

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

7. Description

Architectural Classification

(Enter categories from instructions.)

MODERN MOVEMENT: Ranch Style

LATE 19TH AND 20TH CENTURY REVIVALS: Pueblo

MODERN MOVEMENT: Art Deco

Materials: (enter categories from instructions.)

Principal exterior materials of the property:

Foundation: concrete

Walls: brick; other: concrete masonry; stucco; wood siding

Roof: asphalt; terra cotta

Narrative Description

(Describe the historic and current physical appearance and condition of the property. Describe contributing and noncontributing resources if applicable. Begin with a **summary paragraph** that briefly describes the general characteristics of the property, such as its location, type, style, method of construction, setting, size, and significant features. Indicate whether the property has historic integrity.)

Summary Paragraph

The Broadmoor subdivision is located in central Tucson, Arizona and was primarily constructed between 1944 and 1964. The primary character-defining features of Broadmoor are:

- the development layout, including curvilinear and discontinuous streets, limited access points, inward orientation and landscaping features;
- the collection of post-World War II Ranch houses.

Within the proposed historic district there are 365 residences; 248 properties have been identified as contributing properties to the proposed district. Though many houses have been modified over the years, those modifications have not adversely impacted the overall character of the neighborhood. The subdivision is largely intact and retains and expresses its original character.

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

Narrative Description

Broadmoor is a large subdivision of 365 single-family houses that was platted in 1944 and was primarily built-out between 1944 and 1964.

Location

The Broadmoor subdivision is located in central Tucson, Arizona approximately two miles east of the city's downtown business district. Tucson is located in the southern portion of the state, approximately 60 miles north of the Mexican border, and is surrounded by the Sonoran Desert. The Santa Catalina Mountains are located approximately 9 miles north of the subdivision. The subdivision is located in the northeast 1/4 of Section 17 of Township 14 South, Range 14 East of the Gila and Salt River Meridian.

The subdivision is located southwest of the intersection of Broadway Boulevard and Country Club Road, adjacent to commercial and multi-family residential properties along Broadway Boulevard and suburban residential developments of single-family houses to the north, south, east and northeast. Randolph Park, a 160-acre regional park, is located to the southeast. Adjacent development was primarily built between 1928 and 1972.

Broadmoor was built on property that was previously the Tucson Country Club. The golf course consisted of dirt fairways and oiled sand greens. The rest of the property was largely denuded desert scrubland that had previously been used for cattle grazing.

At the start of construction, Broadmoor was located in unincorporated Pima County, just outside the Tucson city limits. It was annexed into the city in 1952.

Boundaries

The boundaries of the proposed Broadmoor historic district are defined primarily by the single-family residential sections of the original subdivision configuration. The boundary was selected because the single-family portions of the subdivision were the focus of the distinct planning and architectural character that was identified as historically significant. Commercial, institutional and multi-family residential properties adjacent to Broadway Boulevard and Tucson Boulevard are located within the subdivision but are not included within the proposed historic district boundaries. These properties were not developed as originally intended by the development plan, and many were built after the period of significance.

The proposed district is surrounded by: commercial properties and Broadway Boulevard to the north, Country Club Road and the Broadway Village subdivision to the east, Tucson Boulevard and two schools to the west, and the Country Club Manor subdivision to the south.

The intersection of Broadway Boulevard and Country Club Road has small commercial developments on three corners. Close to the proposed district are several other subdivisions developed both before and during the construction of Broadmoor. Directly adjacent to the east is the Broadway Village subdivision, which includes 21 houses along Country Club Road, and a shopping center. Broadway Village was platted and developed starting in the late 1930s; most of the houses and the shopping center were designed by architect Josias Joesler. East of Country Club Road is Colonia Solana, a neighborhood of high-priced custom houses on large

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

lots, with extensive native vegetation. The subdivision was platted in the late 1920s and build out took place over several decades; it is on the National Register of Historic Places. To the northeast is the El Encanto subdivision, another affluent neighborhood that developed over several decades with a formal layout and lush landscaping. It is also on the National Register of Historic Places. North of Broadway are several subdivisions known collectively as the Sam Hughes neighborhood, which is also on the National Register. The subdivision of Country Club Manor is located directly adjacent to the south.

