MEMORANDUM

DATE: February 23, 2012

TO: Independent Audit and Performance Commission

FROM: Nancy Petersen
       Interim Director
       Environmental Services (ES)

SUBJECT: Environmental Services Department Overview Report- Revised February 23, 2012

Enclosed is the revised report regarding the Environmental Services Department (ES) requested by the Independent Audit and Performance Commission (IAPC). The revisions address the comments received at the IAPC meeting held on February 8, 2012 and are limited to the section titled “Department Financial Status.” Specifically, a paragraph has been added on the ES Capital Program, the Adopted Budget was added to the FY2011 Revenues pie chart, and in two locations, the report references back to the City’s Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR).

Thank you for the opportunity to meet with the Commission and provide this summary report.

NP/lu

cc: Andrew H. Quigley, Assistant City Manager
    Jane Prior, Budget and Internal Audit
    Marie Nemerguth, Budget and Internal Audit
City of Tucson Environmental Services Department

*Residential and Commercial Services*

Report prepared by
Environmental Services Department
for
City of Tucson Independent Audit
and Performance Commission

*Submitted February 8, 2012*

*Revised February 23, 2012*
This report provides data to evaluate residential and commercial services provided by the Environmental Services Department (ES), the department enterprise fund status, Tucson customer satisfaction, and the value and costs of these services benchmarked against private haulers and other Arizona municipalities of similar size.

ES Mission: To promote a healthy Tucson community by providing innovative and cost effective waste management and environmental protection services.

ES provides waste management services to various customer bases, and develops policies through its citizen’s advisory committee and Mayor and Council to encourage environmental behaviors which benefit the community. ES is responsive to community values and committed to developing sustainable, cost effective services and programs. Through long-term planning, the department is prepared to meet the needs of the community today and into the future.

In 2004, the Mayor and City Council established ES as a completely self supporting enterprise fund, municipally-owned utility of the City. Costs of providing services to customers are funded entirely by user charges, fees, and other revenues. No General Fund monies are provided to the department and ES pays $3.4 million each year (adjusted annually) to the General Fund. ES:

- has a service area of 226 square miles, 240 full time employees
- provides weekly refuse and recycling collection service to approx. 137,000 residential customers
- provides collection and disposal services to approximately 3800 commercial customers
- owns and operates the Los Reales Landfill, serving Tucson and Pima County
- manages the Tucson/Pima County Household Hazardous Waste (HHW) Program
- provides groundwater protection at 16 closed City landfills

Residential Services

The City of Tucson is given authority for providing refuse collection services in the City Charter, Section 1 (6) and Tucson City Code Sec. 15-16:

City Charter Section 1(6)

*Acquisition of property for certain public purposes.* To acquire, by purchase, condemnation or otherwise, and to erect and maintain buildings for municipal purposes, and to acquire by purchase, lease, condemnation, construction or otherwise, and to establish, own, equip, maintain, conduct, operate, regulate, and control… garbage collection, garbage disposal and garbage reduction works… and any and all works, buildings, establishments, institutions and places, whether situated within or without the city limits, which are necessary or
convenient for the transaction of public business, or for promoting the health, morals, education or welfare of the inhabitants of the City or for their benefit; to exclude cemeteries from the limits of the City or any portion thereof.

**Tucson City Code Sec. 15-16:**
The collection of refuse or recyclable materials from any residential establishment by any person, business, corporation or firm other than the city is prohibited. Frequency of Collection is set by Arizona Administrative Code, Title 18-13-308:

**Arizona Administrative Code, Title 18-13-308**
A. The frequency of collection shall be in accordance with rules of the collection agency but not less than that shown in the following schedules:

1. Garbage only -- twice weekly.
2. Refuse with garbage -- twice weekly.
3. Rubbish and ashes -- as often as necessary to prevent nuisances and fly breeding.

