



**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**

Plans Review Subcommittee

May 8, 2008

**LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:05 p.m.

Commissioners: Terry Majewski, Sharon Chadwick, Patsy Waterfall, Steve Herzog,  
Demion Clinco

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry

2. Historic Central Core:

HCC 08-03 Ruiz-Demolition (Residence); 622 North Stone Avenue

Presentation by Jonathan Mabry, Historic Program Manager, City of Tucson, on the proposed demolition of a residence built in 1910/1912 in the Historic Central Core. It was determined that the structure was compromised in the late 1960's/early 1970's with a commercial addition attached to the front of the residence fronting on North Stone Avenue and because of this, the structure is non-contributing to the historic character of the Stone Avenue Corridor. The complete structure is in total disrepair and as a result of a fire, is uninhabitable and is an attractive nuisance. Due to the non-contributing status as determined by Mr. Mabry, this structure is ineligible for tax credits for rehabilitation. Further, the real estate market is prohibitive due to market conditions for the imminent sale by the property owner, Mr. Ruiz. Commissioners requested a survey of the surrounding properties in relationship to this demolition proposal and Mr. Mabry will have a survey completed and submitted at a later date for review/recommendation by the Commissioners.

HCC 08-01 Ornelia-Demolition (Residence); 841 West Franklin Street

The applicant's representative contacted city staff and requested to be placed on the next available plans review agenda on May 22<sup>nd</sup>.

3. Regular Cases:

HPZ 08-18 Werchan-New Construction (Two-Story Second Dwelling with Garage); 715 East University Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Henry Werchan, property owner, on the construction of a two-story dwelling/garage located in the rear yard of a single-family residence. The structure will have a hipped roof with exposed wood rafter tails and painted to match the existing residence (colors

yet to be determined). A powder coated steel door as proposed, was not recommended by the West University Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board as proposed. The commissioners recommend a steel raised panel door commonly found on West University and Armory Park garages. Light fixtures were presented and all are the same craftsman style. Windows to be wood double-hung and pedestrian doors to be wood.

Motion by Demion Clinco to recommend approval of this proposal with the conditions that the overhead garage door be metal raised panel (with window panels) and a minor review for paint colors in addition to any other proposed changes during construction.

.....

HPZ 08-21 Stokes-Roof Replacement (Two Dwellings); 933 North 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone) (Zoning Violation)

Presentation by Edward Stokes, representing the estate, on the replacement of two roofs in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. There is a main residence fronting along North 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and a large multifamily dwelling in the rear yard with an access easement along the south property line. Structures were built in 1918 (Casita) and 1923 (Main Residence). Both roofs were in need of replacement/insulation as the existing asphalt shingle-over-wood shake roofing deteriorated over time. Metal roofing was used without the benefit of historic review/approval. There are no other examples of metal roofs in this development zone. Mr. Stokes stated that he was unaware of being located in a historic preservation zone prior to completing the re-roofing of the buildings.

Motion by Steve Herzog to recommend denial of the re-roofing of the two buildings due to the material (metal) used in this development zone.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

HPZ 08-22 Chamberlin-Window Replacement; 907 North 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone) (Zoning Violation)

Presentation by June and Roy Chamberlin, property owners, on the replacement of wood windows in the residence with fiberglass windows. The Chamberlins stated they were unaware of the historic review/approval process prior to replacing the existing wood windows. Old windows were deteriorated and termite infested. The new windows are fiberglass with wood frames. The Chamberlins believe the new windows are more energy efficient and economically feasible as a replacement for the old wood windows.

Motion by Sharon Chadwick to recommend denial of the replacement fiberglass/wood frame windows.

Seconded by Sharon Chadwick.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

HPZ 08-24 Perrault-Window Replacement; 901 North 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone) (Zoning Violation)

Presentation by Therese Perrault, property owner, on the replacement of wood double-hung windows with vinyl clad wood windows. Ms. Perrault presented a detailed background of historic materials used in this development zone. She stated that, "Exceptions have to be made" in regard to materials in historic preservation zones so property owners can take advantage of energy and cost saving materials that are compatible and look the same as original materials. Commissioner Majewski reminded Ms. Perrault that she did not complete the historic preservation review process prior to replacing the windows.

Motion by Steve Herzog to recommend denial of the vinyl clad wood replacement windows.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....  
Commissioner Waterfall left at 2:45 p.m.

HPZ 08-23 Words on Wings-New Construction (Classroom Building); 202 East Speedway Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Jesus Castro, architect, for Words on Wings preschool located on the southwest corner of East Speedway Boulevard/North 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Discussion on metal casement windows and vertical glass windows on the west elevation. Discussion on the faux stone used around the base of the building to emulate the volcanic rock material commonly found on foundations of residences throughout the West University neighborhood. Commissioners recommend to keep the stone at a low level with a masonry cap. Roof will be asphalt shingle with exposed rafter tails. Paint will be beige tone for the exterior walls with blue trim.

Sharon Chadwick to recommend approval with the condition that the stone base be at a low level around the building with a masonry cap as shown on the elevation drawings.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

\*\*\*\*\*

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:
  - a. Minor Reviews: No minor reviews for this reporting period.
  - b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
  - c. Zoning Violations: There were three (3) zoning violations on this agenda that were reviewed and recommendations made, all in the West University Historic Preservation Zone.

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission  
Plans Review Subcommittee  
May 8, 2008

- d. Historic Preservation Zone Ordinance Revisions: A strategy for implementing revisions to the Historic Ordinance, Development Standards and local guidelines will be coordinated amongst the local advisory boards, Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission and city staff.
- 5. Call to the Audience: No one to speak.
- 6. Meeting adjourned at 3:05 p.m.