Neighborhood Layout

Broadmoor was laid out as a self-contained neighborhood, with limited access points and most residential front façades facing away from major arterials and the adjacent commercial properties. (fig. 1, 6) There are four primary entrances into the residential portion of the subdivision. The first two are located adjacent to the major intersections of Broadway and Tucson Boulevard and Broadway and Country Club Road, along Stratford and Eastbourne streets, respectively. The Eastbourne entry has a more formal character with a median lined with palm trees. The second two primary entries are located adjacent to the Arroyo Chico wash where it intersects Tucson Boulevard and Country Club Road.

Two secondary access points into the subdivision are located along the Treat Avenue north-south axis; one provides access northward to Broadway Boulevard, and the other provides access southward into the Country Club Manor subdivision.

The primary access streets of Stratford and Eastbourne have T-intersections with other streets in the subdivision.

Streets within Broadmoor are both rectilinear and curvilinear and are generally discontinuous and disconnected from the streets of major thoroughfares and adjacent subdivisions. Streets are primarily oriented in proximity to the east-west axis. The topography is generally flat. The neighborhood has an inward-facing, insular character.

The Arroyo Chico drainage way runs generally from east to west through the neighborhood and was included as a landscaping and entry feature of the overall design. Two separate branches of the Arroyo Chico roadway are located on either side of the drainage wash. Oleanders currently line both sides of the wash for most of its length. The drainage way divides the subdivision into two distinct zones, with approximately 2/3 of the subdivision located north of the wash. Road crossings of the drainageway are located on Stratford Ave. and Eastbourne Ave.

A pedestrian path located along the Treat Ave. axis intersects all of the east-west oriented streets near the center of the subdivision. A pedestrian bridge provides access across the Arroyo Chico drainageway.

Easements provide utility access to the backyards of all houses, which are typically enclosed by masonry walls.

The original neighborhood layout remains intact.

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

Streetscape

Broadmoor is characterized by asphalt-paved streets with square concrete curbs. Landscaping in the neighborhood reflects a Mediterranean influence (see fig. 10), and is generally characterized by olive, palm, cyprus and juniper trees, along with some broadleaf trees and shrubbery such as oleander, citrus and privet. Large aleppo pine and eucalyptus trees are dispersed throughout the subdivision. Mesquite trees are also common, though many of these trees appear to be more recent plantings. Front yards are usually covered in pea gravel or decorative gravel and typically have concrete, asphalt or gravel driveways. Some houses have semi-circular driveways in front of the house. Some of the houses originally had front lawns, but only a small number of lawns remain. The landscaping originally had a more manicured appearance, but that has been modified by the introduction of more native and low water use plants. Some of the large aleppo pine trees have died in recent years. (photos 1-5)

Individual houses are generally sited near the center of the lot and set back approximately 30-35 feet from the curb, reflecting a 25 ft. front yard setback requirement. Most houses have their broad side parallel to the street. Driveways and attached carports are located in the front or on the side of each house, though some carports have been modified over the years. A handful of houses have carports or garages located in the rear of the property, accessed from the street. The consistent scale and character of the houses, extensive use of brick masonry, and limited plant palette create a sense of identity for the neighborhood. Individual houses are generally distinct, and there is no sense of repetition or uniformity. (photos 9-14)

The small scale and informal character of the houses, irregular landscaping, and absence of sidewalks establish a modest character to the neighborhood. The limited access points and discontinuous streets give an insular feel and a strong sense of neighborhood identity.

Although some carports have been enclosed and some facades have been modified, this is a small proportion of the total number of houses.

The character of Arroyo Chico is distinct from the other streets in the subdivision. A drainage way is located between two branches of the street, and is lined with large oleander shrubbery for most of its length; native desert vegetation is located at the far east and west ends of the drainage way. The oleanders are typically greater than 10 feet in height and create a visual barrier. (photos 6-8)

Eastbourne Avenue has a median for a portion of its length at the entry to the subdivision and is lined with palm trees.