B. A variance from the required frequency rate may be granted to allow for the collection of garbage once weekly. The variance may be granted by the Department of Environmental Quality upon submission of an acceptable plan approved by the local health department demonstrating that no public health hazards or nuisances will exist and that fly breeding will be controlled by either biological, chemical, or mechanical means. The variance may be revoked whenever the Department of Environmental Quality determines that the circumstances warranting the variance no longer exist.

ES has received a variance from the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality to provide once per week refuse collection with once per week recycling collection. The variance, dated February 25, 2002, was awarded after ES successfully completed a pilot project that demonstrated once per week refuse collection would be sufficient if offered along with once per week recycling collection.

In addition to providing weekly refuse and recycling collection services to residents, the monthly ES residential fee provides the following:

- **Brush & Bulky Collection.** Residents can put out up to 10 cubic yards of materials for collection and disposal twice per year. Additional on-demand service is provided on a fee for service basis. More than 13,000 tons of material are collected annually.
- **Low Income Assistance Program for residents.** Qualifying residents can receive a $12 monthly credit toward the ES fee, renewable annually.
- **Roll-out service for residents with disabilities.**
- **Container replacement and cleaning.**
- **HHW disposal through the Main Facility & monthly drop-off sites.** Annually, more than 600 tons are collected and reused or recycled.
- **Neighborhood Clean-Up Program.** The program is available to neighborhood associations. Associations can have up to eight roll-offs per year for clean-up events.
• Neighborhood Recycling Centers. ES manages 13 Neighborhood Recycling Centers located throughout Tucson. The drop-off sites accept all materials recyclable in the blue barrels.

• Annual Treecycle Program. Each year after the holidays, ES sets up collection sites for residents to drop off Christmas trees which are shredded for use as landfill cover, biofuel, and compost material.

• Recycling education & outreach to K-12 students. ES provides recycling education to schools through the Environmental Education Exchange (EEE) and Tucson Clean & Beautiful (TCB). Each year EEE provides approximately 400 classroom programs to K-5 students. TCB provides programs to approximately 6000 students each year.

• Recycling Info-line & K-5 education programs through TCB.

• Environmental site assessment and clean-up (soil) on City properties. Through the Brownfields Program, ES conducts Phase I and Phase II environmental site assessments on properties that have been undeveloped due to perceived contamination. Once the properties have been assessed, appropriate remediation can be implemented as needed so that the property can be returned to beneficial use.

**Commercial Services**

ES’ Commercial Division competes in the market along with private haulers and is a full cost recovery division that contributes to the General Fund. Based on staff estimates, ES has approximately 20% of the market with Waste Management Inc. and Saguaro Environmental Services (Republic Services, Inc.) splitting approximately 70% of the market. The remaining 10% is shared among multiple small haulers. While ES Commercial Division could operate outside the City limits, the department has chosen not to because of additional reports and fees that would be required by the State. Private haulers are able to operate throughout the city and the county. ES competes through formal bidding processes for agencies that use a Request for Proposal (RFP) process and also works with brokers to provide service to their clients. As a municipality, ES rates are published and cannot be negotiated. This helps keep rates affordable for all businesses requiring collection services.

The Commercial Division provides frontload metal service which is used to provide service to strip malls, hospitals, office complexes, restaurants, convenience stores and multi-family housing complexes. Services provided consist of refuse, recycling and construction dumpster removal. The Commercial Division works closely with the City’s planning and development staff to ensure refuse collection and disposal services are incorporated into any new developments.

In addition to daily operations, ES is always on stand-by should the City need services due to a local emergency or crisis. This would be a critical loss in the event of an emergency situation as the services would have to be purchased should ES no longer offer these services.

