



Main Gate Overlay District – Design Review Committee (MGO-DRC)

Thursday, August 23, 2018 – 4:00 p.m.

Ward 6 Council Office, West Room
3202 East 1st Street, Tucson, AZ 85716

Legal Action Report

1. Roll Call (4:05 PM)

Present:

Rick Gonzalez, Chair
John Birkinbine
Robert Miller
Robert Smith
Matt Williams
Jane McCollum
Tom Warne

Staff Members:

Carolyn Laurie, Planning & Development Services
María Gayosso, Planning & Development Services
Rick Saldate, Planning & Development Services
Steve Shields, Planning & Development Services

2. Approval of Legal Action Report of May 10, 2018 Meeting

Chair Gonzalez moved to approve Legal Action Report of May 10, 2018 meeting. Mr. Smith seconded. Motion was approved unanimously.

3. MGD-18-02 Graduate Hotel & Collective Apartment at Main Gate

Applicant presented a revised concept for the mixed-use project, which includes 238 apartments, a hotel with 165 guestrooms, 6,000 square feet of ground-level retail and services, and a plaza with public amenities.

DRC member Smith commented project will be beneficial to the community, and agreed with the new, more tactful choice of materials in the lower levels, especially along the plaza area, which may end up being not big enough; he also pointed out the buildings are very close to the Marshal Foundation façade, creating shadows that may impact the hotel's windows. DRC member Smith finalized by expressing his support for a project that is creating other types of housing (non-student housing), and for the project as a whole.

DRC member Miller suggested the consideration of improvements to the top of the buildings, particularly around the pool areas and the sides facing the top view from the interior of the lot.

Staff indicated the project meets all Main Gate Overlay requirements, including façade, outdoor space, and activity visible from streetscape.

DRC member Williams inquired if the height of the bar/restaurant in the terrace counts as another story, going above height calculations. The applicant responded the bar/restaurant represents less than 14% of

the total gross floor area, that up to 30% is allowed, meeting the Main Gate Overlay criteria for height. Staff added applicant has also requested a formal interpretation from the Zoning Administrator for compliance with height requirements.

DRC member Williams pointed out that essentially all exterior materials above the brick façade are stucco, and asked if windows are all aluminum. Applicant confirmed, for those windows above the third and fourth floors.

Mr. Williams also expressed his concern with vehicular traffic going in and out from Tyndall Avenue, which is very pedestrian in nature, next to the existing student housing to the north, and asked if Tyndall Avenue will continue being blocked off. Applicant indicated the desire to have a drop-off zone for the hotel on 2nd Street, but did not want to create further conflict with Tyndall Avenue, and that there are 91 parking spaces for cars now. A representative from the Marshal Foundation added that Tyndall Avenue cannot be opened up to traffic, because of fire access requirements.

DRC member Birkinbine asked how many parking spaces are designated for the residential component of the project, and applicant responded 150, with the current Marriot Hotel providing valet service. DRC member Smith added there is no impact from automobiles going into the parking garages to the east for the existing Marriot hotel. The representative from the Marshal Foundation also indicated that loading and trash collection will still take place on Tyndall Avenue.

DRC member Williams expressed his disappointment with the new concept for the project where both towers are used for residential and a smaller portion of one of the towers being used for the hotel. The applicant informed Mr. Williams that, with today's building and rental costs, the apartments will be subsidizing the hotel for \$4 to \$4.5 million dollars, and that the site is entitled to what was being presented to the DRC today.

Mr. Williams then indicated he likes the public space component, but, above that, after seeing the previous iterations for the project, the buildings seem massive, that before there was terracing.

DRC member Birkinbine asked if the plaza design was part of the project. DRC member Smith explained the plaza is part of the project, but its design will come to the DRC at a later time. The Marshall Foundation representative pointed out that the plaza is covered under many of their lease stipulations; the applicant added that the plaza is also part of the development agreements with the City of Tucson. Mr. Williams indicated the DRDC is not commenting on the plaza today, but will be very glad to see it in the future with all the details. Mr. Smith then finalized by adding that the maintenance of the landscape/streetscape of the plaza and terrace components needs to be part of the details to be presented to the DRC in the future.

Mr. Birkinbine expressed his support for the separation between the first 3-story building and the two towers, but that the upper floors still look too close to the edge, and suggested that further surface treatment may help the bottom building "pop out" more. He also added that the top busy horizontal/vertical lines could be simplified, and asked if the palette is an honest expression of materials. The applicant responded the stamped brick on the upper floors allows the project to create a more realistic look. Mr. Birkinbine then asked if the piers going down to the ground come out any further, and the applicant confirmed with piers made out of black steel. Mr. Birkinbine liked the piers, but asked how skate boarders will be discouraged from using them, and recommended changing the paving in front of them with gravel.

DRC member Smith indicated the new concept is much better than the one presented in July 2018, with the grid above being able to modulate scaling, with no more club on the roof, but now with a bar, forcing the need to incorporate more expression to the roof so it does not look so flat. Mr. Smith also mentioned the curved façade on the lower levels is what will bring people to the plaza, so appropriate lighting will be crucial, and the top of the curve will need to be more celebrated.

DRC Chair Gonzalez pointed out the Chicago School of Architecture façade made an impact, changing the whole area around it, from an industrial look with not much spatial feel, so his concern now is how lighting and landscaping are going to relate to the pedestrian pathways. Applicant indicated lighting and landscaping will be part of the plaza design.

DRC Chair Gonzalez made a motion to recommend the approval of the buildings part of the project, with a stipulation on landscaping and lighting in pedestrian areas, plaza and rooftop to be integrated and discussed at a later date with the Main Gate Design Review Committee. Motion was seconded by DRC member Miller. Motion was approved with 1 Nay (Mr. Williams) and 3 Ayes (Mr. Birkinbine, Mr. Gonzales, and Mr. Smith), with Mr. Smith excused because of other commitments and Mr. Warne and Ms. McCollumn recused.

4. Call to the Audience

No members of the audience spoke. Applicant just added that after the DRC meeting the project will move onto a Development Package stage and will come back to the DRC with the final design of public spaces.

5. Meeting Adjourned at 5:35 PM.