



**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission  
Plans Review Subcommittee**

**Thursday, November 20, 2008**  
(\*REVISED)

**LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

- 1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:03 p.m.

Commissioners: Patsy Waterfall (Acting Chair), Steve Herzog, Gal Witmer, Sharon Chadwick, Kathy Nabours, Demion Clinco

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Diane Workman, Harold Poole, Fran LaSala, Jonathan Mabry

- 2. Courtesy Reviews:

912 West Narmont Street-Windows/Doors/Window Jamb (Reconsideration) (Menlo Park National Register Historic District)

Presentation by Harold Poole, City of Tucson, Community Services Department on the installation of new metal casement windows, new doors and a solution for the window jamb on the front elevation of this "Contributing Historic" residence. Discussion on the window replacements that have a high "e" value manufactured by "Milguard". Mr. Poole passed around photographs of the existing windows and condition on the window jamb.

Motion by Sharon Chadwick to recommend approval of the windows/doors and window jamb configuration as proposed.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Acting Chair Waterfall did not vote.

\*\*\*\*\*

\*(REVISED)

928 West Narmont Street-Window Replacement/Doors/Stucco Repair (Menlo Park National Register Historic District)

Presentation by Harold Poole, City of Tucson, Community Services Department on the installation of new metal casement windows and general stucco repair on the exterior walls of

this "Contributing Historic" residence. Discussion on the window replacements that are the same as the previous case that have a high "e" value manufactured by "Milguard". Existing iron window guards will remain after installation of the new windows.

Motion by Steve Herzog to recommend approval of this proposal as presented.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Acting Chair Waterfall did not vote.

\*\*\*\*\*

3. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

Scott Avenue Street Improvements-Sidewalks (Concrete Scoring/Color)/Lighting/Landscaping (Plant List/Water Harvesting/Street Furniture/Glass Pavers/Columns (Portals) (REVISED PROPOSAL) (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Fran LaSala, City of Tucson, City Manager's Office and his design build team on the proposed improvements to the Scott Avenue streetscape from West Broadway Boulevard south to West 14<sup>th</sup> Street. Commissioners requested the team return with more detail on the proposed amenities along the streetscape at the last plans review meeting on Thursday, November 13, 2008. Mr. LaSala stated that the goal of this improvement is to create a safe and comfortable outdoor environment in Tucson's original "arts district". Positioning of amenities is to enhance rather than detract from the historical buildings along South Scott Avenue including (but not limited to) the Royal Elizabeth Bed & Breakfast (Blenman House), the Scottish Rite Cathedral, Children's Museum (Old Carnegie Library) and the Temple of Music & Art.

Lisa Ribes, Wheat Scharf & Associates presented the amenities beginning with the hardscape features (sidewalks/scoring) colored concrete including eight (8') foot wide sidewalks. Ms. Ribes continued with the proposed concrete tiles impregnated with aggregate in place of the existing turquoise blue line. Green glass aggregate along the seating areas, especially in front of the Scottish Rite Temple and the rear of the Children's Museum. Landscape planters including concrete post and metal planters are all part of the proposal. Larger trees and tree grates will be predominant closer to the West Broadway end of the project and around the Temple of Music & Art. A water fountain will be located on the northwest corner of the Children's Museum property with bicycle racks close to the rear of the Children's Museum. Existing globe lighting fixtures have been removed and will be repositioned near the Children's Museum and the Temple of Music & Art. Trash and recycling containers complete the list of amenities all as shown on the site plan.

The "gateway" to the project located on West Broadway Boulevard will include columns with lighted historic narrative panels that will be presented to the commissioners when the design is completed. The "ramada" in front of the Temple of Music & Art will be removed.

A discussion ensued regarding the landscape plan and the use of various vegetation and placement. Commissioner Nabours stated the desire for more fruit trees, common during the development of South Scott Avenue during the 1920's and 1930's. (A pomegranate tree is on

the proposed landscape plan). Commissioner Clinco raised the need for more vegetation on the rear elevation of the Children's Museum and questioned if the proposed turquoise aggregate trail should be permanent with the need for more historically correct globe lighting. In light of the fact that this is the first major streetscape improvement proposal in the downtown area, Commissioner Clinco cautioned that future downtown streetscape improvements should be presented to the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission earlier in the development process.

Commissioner Chadwick stated that the rusted steel planters were not historical in design or material and the type of mesquites proposed (Texas Honey) should be native to Arizona. The proposed light fixtures should be compatible in height (20') feet with the height of the existing globe light fixtures.

The Commissioners submitted a list of concerns to the design build team for consideration:

1. The concrete for the proposed sidewalks appears to be too dark. Commissioner Chadwick was given a sample to conduct a field review for compatibility;
2. The landscaping plan should incorporate more fruit trees into the inventory as suggested by Commissioner Nabours;
3. The glass pavers with turquoise aggregate (terrazzo) appears to be too modern to introduce into a historic streetscape as suggested by Commissioner Clinco;
4. The lighting plan needs more 2 and 5 globe fixtures to link the downtown with the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone as cited by Commissioner Clinco, and;
5. The proposed rusted steel planters are not historically accurate and only concrete planters should be used.

Motion by Steve Herzog to recommend approval of the Scott Avenue Street Improvements with the following conditions: 1) The concrete for the proposed sidewalks appears to be too dark and a field evaluation for compatibility will be conducted by Commissioner Chadwick; 2) The landscape plan as recommended by the Landscape Advisory Board be reconciled with the City of Tucson Land Use Code to reference a more historic plant pallet; 3) Re-examine the placement and quantity of the historic globe lighting incorporated in the plan; 4) The use of terrazzo tile be reevaluated, and; 5) The use of rusted steel planters be reconsidered for elimination on the proposed plan.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Acting Chair Waterfall did not vote.

\*\*\*\*\*

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

- a. Minor Reviews: Three minor reviews are scheduled in the field for Friday, November 21, 2008, beginning at 166 West Alameda Street for a "Change of Copy" for a sign followed by replacement of windows on a residence in Armory Park and installation of a new sign in Armory Park. A compliance review in the field based on the recommendations of the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board and the TPCHC Plans Review Subcommittee will be held on site at 5328 East Fort Lowell Road at 3:00 p.m.

- b. Appeals: The appeal for 933 North 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue-(HPZ 08-21) Stokes; Roof Material will be placed on the Mayor & Council agenda in January, 2009 along with a sign appeal for 845 East University Boulevard #185-(HPZ 08-29) Kababeque; Number and size of signs. The zoning violation appeal for windows on the residences located at 901 & 907 North 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenues will follow on the next available Mayor & Council agenda.
  - c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations are reported to the City of Tucson Community Services Department at 792-CITY. If a zoning violation is confirmed by a city inspector, the property owner has the opportunity to abate the zoning violation by successfully completing the historic preservation zone review/approval process in accordance with Sec. 2.8.8 of the City of Tucson Land Use Code.
  - d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: No report.
5. Call to the Audience: No one to speak.
6. Meeting adjourned at 2:40 p.m.