

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

Minutes

Thursday, December 12, 2019

**Basement (Lower Level) Meeting Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:04 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Jim Sauer (Acting Chair), Helen Erickson, Jill Jenkins, Sharon Chadwick and Jan Mulder.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Terry Majewski and Michael Becherer.

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, and Jodie Brown (PDSD), Crystal Dillahunty (Ward 6).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Reports (LARs) from Meeting(s) of 11-14-19 and 12-05-19

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 11-14-19 and to note that approval of the LAR for the meeting of 12-05-19 would be scheduled for a future meeting.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

***HPZ 19-101, 436 S Convent Avenue**

Barrio Historico Historic Zone, Contributing Resource

Repair damage to existing brick and plinth. Install new door at the side of the house.

(At the request of the applicant and approved by the subcommittee, this case was taken out of the agenda sequence)*

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the **BHHZAB meeting of 11-18-19.

Architect Phillip Neher presented the project.

Discussion was held. The Subcommittee had questions on how the bricks veneer and mortar will be repaired and details on the stem wall. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval as presented, noting (1) the replacement of a window on the south facade of the house by a door, and (2) the removal of the awning on the east facade.

**HPZ 19-78, 524 S Herbert Avenue
Armory Park Historic Zone, Contributing Resource**

Rehabilitation of an existing building; new stucco, roof repairs and shingle replacement, fencing and gates; repair and restore windows and doors; new rear addition.

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the APHZAB meeting of 11-19-19.

Denis Gonzales presented the project.

Discussion was held. The Subcommittee had concerns about the demolition of rear addition, construction materials, and visibility from public view. Also at issue was whether the proposed addition was within the period of significance for Armory Park. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Mulder, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to continue the project, to allow the applicant to document the contributing status of rear addition via construction methods, photo documentation, Sanborn maps, and a site evaluation by the Historic Preservation Officer.

**HPZ 19-94, 505 S Meyer Avenue
Barrio Historic Historic Zone, Contributing Resource**

Demolition of a rear addition and construction of a new rear addition.

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendation from the BHHZAB meeting of 11-18-19.

Danny Quinhuis presented the project.

Discussion was held. The Subcommittee had concerns about the demolition of the rear addition. Also need to screen the mechanical from public view. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, and duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to continue the project, to (1) allow the applicant to document the contributing status of the rear addition based on construction methods, photo documentation, Sanborn maps, and evaluation by the Historic Preservation Officer; (2) revise drawings to reflect the proposed step back of twelve (12") to fifteen (15") inches at the addition; and (3) that the water heater and mechanical equipment be screened from public view.

**HPZ 19-86, 926 N. 2nd Avenue
West University Historic Preservation Zone- Non-Contributing
Resource**

Demolish non-contributing structure constructed in 1940. Construct three detached houses and an attached two-car garage with a one car carport.

Jodie Brown, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the project.

Marcellus Rusk, project designer, presented the project on behalf of the property owner.

Discussion was held. The Subcommittee was satisfied with the revisions to the proposal as requested from the 12-05-19 review. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval of revised materials as presented.

**HPZ- 19-87, 928 N. 2nd Avenue/929 N. Jacobus Avenue
West University Historic Preservation Zone- Contributing Resource**

Demolish non-contributing building located at 929 N. Jacobus. Demolish non-contributing addition at the rear of 928 N. 2nd Avenue. Renovate the contributing resource at 928 N. 2nd Avenue and 927 N. Jacobus Avenue. Renovation includes repair of windows and doors and in-kind replacement as necessary, stucco repair and wood repair. Construct a four-car carport.

Jodie Brown, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the project and summarized her findings from the requested site visit.

Marcellus Rusk, project designer, presented the project on behalf of the property owner.

Discussion was held. The Subcommittee was satisfied with the revisions to the proposal as requested from the 12-05-19 review.

It was moved by Commissioner Jenkins, and duly seconded by Commissioner Chadwick, and passed by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval of revised materials as presented

4. Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases

UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

IID-19-05/HPZ-19-79, 140-188 E Broadway

Julian-Drew Building/Lewis Hotel

Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District, Downtown IID

Revisions to previously approved plan for adaptive reuse of the historic building and the construction of a new five-story apartment building with 44 units, a roof deck on the historic building and a connection point at the second floor. Proposed new design includes three stories of new construction, elimination of the roof deck and the connection at the second floor. The Julian-Drew Building/Lewis Hotel is individually listed on the National Register and adjacent to the Armory Park Historic District. Property should be reviewed for consistency with the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards and for compatibility with adjacent historic structures.

Staff Taku provided an overview of the project noting the revisions to the 10-10-19 proposal. Staff noted that the size was reduced significantly, and the new proposal does not impact the historic building.

Project architect, William Williams, from Engberg Anderson Architects presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 to recommend approval as presented.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff provided information on ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance.

d. Review Process Issues/Discussions

To be discussed will be front yard pools

6. **Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

None

7. **Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings**

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting is scheduled for 1-09-20.

8. **Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:20 P.M.