

2019

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
Plans Review Subcommittee

**Minutes (\*\*REVISED)**

**Monday, November 4, 2019**

**3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Large Conference Room, Planning and Development Services  
Department, Public Works Building, 201 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

Meeting called to order at 1:30 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Helen Erickson, Jill Jenkins, Jim Sauer, Michael Becherer, Sharon Chadwick, and Jan Mulder.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: None.

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, Nick Ross, and Michael Kat (PDSD), Crystal Dillahunty (Ward 6).

**2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 10-24-19**

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 7-0 to postpone approval of the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 10-24-19 to the next scheduled meeting to allow members time to review the report submitted.

**3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

*UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines*

**HPZ 19-42** San Carlos Apartments, Building #1– Replace/Repair approximately 77 Windows on the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Floors-79 E 13<sup>th</sup> Street-- (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 10-15-19.

Property owner Alex Lee and project designer Gabriel from GGV Designs presented the project. Owner noted willingness to restore all the windows and retain as much of the historic fabric as possible, an action applauded by both APHZAB and PRS.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, and carried by a voice vote of 7-0 to recommend approval as presented, concurring with requirement recommended by APHZAB that the square corners around the window panes shall be retained.

**HPZ 19-88** San Carlos Apartments, Building #2 – Repair existing windows and add screens. Upgrade the electrical service and add new AC units -71 E. 13<sup>th</sup> Street - (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 10-15-19

Property owner Alex Lee and project designer Gabriel from GGV Designs presented the project. Owner noted willingness to restore all the windows and retain as much of the historic fabric as possible. Additionally, the new AC condensing units will be placed on the roof, concealed from view, or between buildings. The electric boxes will be upgraded to meet code.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, and carried by a voice vote of 7-0 to recommend approval as presented, on the condition that mechanical equipment not be visible from the public right of way, and that the square corners around the window panes shall be retained.

**HPZ 19-72** Lee Residence- Demolish an existing rear detached accessory non-contributing building-419 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue -- (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku read into the record the recommendation from the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 10-15-19. Historic Preservation Officer, Jodie Brown shared her findings from an on-site evaluation. She determined that there was no remaining historic fabric of the building, thus, no longer eligible to be considered historic.

Property owner Alex Lee and project designer Gabriel from GGV Designs presented the project

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 7-0 to recommend approval as presented, concurring with recommendations of APHZAB as follows: (1) approval of a future redevelopment package for the entire property, which may or may not include revised setbacks, prior to demolition; (2) that hand tools be used for the demolition to protect the adjoining historic structure; (3) monitoring of the demolition and repair process to be coordinated through the City of Tucson HPO to include a representative of APHZAB; (4) all costs for the required repairs/ restoration after the demolition shall be borne by the property owner (not the adjoining property owner); and (5) there should be no encroachment within 3 ft. of the exposed adobe structure for drainage.

**HPZ 19-89** Lane Residence- Replace asphalt shingle roof with metal roof and install water harvesting units-742 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue - (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 10-15-19.

Property owner Stacy Lane presented the project. Owner noted she was under the impression that the contractor had obtained required permits. Additionally, she noted not being aware that a permit was required for the water harvesting system.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 7-0 to recommend approval as presented, recognizing the issues raised by APHZAB regarding the desire to not set precedent, and concern for taking action against the contractor who did not have the project reviewed before doing the work.

#### 4. **Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases**

*UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10*

**RNA/DRB-19-02/HPZ-19-83** Central Block Rehabilitation –Façade Modification & Adaptive Reuse - [Revision to Approved Design: spacing of the vertical mullions (From 3 to 5 on west elevation) and (From 3 to 4 on north elevation) and tile from black to terra cotta color-work in progress]- 98, 100, 108 & 110 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Area /Downtown Core, Infill Incentive District).

\*Commissioner Becherer recused from this case due to an ongoing business relationship with the owner of the property.

Staff Taku summarized the project and noted the recommendations from PRS from the meeting of 3-28-19 and the DRB meeting of 2-15-19.

Project Manager Chris Leighton from Peach Properties presented the project. Presenter discussed change on the spacing of the vertical mullions, from 3 to 5, on the west elevation; change on the spacing of the vertical mullions, from 3 to 4 on the north elevation; change in the tile color at the base of the storefront walls, from the approved 4X4 black tile to a terracotta-colored 4X4 tile; and change from clear glass glazing in the reconstructed clerestory windows, to clear glass with an amber-colored film

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 (\*Commissioner Becherer recused and did not vote) to recommend approval of the project as presented, noting t (1) that the clerestory glazing is to be clear glazing with an amber film on the inside (not clear as previously approved); and (2) the 4” by 4” glazed tile will be terra cotta in color (not black as previously approved).

