



Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission

Plans Review Subcommittee

Thursday, February 26, 2009

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:02 p.m.

Commissioners: Patsy Waterfall (Acting Chair), Demion Clinco, Kathy Nabours, Gal Witmer

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Jonathan Mabry

2. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

Scott Avenue Improvements-Gateway Feature (Historic Interpretive Panels); East Broadway Boulevard/South Scott Avenue (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Lisa Ribes, Wheat Scharf & Associates, on the gateway features to be located on the southwest and southeast corners of Broadway Boulevard/South Scott Avenue including interpretive panels and text. This is a draft layout with sequencing to be revised within the next week. Commissioners requested the grounding of the Scottish Rite Cathedral photograph and captions on all photographs to include the year and credit to the Arizona Historical Society.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval with the following conditions: 1) Eliminate photographs containing boarded-up windows/doors, and; 2) Crop the photograph of the Scottish Rite Cathedral with year and credits for all photographs presented.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0.

.....

3. Courtesy Review:

Ghost Ranch Lodge-Demolition/Rehabilitation (Adaptive Reuse); 801 West Miracle Mile (National Register Eligible)

Presentation by Brad Davis, Atlantic Development, on the demolition/rehabilitation of the structures located on the property known as the "Ghost Ranch Lodge" for adaptive reuse as elderly housing. All units will have new kitchens and be Americans with Disability Act (ADA) compliant. The revised plan will be submitted to the state for consideration for inclusion on the National Register. Pima County is providing bond money for the project. Jonathan Mabry, City of Tucson, verified that all non-Joessler buildings have been reviewed and recommended for demolition by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO).

Ken Scoville, a local Tucson author and historic preservation activist, was present to ask the commissioners to provide support for a second evaluation of several proposed buildings on the site slated for demolition; specifically, those located around the existing landscaped garden with the concurrence of Linda Mayro, Pima County and Jonathan Mabry, City of Tucson. Mr. Brad Davis, agreed to delay the demolition of those buildings pending a reevaluation of their significance by the SHPO. The original "Ghost Ranch Lodge" sign fronting on West Miracle Mile is proposed to be moved from its present location further east fronting on the rehabilitated property.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend further SHPO evaluation of the proposed buildings for demolition around the landscaped garden as suggested by Ken Scoville and supported by both Linda Mayro and Jonathan Mabry with approval for demolition of all other structures as proposed and to return to the plans review subcommittee of the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission for further review/recommendation.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0.

4. Regular Cases:

HPZ 09-05 Leonard-Sign; 238/240/242 East 12th Street (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Roland Leonard, property owner and Chuck Erickson, contractor, on the installation of a new sign "Armory Park Villas" on the front façade of a residential triplex. Discussion on the size of the lettering, positioning on the front of the building, material and colors.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval as proposed.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0.

HPZ 09-06 Olson-Sign; 330 East 16th Street (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Kathy Hoyer, designer, on the installation of a new freestanding sign in the front yard of an existing business known as "Caritas Center for Healing" in Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. Discussion on placement, size, materials and color of the sign.

Motion by Demion Clinco to recommend approval as proposed.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 4-0.

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee
February 26, 2009
Page 3

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

- a. Minor Reviews: Two minor reviews conducted since last meeting: HPZ 09-09 Saunders-Solar Water Heater; 768 South Meyer Avenue (Barrio-Historico Preservation Zone), and; HPZ 09-10 Warr-Solar Panels; 5395 East Francisco Loop (Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone).
- b. Appeals: Two appeals are pending placement on the Mayor & Council Agenda: HPZ 08-22 Chamberlin-Windows; 907 North 3rd Avenue and HPZ 08-24 Perreault-Windows; 901 North 3rd Avenue (both located in West University Historic Preservation Zone)
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to the Code Enforcement section of Community Services Department (792-CITY). A city inspector is assigned to the case and if a zoning violation is verified, the property owner is taken through the historic preservation zone review/approval process in accordance with Section 2.8.8. of the City of Tucson Land Use Code in order to abate the violation.
- d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: Commissioner Witmer wanted to discuss ways and means on educating property owners in historic preservation zones, e.g. informative mailings about the historic review/approval process along with historic inspections of approved plans. Commissioner Witmer also emphasized there are multiple options for windows which can be manufactured in any size, material, energy efficiency and configuration requested by the property owner. Jonathan Mabry, COT, Historic Program Manager stated that fiberglass/vinyl clad wood windows do not have the same life expectancy as all wood windows due to seal failure after which the entire window must be replaced. The key word "repairable" should be included in any rewriting of the language in the Historic Ordinance and related Development Standards and local guidelines. "Fabric" is a critical consideration when talking about historic preservation as a principle. Jonathan Mabry also suggested separate meetings from the plans review subcommittee meetings for laying the groundwork for revisions to existing historic preservation zone review documentation.

6. Call to the Audience: No one to speak.

7. Meeting adjourned at 2:17 p.m.