

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, October 24, 2019

**Basement (Lower Level) Meeting Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:03 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Jim Sauer (Acting Chair), Michael Becherer, Sharon Chadwick, and Jan Mulder.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Terry Majewski, Helen Erickson, and Jill Jenkins.

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Allison Diehl, and Jodie Brown (PDSD), Crystal Dillahunty (Ward 6).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 10-10-19

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 10-10-19 with a correction to replace the word “windows” with “doors” on item #6.a (Minor Reviews).

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines

HPZ 19-48 - Murphy Residence – Remodel of Primary Residence, New Additions [Revision to Plan at attach Studio to a Non-Contributing Resource. [Continued Case from 8/22/19] – 637 N 6th Avenue – (West University Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the WUHZAB meeting of 9-17-19 and stated review comments from the PRS meeting of 8-22-19 as follows: lack of

appropriate documentation on Development Zone for compatibility review; lack of historic context photos; height with same roof type; design detail; and materials.

Property owner Alex Murphy presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented with the following conditions: (1) zero building setback on the north property line to be waived upon demonstration by applicant to city staff as prevailing; (2) roof material to be asphalt shingles as presented; and (3) roof pitch of new roofs to be of the same or less steep pitch than the contributing property directly south of the subject property, to be determined by the applicant and confirmed by city staff.

HPZ- 19-67 - Bachman-Williams Family Rev. Trust – Demolish an existing sleeping porch, add new stairs, change roof materials from existing wooden shingles to either wood shingles or stamped metal shingles or standing seam metal roof, replace windows, add new steps and railing and porch screen with a screen door. [Contributing Resource- [Continued Case from 8/22/19] – 337 S. 4th Avenue- (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the APHZAB meeting of 8-20-19 and review comments from the PRS meeting of 8-22-19 as follows: (1) provide more information on the proposed stairs and railings on the north and southeast sides of the building; (2) provide more information on the proposed fence; (3) clarify the proposed window materials (wood vs. wood clad); (4) provide more information on the proposed demolition, which may require a different review process; and (5) provide more information on the door labeled as "New Door" on the east facade.

Property owners, David and Sarah Bachman-Williams presented the revisions to the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and passed by a voice vote of 3-1 (Chadwick dissented, citing concerns with metal roof and with the demolition of historic porch) to recommend approval with the following conditions: (1) proposed stamped metal roof shingles are recommended for approval; (2) replacement windows are to be solid wood per Armory Park Historic Zone

(APHZ) Design Guidelines, not aluminum clad; (3) new fence and gate are recommended for approval as presented; (4) demolition of sleeping porch addition is recommended for approval with the understanding that architectural documentation is submitted, reviewed, and approved prior to demolition; (5) screening in of the existing kitchen porch and moving the screened door are recommended for approval as presented; and (6) proposed new exterior stairs are not recommended for approval and will be subject to a separate (likely, minor) review, to ensure that they are compatible yet differentiated from existing historic stairs.

Break: 2:12 P.M

Resume: 2:15 P.M

4. Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases

UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

RNA/DRB-19-02/HPZ-19-83 Central Block Rehabilitation –Façade Modification & Adaptive Reuse - [Revision to Approved Design: spacing of the vertical mullions (From 3 to 5 on west elevation) and (From 3 to 4 on north elevation) and tile from black to terra cotta color-work in progress]- 98, 100, 108 & 110 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Area /Downtown Core, Infill Incentive District).

Commissioner Becherer recused from this case due to an on-going business relationship with the owner of the property. The quorum was lost, and the case could not be reviewed. Case will be scheduled for next available agenda. No action was taken.

IID-18-06/HPZ-19-84 New Construction: Mixed-use 4-story building at the southwest corner of Stone Avenue and 14th Street, comprising 28 one and two bedroom condominiums, the relocated Casa Vicente restaurant, a parking lot, and a rehabilitated historic structure.

Concurrent rezoning (change of zoning) to remove a portion of the lot zoned “H. from the site.” [Contributor, Armory Park Historic District]. No contributing structures will be removed from the HPZ as a result. – 375 S Stone Avenue-(Downtown Infill Incentive District.)

Commissioner Becherer recused from this case due to an on-going business relationship with the owner of the property. The quorum was lost, and the case could not be reviewed. Case will be scheduled for next available agenda. No action was taken.

RNA/DRB/HPZ-19-91 – Hotel Congress Plaza-Improve the globe material on six Steinfeld Poles from polyethylene, frosted-white to a higher quality acrylic, smoked-clear. Proposal will maintain, improve and re-instate the

pole color to its original historic black pole paint, with adaptation of the globes to meet current City Outdoor Lighting Code-311 E Congress Street-(Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District, Downtown IID)

The proposal is to improve the globe material on six Steinfeld Poles from white, frosted, polyethylene protective globes to smoke, transparent, acrylic globes. Proposal also includes painting poles black and the use of new, dimmable LED bulbs.

Tucson Historic Preservation Officer Jodie Brown introduced the project, stating that the City has an Administrative Directive (AD 1-07.7) for the Protection of Archaeological and Historical Resources in City Projects, enacted in 1999 for City-owned land, including ROW and City-funded projects on properties owned by others. Project includes poles owned and controlled by City and Hotel Congress. Project is in the Pei Allen National Register District. City has not agreed to any changes to poles owned by City. Permission for temporary changes has already been granted to the applicant.

Architect Siri Trumble and Claudia Kappl, Joy from Concept Lighting Lab, LLC presented the project.

Discussion was held. Hotel Congress owner Richard Oseran requested the case be continued. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend case be continued per owner's request to a future review date.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park: 245 South 5th Avenue (roof replacement, wrong windows). Next review is 516 S 5th Avenue-(Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone). Commissioner Jenkins volunteered.

b. Appeals

Staff reported that the owner of 501 E 9th Street did not appeal the granted approval on that property in the allowed window. Approval included the condition that "owner be required to restore the crenellations and

chamfers on the canopy at the corner of the site for compatibility with the historic fabric.”

c. Zoning Violations

Staff provided information on the pending case of double door added on west side at 746 S Osborne Ave. (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone) during construction. Staff also provided information on construction at 508 E 18th Street (Osborne & 18th Street) where height of remaining historic wall was increased during construction. This increased wall needs to be removed, as it was never discussed or approved during the review process. Staff noted that inappropriate door material violation in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone was discovered during an on-site review. Case has been opened with Code Enforcement. 1045 N 2nd Avenue, West University inappropriate windows. Contractor is working with staff to comply.

d. Review Process Issues/Discussions

Discussion on quorum issues causing a back log of cases. Staff requested availability of members to assist in scheduling for the next two months.

7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

John Burr, member of the APHZAB spoke on pending revisions to APHZAB Design Guidelines and upcoming Design Review Committee meeting on 375 S Stone Avenue for rezoning and IID for new construction.

8. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting is scheduled for 11-14-19 but other dates are also being considered.

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 3:04 P.M.