

2019

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
Plans Review Subcommittee

**Minutes**

**Thursday, October 10, 2019**

**Basement (Lower Level) Meeting Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,  
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

Meeting called to order at 1:00 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Jim Sauer (Acting Chair), Michael Becherer, Sharon Chadwick, and Jill Jenkins.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Terry Majewski, Helen Erickson, and Jan Mulder.

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, and Nick Ross (PDSO).

**2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 9-26-19**

It was moved by Commissioner Jenkins, duly seconded by Commissioner Becherer, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 9-26-19 as submitted.

**3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

**HPZ- 19-75** - Klein/Longbons Residence– Roof extension to cover doors and supported by beam and knee braces; construct new concrete landing and stairs; Change exterior wall finish on kitchen addition from bead board to stucco; new shade pergola; new French Doors. Compliance with modification on existing addition without review/approval: porch and brick walls altered- 502 E 4<sup>th</sup> Street-(West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the WUHZAB meeting of 9-17-19.

Property architect, Leo Katz presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented.

**HPZ- 19-76** - Lipmann 18459 Parking Trust-Old Town Apartments: Demolish an existing detached accessory ramada; paint apartment walls, fascia, railings, pool fences and gates; repair and restore windows and doors [Non-Contributing Resource] – 720 S 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue - (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the APHZAB meeting of 9-17-19.

Property architect, Leo Katz presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Jenkins, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented.

4. **National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) Review Cases**

*Review in compliance with City of Tucson Administrative Directive (AD)/ Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

**HPZ-19-82 City of Tucson Fire Station Station # 11:** Repair of Kitchen Fire Damage, two (2) new additions: dorm sleeping rooms for fire fighters and a fitness room- [Contributor, San Clemente National Register District] -4075 E. Timrod Street

Tucson Historic Preservation Officer Jodie Brown introduced the project, stating that the City has an Administrative Directive (AD 1-07.7) for the Protection of Archaeological and Historical Resources in City Projects, enacted in 1999 for City-owned land, including ROW and City-funded projects on properties owned by others. Project is a City-owned and -funded project in the National Register District. Ms. Brown indicated that the changes were not likely to cause the property to lose its status as a contributing property to the district.

Paul Mickelberg from WSM Architects presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented with the condition that the existing windows to be replaced “like-for-like,” noting that the use of one (1”) inch insulating glazing is acceptable.

*Break: 1:50 P.M.*

*Resume: 1:52 P.M.*

5. **Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases**  
*UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10*

**RNA/DRB-19-02/HPZ-19-83** Central Block Rehabilitation –Façade Modification & Adaptive Reuse - [Revision to Approved Design: spacing of the vertical mullions (From 3 to 5 on west elevation) and (From 3 to 4 on north elevation) and tile from black to terra cotta color-work in progress]- 98, 100, 108 & 110 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Area /Downtown Core, Infill Incentive District).

Staff Taku stated that due to a recusal for potential conflict of interest by one of the subcommittee members, the quorum was lost, and the case could not be reviewed. Case will be scheduled for next available agenda. No action was taken.

**IID-19-06/HPZ-19-73** Multi-Family Residential Development. Seven Floor Building with 96 Apartments (48 Studios and 48 one-bedrooms) with two-story wing on the south side. Covered parking and roof deck. [Not within National Register District, but adjacent to Armory Park and Downtown Historic Districts]. Review per Secretary of Interior’s Guidelines and for Compatibility with adjacent historic structures – 111-127 S 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue-(Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District)

Staff Taku and Ross provided an overview of the project. Staff noted that the City’s Design Professional (DP) comments were provided to PRS as part of the review materials.

Project architect, Thomas Saylor-Brown, from SBBL Architecture and Planning, LLC presented the project.

Subcommittee was split on the key aspect of project review regarding compatibility with adjacent historic structures. Additionally, subcommittee expressed a concern of IID projects being reviewed when design is at

advanced stage and there is seemingly no opportunity for historic input to be included in the project design. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, to recommend approval as presented. There was a split voice vote of 2-2. (Commissioners Becherer and Jenkins in favor and Sauer and Chadwick dissenting)

**IID-19-05/HPZ-19-79** Julian Drew Building/ Lewis Hotel Lofts (1917)-New five story mixed use building: retail, restaurant and residential. New and adaptive re-use Historic Lewis Hotel: 44 new and 13 renovated apartments. [Individually Listed on National Register and Adjacent to Armory Park Historic District]. Review per Secretary of Interior's Guidelines and for Compatibility with adjacent historic structures – 140 /188 E Broadway Boulevard-(Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District, Downtown IID)

Staff Ross provided an overview of the project. Staff noted that the City's Design Professional (DP) comments were provided to PRS as part of the review materials.

Project architect, William Williams, from Engberg Anderson Architects presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend approval as presented.

## **6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion**

### **a. Minor Reviews**

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park: 245 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue (roof replacement, wrong windows). Next review is 742 S 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue-(Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone). Commissioner Jenkins volunteered.

### **b. Appeals**

Owner of 501 E 9<sup>th</sup> Street is appealing an approval condition that "owner be required to restore the crenellations and chamfers on the canopy at the

corner of the site for compatibility with the historic fabric” for Presta Coffee business to the Board of Adjustment. Staff will provide updates.

**c. Zoning Violations**

Staff provided information on the pending case of double door added on west side at 746 S Osborne Ave. (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone) during construction. Staff noted that inappropriate door material violation in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone was discovered during an on-site review. Case has been opened with Code Enforcement.

**d. Review Process Issues/Discussions**

PRS members were advised on PDSD Policy of transitioning to “paperless reviews online” for materials soon.

**7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

None.

**8. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings**

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting will be 10-24-19.

**9. Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:58 P.M.