**C9-19-21/HPZ-19-84(b)** Reconfiguration of the lot lines and rezoning (modification of zoning boundaries) to remove a relic “leg” of historic zoning (HC-3) from a portion of the site which is located on the southeast corner of South Stone Avenue and East 14<sup>th</sup> Street, more particularly Parcel Numbers 117-14-0860, -0870, and -0890 to standard C-3 zoning (HC-3 to C-3). The “leg” of the historic HC-3 zoning extends west across a vacant parking lot that is not nor has ever protected any historic structure. The historic HC-3 designation is proposed to remain and continue to protect the Brady Court buildings. No contributing structures will be removed from the HPZ as a result – 375 S. Stone Avenue-(Contributor, Armory Park Historic District)

\*Note: At the request of applicants and concurred by PRS, this case was reviewed out of agenda sequence, (b) before (a) for ease of review.

Staff Brown summarized the project and discussed her determination on the removal of the relic “leg” of historic zoning (HC-3) from a portion of the site.

\*Commissioner Becherer recused from this case due to an ongoing business relationship with the owner of the property.

\*\*Land Use Planner Robin Large from Lazarus, Silvyn & Bangs, P.C and architect Bill Mackey from Worker, Inc. presented the project.

Discussion was held. Applicant proposed reduction of the land area protected by Historic zoning and the introduction of additional historic protection of the adobe structures in the southeast corner of the subject parcels. Several methods of this proposed additional historic protection were discussed, including (a) inclusion in the Armory Park HPZ, and (b) mandatory ("courtesy") review of any future changes by APHZAB and PRS with recommendations to the City of Tucson HPO for final decision. Opinions were offered by commissioners, the applicant, and the City of Tucson HPO, but a consensus was not reached. Commissioners requested that apparent inconsistencies in proposed property lines and zoning boundaries be corrected. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 (\*Commissioner Becherer was recused and did not vote) to recommend that the case be continued to a future meeting.

**IID-18-06/HPZ-19-84(a)** New Construction: Mixed-use 4-story building at the southwest corner of Stone Avenue and 14th Street, comprising 28 one and two bedroom condominiums, the relocated Casa Vicente restaurant, a parking lot, and a rehabilitated historic structure. Concurrent rezoning (change of zoning) to remove a portion of the lot zoned “H. from the site.” [Contributor, Armory Park Historic District]. No contributing structures will be removed from the HPZ as a result. – 375 S Stone Avenue-(Greater Infill Incentive District.)

\*Commissioner Becherer recused from this case due to an ongoing business relationship with the owner of the property.

Attorney Robin Large from Lazarus, Silvyn & Bangs, P.C, architect Bill Mackey from Worker, Inc., and Gerrie Gray from Miramothe Homes presented the project.

Discussion was held. Concerns were raised regarding the height of the proposed building, the height calculation's omission of the structures on the roof of the proposed building, the lack of step-backs or other efforts to increase compatibility with lower contributing buildings to the east, the height relationship of the building to the historic bungalows to the east, the balconies overlooking the historic bungalows to the east, and the quality of the facade along 14th street. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 (\*Commissioner Becherer was recused and did not vote) to recommend that the case be continued to a future meeting.

## 5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

\*Commissioner Becherer rejoined review at 3:31 P.M

### a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted at 245 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue (roof replacement, wrong windows) and 516 S 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue-(Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone); 35 E Toole for modified ADA Ramp..

### b. Appeals

None at this time.

### c. Zoning Violations

Staff provided information on the pending case of double door added on west side at 746 S Osborne Ave. (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone) during construction. Staff also provided information on construction at 508 E 18<sup>th</sup> Street (Osborne & 18th Street) where height of remaining historic wall was increased during construction. The height of the wall needs to be reduced to its original historic height, as any increases were never discussed or approved during the review process. Staff noted that an inappropriate door material violation in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone was discovered during an on-site review. Case has been opened with Code Enforcement. 1045 N 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue, West

University inappropriate windows. Contractor is working with staff to comply.

d. Review Process Issues/Discussions

None at this time.

6. **Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

John Burr mentioned IID Design Review Committee on 375 S Stone and requested comments on the pending Armory Park Revised Guidelines.

7. **Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings**

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting is scheduled for 11-14-19

8. **Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 3:43 P.M.