In its Commercial Division, ES’ goal is to earn contracts by providing excellent customer service. As a result, ES has been able to retain 20% of the local market. Equipment is properly maintained and not sent out with any safety issues. As a municipality, ES works to provide service that meets larger community goals to promote sustainability and is complimentary to community efforts to enhance quality of life for Tucsonans. ES seeks innovative solutions for
businesses by introducing state of the art collection systems including solar-powered compactors (reducing energy costs) and the One-plus system which reduces the need for a scheduled collection as the system requests service when needed. For the past two years, ES has also offered all businesses within the city limits (whether they are an ES customer or not) a free waste audit to help them add or increase the materials they are recycling and to provide waste minimization advice. In many cases, adding recycling also helps reduce their waste disposal costs.

**Rate Setting Process and ES Financial Sustainability Plan**

In 2004, the Mayor and Council established ES as an enterprise fund. In addition to refuse and recycling collection and disposal services, ES’ revenues must support programs such as landfill expansion, groundwater protection, and landfill closure and post-closure funding. ES has unfunded liabilities for twenty-two closed landfills. Sixteen of these landfills require on-going monitoring and maintenance and several have active remediation systems to protect our environment and groundwater. The ES fund is now responsible for supporting the Low Income Assistance Program previously funded by the General Fund (approximately $500,000/year).

As presented in a Mayor and Council Memorandum, dated March 9, 2010, R.W. Beck was retained to conduct a financial sustainability study. The purpose of the study was to determine the cost of all City-provided solid waste services and safeguard the financial integrity of ES and to provide a framework for future planning. The ES Financial Sustainability Plan outlines annual fee increases and established a closure/post closure fund for Los Reales Landfill to be paid only by current landfill users and not by City taxpayers. It also provided for a sustainable funding source to protect groundwater without imposing those costs solely on ES’ residential customers.

The long-term sustainability plan provides options that were incorporated beginning with the City Manager’s FY 2011 Recommended Budget and provides a guide for strategically addressing future budget planning requirements.

ES’ rate setting process is based on the cost of service study conducted by R.W. Beck. For FY 2011, residential, commercial and disposal rates were adjusted and the groundwater remediation fee was established. For FY 2012, the residential rates were not increased, however, the commercial, landfill, and groundwater protection fees were increased.

The cost-of-service model allocates ES’ planned expenses to the appropriate service and is used in determining rates for residential service, commercial service, disposal and groundwater remediation. All rates are set so that the department can maintain full cost recovery for its operations and services provided. Additionally, the rates set can reflect policy decisions. For example, rates for commercial recycling are reduced compared to trash services to encourage recycling. The annual requested budget and projected revenue requirements, based on proposed rates as reflected by the cost of service model, are reviewed by the Environmental Services Advisory Committee (ESAC) Finance subcommittee. This process is repeated on an annual basis and involves discussion with the City’s Finance and Budget staff, City Manager’s Office, and Mayor and Council. The rates are then scheduled for a public hearing and, ultimately, approved by Mayor and Council.
Department Financial Status

ES is 100% financially self-supporting and supports the General Fund. If privatization of ES’ services is considered further, the financial impact to the General Fund for FY11, other City departments, and City programs must be recognized. ES provides funding to the following:

- Contribution paid directly to the General Fund $3.4 million
- Tucson/Pima County HHW program $703,000
- TCB $161,000
- Brownfields Program $125,000
- Low Income Program for residential refuse and recycling services $792,000
- Utility billing expense $860,000
- Fleet Services $8.2 million

Understanding that competition is inherent in an enterprise fund, ES has successfully reduced annual landfill expenditures by 19% over the last two years. As the City is also responsible for final landfill closure and post closure costs, and to help avoid any future impact to the General Fund for the related $35 million unfunded closure liability, it is imperative that the Los Reales Landfill (the City’s only current operating landfill) remain open. As an integral part of City operations, landfill fees are expected to satisfy this long-term liability.

A reduction in work force would significantly impact other City departments who provide services to ES, such as Fleet Services, while economies of scale in cost sharing for utility billing and building maintenance would also be lost or reduced.