Land Use

The proposed historic district is composed of single-family residences located on rectangular and irregularly shaped lots. Most lots are rectangular and are typically just slightly less than 1/4 acre in size. Lots adjacent to intersections are typically larger and irregular in shape. Most homes are centered on the lot with landscaped front yards and driveways. All houses have large, private outdoor spaces in rear yards. 10-foot wide utility easements are located at the center of each block, along the rear property line of each house. A 20-foot wide easement also runs north-south along the Treat Avenue axis. There are alley ways at the perimeter of the subdivision behind houses on Stratford, Eastbourne and Manchester streets.

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

There is also one lot in Broadmoor that is vacant and has never been built on.

Residential Architecture

The houses in Broadmoor are almost all variations on the 20th century suburban Ranch style house. These variations include conventional Ranch (which accounts for approximately 80% of the houses in the subdivision), Modern Ranch, and Spanish Colonial Ranch, as described in the City of Tucson's 2016 National Register of Historic Places eligibility assessment report and appendix (Evans, Levstik, Jeffery). (fig. 7-9)

The houses vary in size, but typically have three bedrooms and currently average 1700 square feet, though at the time of construction the average house size was smaller.

Houses are typically rectangular or L-shaped, and have their broad side parallel to the street. All of the houses were originally one story, but a few houses have had two-story additions. The houses generally have a horizontal character.

Most of the houses have gable roofs, though there are many hip roofs as well. These roofs typically have a rise-to-run ratio of 3:12. A few houses have a lower profile gable roof, with a slope of 1:12 to 2:12. There are also a handful of houses with flat roofs.

Most houses in the subdivision have carports. Many houses originally had attached one-car carports; some of these have been converted to garages over the years, and some have been expanded to accommodate two cars. A few houses originally had one-car garages. A handful of houses have detached carports or garages located in the rear of the property, accessed from the street.

Brick and mortar-washed brick are the most common wall construction materials in Broadmoor. Painted masonry and stucco are also widely used, although some of the stuccoed houses are not original construction. Roofs are primarily covered in asphalt shingles, but there are also clay tile roofs. Low-slope roofs usually have built-up roofing with a white coating. Other materials include horizontal wood siding, which is primarily found on gable end walls above the masonry and below the roofline.

Most houses have steel-framed fixed and casement windows either with or without divided lights. A few houses originally had aluminum windows. Some windows have been replaced over the years. A common detail are decorative wood shutters that frame the windows on the front facade.

The conventional Ranch houses in Broadmoor (photos 1, 12, 15-20) are generally characterized by:

- a horizontal character
- brick construction, with or without mortar or lime wash
- painted masonry (brick or concrete masonry)
- gable and hip roofs with asphalt shingles
- one-car carport
- steel windows.

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

Most of the Spanish Colonial Ranch houses are a juxtaposition of California Ranch forms and Spanish Colonial materials and details, including stucco and clay tile roofs. (photos 13 left, 21) The Modern Ranch houses are characterized by the use of a flat, or horizontal, roof, or a low-slope gable roof. A few of these houses also have larger windows or windows with a more horizontal configuration. (photo 22)

There are also a few houses in the subdivision that were inspired by pueblo and territorial influences of Arizona's past; these houses are characterized by stucco, parapet wall construction, and a more upright massing. (photos 14 left, 23)

The neighborhood has a cohesive architectural character as a result of the limited range of scales, architectural styles, forms and materials, though the few houses with parapet construction stand out as distinct.

Integrity in Broadmoor

The original planning layout of Broadmoor remains intact, and of the 365 residences in the proposed Broadmoor historic district, 248 have been identified as contributing properties, based on integrity and the period of significance.

