new to original appears to be largely over-scaled. The project envisions about 70% (1945 sq.ft.) coverage of the 2842 sq.ft. lot. Mr. Gonzalez countered that his intent was to develop a 3 bedroom, 2 bath house on the site.

Action Taken: The board motioned for a continuance for the applicant to revise the project to address concerns about context, scale, form, details, site utilization and to provide a demolition plan to show what historic fabric is proposed to be removed and to show the existing (and proposed) setbacks and how they relate to the adjacent properties.

Motion made by Mr. S. Grede, seconded by Mr. M. Crum. Ten votes in favor: Ms. S. Bachman-Williams, Mr. J. Burr, Mr. M. Crum, Ms. P. Factor, Mr. G. Furnier, Mr. S. Grede, Ms. M. McClements, Mr. P. O'Brien, Mr. M. Roberts and Ms. G. Schau.

5. Design Guidelines Project

a. Update on the design guidelines

Mr. Taylor noted that the current edition, V5.3 went to Ms. Brown, HPO, and PRS members for review earlier in the month. It includes new Armory Park specific illustrations and final edits. It will be reviewed on 9-19-19 at PRS. A final edit incorporating their suggestions may be needed.

6. Minor Review Update

a. Updates on recent Minor Reviews provided

One minor review at Arizona and 17th approved a new fence.

7. Call to the Board

Mr Burr noted that M&C had voted to initiate a rezoning for the 375 S. Stone Ave. parcels earlier in the day. He provided a brief overview of where that rezoning is currently. He noted that a special APHZAB meeting will be needed on October 1st to review changes to the 375 S. Stone project/ rezoning. A Neighborhood Meeting will be

just prior, same date. It's anticipated it will be also be at St. Andrew's. Ms. McClements confirmed a quorum will be available for the special meeting.

8. Call to the Audience

Historic Zone Advisory Board Training Wednesday, September 25th at 4 pm. For those that did not attend on 9-14, it is mandatory.

9. Future Agenda Items-Information Only

Revised IID proposal at 375 S. Stone to be discussed at October 1 Special Meeting. The next regular APHZAB meeting will be October 15, 2019.

7. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 7:49pm.