As the following two pie charts illustrate, in FY 2011, ES fully recovered its operating expenses through revenues that year. Each service area—Residential, Commercial, Landfill and Environmental Remediation—covered their operating costs and their proportionate share of all administrative overhead. In addition, sufficient revenue was recovered by landfill fees to set aside $1 million for the landfill’s future liability.

FY 2011 Operating Expenditures, $43.5M*
(Adopted Budget, $47.3M)

* Excludes $6.5M Depreciation Exp; includes $5.5M vehicle/equipment purchases capitalized @ 6/30/11
In order to include vehicle and equipment purchases, but exclude Depreciation Expense, the pie chart on the previous page reflects FY 2011 expenditures through the City’s 14th Accounting Period. The City’s Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR) reports transactions through the 15th Accounting Period.

- Department Financial Sustainability Plan adopted by Mayor & Council in 2010
- 100% Cost Recovery
- Department’s Pay-As-You-Go financing decreased debt service; no foreseeable future bonding needs
- As of June 2011, working capital was $13.2M; met 90 days working capital goal of $11.8M
- Since 2010, contributing $1M annually to Los Reales’ Closure/Post Closure
- Unfunded long-term liability was $43.4M; $36.8M for landfill and $6.6M for remediation at end of FY 2011. Short-term liability for the landfill was $1.1M (Page 52 on CAFR).
- In FY 2011, deferred major landfill equipment purchases
- 23% of FY 2011's expenses were vehicle maintenance/fuel to General Services' Fleet Services Division
- 8% of FY 2011's expenses were the General Fund's Indirect Cost Allocation
- FY 2011's annual subsidy for the Low Income Assistance Program was $792k, approx 5,500 participants
- ES paid approximately 50% of the City's annual Litter Fee

ES’ capital projects fulfill the city’s need to safeguard the community from environmental impacts, create future landfill capacity and comply with environmental protection regulations. Historically, ES has had three major funding sources for capital projects: General Obligation Bonds, Certificates of Participation and Pay-As-You-Go funds. However, continual monitoring and adhering to the financial sustainability plan enables the department to accrue working capital for planned future projects, contribute $1M to the reserve fund balance for the landfill’s long-term liability, and eliminate the need to seek outsourced financing.
Customer Service

ES maintains high standards for responding to customers. As a City department, ES responds to customer concerns and questions that are received through the Mayor and City Council, other departments, public meetings, and the departments Customer Service Division. The Customer Service Division handles service requests submitted over the phone, through email, and from other agencies related to both residential and commercial services. The Customer Service Division is a critical component of the department’s structure and supports the goal of customer satisfaction. Examples of the call center’s success include the following:

- The call center handles an average of 2000 calls per week with an average answer time of less than 20 seconds.
- Less than 3% of incoming calls hang up before talking to a representative.
- Requests for replacement containers are completed within 7 days with no additional fee.
- When a customer reports a missed service, a truck empties their container within three days and usually the next day.

To ascertain customer satisfaction, ES contracted with a consultant in 2008 (Residential Customer Survey, City of Tucson Environmental Services Department, October 2008, Marketing Intelligence) to conduct a baseline Customer Satisfaction Survey. The goals of the survey were to assess customer satisfaction with ES’ services and to determine customers’ understanding of ES’ services and operations. In 2011, a second Customer Survey was conducted that followed up with the Customer Satisfaction questions asked in the 2008 survey. Results indicated that customers have a higher satisfaction level with ES services and are more knowledgeable about services provided.

2010 Survey Summary Information

*Overall Rating of ESD* – More than eight of ten residential customers (83%) think that ES does an “excellent” (43%) or “good” (40%) job overall. Most of the rest indicate a “fair” rating (12%), while just 5% are negative to any degree – yielding a 4.2 average score on the “1-to-5” scale.

Compared to the 2008 survey, there has been marked improvement. Specifically, the percentage of “excellent job” evaluations has doubled from 22% to 43%, while “good job” ratings have increased from 30% to 40% and negative evaluations have declined from 13% to just 5% now. As a result, the average rating on the “1-to-5” scale has increased from 3.6 in 2008 to 4.2 now.