Most of the houses identified as non-contributors have been modified and no longer retain integrity. The most common modification is the replacement of the original steel casement windows. The replacement of the windows was typically insufficient by itself to cause a house to be classified as a non-contributor, but in combination with other modifications was a primary reason houses were excluded. Other common modifications include carport modifications (including carport conversions to a garage or interior space, and carport expansions from one to two cars), porch additions or modifications, modification of the roof or wall materials, and building additions. In some cases, stucco has been applied over the original masonry. And at a few houses a wall has been added to the landscaping that screens the house from the street. The National Register Bulletin "Historic Residential Suburbs: Guidelines for Evaluation and Documentation for the National Register of Historic Places" and Arizona SHPO's 2011 "Policy Statement on the Recommendations of Eligibility of Buildings" were used as guidance for evaluating property modifications. (See photos 24-25 and descriptions in photograph log for examples of houses that are non-contributors.)

Eleven of the houses within the subdivision that were identified as non-contributors were built after the period of significance. A handful of lots remained undeveloped into the 1960s and beyond, and were subsequently developed during the following decades. These houses are out of character with the rest of the subdivision.

Location: The original layout remains in place.

Design: The layout and spatial organization of the subdivision remains intact. Although there was a wide array of builders in the neighborhood, Broadmoor's houses have a consistent proportion and cohesive character; they were primarily shaped by the period in which they were built, and reflect an early Tucson version of the Ranch style. Houses on larger lots often have a more elongated character, but are consistent with the neighborhood in roof forms and materials. Several builders used the same model within the subdivision, though the similarity is not readily identifiable because the houses are not near to each other, and the houses were typically

Broadmoor Historic District
Name of Property

Pima, AZ
County and State

distinguished by roof type or construction material. The most common modifications to individual houses include the replacement of the original steel windows, which are a character-defining feature; and carport modifications.

Setting: The setting surrounding Broadmoor remains largely unchanged. More commercial developments along Broadway Blvd. and Tucson Blvd. have been added since the period of significance, but this is a small percentage of the overall development surrounding the subdivision. Broadmoor's self-contained planning layout and inward orientation limits the impact any perimeter development has had on the neighborhood character. The residential developments that are near Broadmoor were all developed either prior to, or concurrent with, the period of significance. The setting within Broadmoor has evolved somewhat; although a significant majority of the built resources—including streets, curbs, and residences—are intact, and the general spatial character of the narrow streetscape remains, some of the landscaping in front of the residences has been modified.

Feeling: Broadmoor's small-scale houses, irregular landscaping, narrow streets and lack of sidewalks give the subdivision an informal character. The proportions of Broadmoor's early Ranch houses distinguishes the subdivision from most pre-World War II development in Tucson, and from subsequent developments where the Ranch style evolves into a larger and more elongated form. The predominance of brick and painted concrete masonry construction also distinguishes the neighborhood from later Ranch style subdivisions that were often characterized by burnt adobe. The conversion of many of the original broadleaf and Mediterranean-influenced landscapes to a hybrid of Mediterranean and Sonoran plantings has modified the original feeling to some degree; the original landscapes would likely have felt more open and manicured.

Materials: The primary building materials for houses in Broadmoor are exposed red brick, mortar-washed red brick, painted concrete masonry, and stucco over masonry. Houses south of the Arroyo Chico were permitted to be smaller and less expensive by the CC&Rs, and as a result a larger percentage of the houses were built with painted concrete masonry. Houses north of the arroyo tend to be constructed of brick. The original wall construction materials are largely intact throughout the subdivision. A few houses that were originally exposed masonry have been stuccoed over the years.

Workmanship: Simple forms and unadorned surfaces meant that the Ranch style was more affordable. The style was selected in part because it required less skilled labor to build, during an era of high demand for housing; as a result, the lack of workmanship was part of the construction's appeal to home builders. The primary evidence of workmanship in Broadmoor can be found in the masonry brick work and applied mortar or lime wash, which was typically applied to provide an aged patina to a residence. At some houses, evidence of workmanship can also be found in the detailing of wood corbels and exposed rafter tails.

Association/Age: Broadmoor continues to be a single-family residential development that has an identity as a distinct and cohesive neighborhood. Broadmoor's contributing properties are associated with Community Development in Tucson, and the development of the Ranch house in Tucson. The period of significance for this nomination (1944-1964) reflects the primary build out period of the neighborhood.