*Rating of Individual ESD Services and Programs* – One-half or more indicate “excellent” evaluations of these ESD services/programs:

- **Recyclables collection in the blue barrel** (55% “excellent job,” 30% “good” [85% positive evaluation overall] versus 4% negative to any degree [4.3 average score on the “1-to-5” scale – consistent with the 4.4 evaluation in 2008].
- **Trash collection** (52% “excellent job,” 34% “good” [86% positive evaluation overall] versus 3% negative to any degree [4.3 average score – unchanged since the 2008 study].)
• **Brush & Bulky collection** (49% “excellent job,” 29% “good” [78% positive evaluation overall] versus 6% negative to any degree [4.2 average score – very consistent with the 4.3 evaluation in 2008]. Even two-thirds of non-users or those unfamiliar with the Brush & Bulky collection offer a positive evaluation of the program [3.9 compared to a 4.2 among current users].)

• Among the 55% with an opinion, seven of ten customers indicate a positive evaluation of **providing customer service on the telephone** – including 42% who think that ESD does an “excellent job.” This compares to 12% who offer a “poor” rating (3.9 average score).

**Benchmarking**

**Solid Waste Service Providers in Tucson**

A comparative analysis was conducted for this report which included a review of residential billing from three private haulers and ES (See Attachment 1). The companies evaluated were Waste Management, Inc. (WM), Saguaro Environmental Services (SES), and Tucson Trash Haulers (TTH). Information was categorized by vendor, zip code, services, billing cycle, and recurring charges. The data was obtained from phone inquiries and billings received from ES employees residing in Pima County. It must be noted that this is not a comprehensive evaluation of rates for all residential customers of the private haulers operating in Pima County.

Each hauler noted in the analysis provides refuse and recycling collection; however, TTH did not include recycling service in their base rate. An additional charge is assessed by TTH for recycling collection. ES is the only hauler that includes Brush & Bulky Service in their base rate.

The analysis was based on invoice billing cycles as well as monthly charges for comparison purposes. The billing cycles of invoices evaluated were varied. WM bills customers every four months, while SES bills quarterly. Customers of these haulers are required to pay in advance for up to four months of service. ES and TTH bill customers monthly. Charges noted include the following:

• **Refuse and Recycle Service** – ES, WM, and SES charges include both refuse and recycle services; TTH includes trash services only, but offers recycling as an option for $6 per month.

• **Administrative Fees** – WM assesses an administrative fee for customers who choose to receive a paper bill in lieu of electronic billing. SES charges an administrative fee regardless of billing provided. ES and TTH do not charge an administrative fee.

• **Fuel Surcharge/Environmental Charge** – All of the haulers assess a Fuel and/or Environmental fee (information not available from TTH) however, the method for calculating this cost varies. WM includes a fuel/environmental charge that is calculated at the time of invoice and is determined by applying a percentage from WM's own Collection Fuel Surcharge Tables to the current diesel price in the U.S. (EIA/DOE) [http://www.eia.gov/petroleum/gasdiesel]. ES only applies a fuel surcharge to cover fuel expenses if diesel prices exceed the $3.39 per gallon threshold based on quarterly calculations. No fuel fee is assessed if diesel prices do not exceed $3.39 a gallon.

• **Pima County Refuse Fee** – WM is the only hauler in the analysis who assessed this fee.
• Late Penalties – WM and SES assess late fees on past due invoices. TTH did not note this on their bill. ES does not have a late payment fee.

Non-recurring charges were also assessed by the private haulers, but not included in this comparison. WM and SES rates fluctuated for what appears to be the same services. Some rates seem to have been negotiated between homeowner associations and WM.

Based on the available data, ES provides its customers one of the best values for services. ES’ base rate includes Brush and Bulky Service which is not included in the base rate of the private haulers surveyed. In addition, the City offers residential volume-based refuse collection service. The “Right Size Your Can” program was developed to provide customers options to meet their budgets and encourage more recycling. The program offers three refuse container sizes with rates ranging between $15.00 - $16.75 a month. ES used the highest rate ($16.75) for benchmarking purposes.

City of Tucson citizens are part of the rate setting process as they can express their opinions during public hearings held during the annual budget adoption process. ES rates are approved annually by the Mayor and Council and are not set arbitrarily based on location, etc. Environmental and Fuel fees assessed by ES are transparent and no miscellaneous fees are assessed to customers, unless additional services are requested (i.e. an additional container).

Other Arizona Cities
Each year, ES surveys the refuse and recycling collection rates assessed in other Arizona cities. The survey reviews the rates and the services provided as part of the fees. (See attached map and table). For the purpose of this survey, ES only surveys cities with a population of 100,000 or greater. ES rates fall in the mid-range among other cities; however, the survey is not extensive enough to determine if all the services provided are comparable (See Attachment 2).
**Privatization Statistics**

Cities across the United States have opted to privatize or not privatize services such as refuse and recycling for various reasons. For cities that have chosen privatization, there are generally significant budgetary problems or service issues driving the choice. What works for one city may not be the best choice for another city.

The number of U.S. cities which have privatized has varied over the years. In 1995, according to a study by R.W. Beck, approximately 50% of U.S. cities had contracted with the private sector (WasteAge, July 2011). This percentage is supported by other industry sources. In a privatization paper released in 2011 by the National Solid Waste Management Association, which represents for-profit waste companies, … “more than half of all U.S. cities contract out all or part of their residential waste and recycling collection services.” More recent analyses of this issue show a slightly downward trend since the peak of privatization. *The Commercial Appeal* (July, 2011) references Cornell University professor, Mildred Warner, who found that cities choosing privatization of residential waste crested in 2001 at 53% and since then, slightly more cities have resumed responsibility for trash collection than have privatized.

**Conclusions**

This report provides a brief overview of ES Residential and Commercial Collections services, the rate setting process and the ES Financial Sustainability Plan, Departmental financial status, customer satisfaction measurements, and benchmarking of ES fees against other private service providers and other Arizona municipalities of similar size. As the data shows, ES is providing a high quality of service and provides choices and options to customers that can enhance their service. When compared to private companies and other Arizona cities of comparable size, ES rates are among the lowest available.
Attachments
## Comparative Analysis of Tucson Waste/Recycle Haulers

Data was compiled from employee's residential invoices and information obtained from vendor. Invoices range from 12/01/11 through 01/01/12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trash/Recycle Services</th>
<th>Administrative Fee</th>
<th>Fuel/Environmental Charge</th>
<th>Pima County Refuse Fee</th>
<th>Billing Months</th>
<th>Monthly Charge Breakdown</th>
<th>Waste pickup per week</th>
<th>Recycle pickup per week</th>
<th>Late Penalty</th>
<th>B &amp; B Collection</th>
<th>HOA Rates</th>
<th>**</th>
<th>****</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City of Tucson</td>
<td>$16.75</td>
<td>$69.00</td>
<td>$57.92</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>$16.81</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Mgmt 85749</td>
<td>$4.00</td>
<td>$18.92</td>
<td>$15.88</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>$23.06</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Mgmt 85718</td>
<td>$0.06</td>
<td>$14.25</td>
<td>$7.50</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>$18.53</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Mgmt 85745</td>
<td>$14.96</td>
<td>$55.92</td>
<td>$44.88</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$17.62</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Mgmt 85737</td>
<td>$19.22</td>
<td>$61.00</td>
<td>$69.00</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$14.96</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Mgmt 85757</td>
<td>$39.50</td>
<td>$15.54</td>
<td>$10.74</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$17.39</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tucson Trash</td>
<td>$48.00</td>
<td>$10.23</td>
<td>$85.57</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$18.22</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haulers 85714</td>
<td>$42.50</td>
<td>$10.23</td>
<td>$85.57</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>$18.22</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1 time</td>
<td>1.5% of total + $5 mth</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Trash/Recycle Services - are also known as "WM trash/recy svc" and "96 Gal toter s/l"

** Administrative Fee - Various Administrative charges

Waste Management charges this fee if the customer has not enrolled in "paperless billing"

***Fuel/Environmental Charge:

Waste Management calculates the fuel charge/environmental charge as follows (before taxes)

1. Is based upon the last reported released every Monday by EIA/DOE (Energy Information Administration/Department of Energy)

   - national diesel price the going rate listed prior to the invoice date on the U.S. Energy Information Administration Independent Statistics and Analysis [http://www.eia.gov/petroleum/gasdiesel/]

2. Based on the EIA/DOE amount... Waste Management uses their Collection Fuel Surcharge Table and applies that percentage

3. Environmental Component charge of 7.5% is added to the total amount of charges and fuel surcharge.

City of Tucson only implements fuel charge if diesel prices surpass over $3.39 gallon (per Chapter 15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WM Fuel/Env Charge Example:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waste charges before taxes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel Surcharge (last reported rate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Component 7.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Amount</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

****Pima County Refuse Fee - is only charged by Waste Management, Inc.

*****HOA Rates - Rates are negotiated by private haulers based on HOA's and/or subdivisions.

NOTE: Charges not directly related to refuse/recycling collection and other non reoccurring charges were not included with this summary.
NOTES:
Data based on survey of Southern Arizona Cities with population of 100,000 or greater, conducted in January 2012. Service in cities may be provided by both public and private waste haulers. All rates are set by a governing body on a city-negotiated rate.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City/Town</th>
<th>Fee/Type of Service/Container Size</th>
<th>Brush &amp; Bulky Service Included in Fee</th>
<th>Curbside Recycling</th>
<th>Additional Services Included</th>
<th>Provider</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chandler</td>
<td>$15.07/mo., Weekly service, 95 gallon</td>
<td>Every 6 weeks</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Year-round Recycling Center</td>
<td>City uses contractors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilbert</td>
<td>$17.30/mo., 90 gallon; $16.00/mo., 60 gallon; $8.80 for additional 90 gallon container</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW and Recycling Facility</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glendale</td>
<td>$16.30/mo., Weekly service, 95 gallon</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW curbside pickup 2x/year; Recycling center</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mesa</td>
<td>$23.34/mo., 90 gallon; $20.83/mo., 60 gallon; $5.51/mo, 90 gallon yard waste; $11.02 for each additional container</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Includes Holiday pickups; Fee goes into General Fund</td>
<td>City crews and contractors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peoria</td>
<td>$15.06/mo., Weekly service; Choice of 60 or 90 gallon; Additional charge for additional containers</td>
<td>1x per year</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW 2 events per year at designated site</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix</td>
<td>$26.80/mo., Weekly service, 90 gallon or shared 300s</td>
<td>4x per year</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW, 10 collection events/year, dead animal collection</td>
<td>City crews and contractors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottsdale</td>
<td>$16.00/mo., Weekly service, 90 gallon</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW, 1 collection event/year;</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tempe</td>
<td>$19.98/mo., Weekly service, 90 gallon or shared 300s</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW collection at 6 sites</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tucson</td>
<td>$15.00/mo., 48 gallon; $16.00/mo., 65 gallon and shared 300s; $16.75/mo., 95 gallon.; Weekly service</td>
<td>2x per year</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW, Monthly collection events at 3 sites, CABOP open 6 days/week</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surprise</td>
<td>$16.63/mo., Weekly service; 60 and 95 gallon</td>
<td>20 cubic yards per year</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>HHW, 2 collection events/year; one time moving boxes/packing materials collection</td>
<td>City crews and contractors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>