

2018

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT AND SUMMARY OF MINUTES

Thursday, September 13, 2018

**4th Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library, 101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ
85701**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:01 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Arthur Stables, Jim Sauer, Michael Becherer, Jill Jenkins, and Sharon Chadwick.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Helen Erickson

Staff: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, Allison Diehl, and Dan Bursuck (PDSD).

2. Approval of the Revised Legal Action Report (LAR) and Summary of Minutes for the Meeting(s) of 8-09-18

Motion by Commissioner Jenkins to approve the Revised Legal Action Report and Summary of the Minutes for the meeting of 8-09-18. Motion seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed unanimously. Voice Vote 6-0.

3. Courtesy Review Cases

Adobe Building Conversion: Garage/Storage/Office for restaurant (now vacant) to a new parking lot, Zoned C-3, located east of Casa Vicente-375 South Stone Avenue-Armory Park Historic District, Not in HPZ (Bill Mackey, Architect)

Project architect Bill Mackey, from Worker, Inc., presented the project.

Subcommittee asked for clarifications, and answers were provided. No action taken.

4. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/ Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

- a. **HPZ-18-53** – Lang Residence- New Room Addition - 627 South 9th Avenue - (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone).

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendations from the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) meetings of 7-16-18 and 8-20-18.

Project architect Rachel Serra, from RAS Architects, presented the project. The scope of work included the addition of a new bedroom on the ground floor, below the existing deck. The walls and roofing will all match the existing materials on the main house, painted stucco with a dash finish on block and rusted corrugated metal roofing. Windows are proposed to be wood clad casement.

The subcommittee discussed the proposed addition and asked for clarifications. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins to recommend approval of the project as submitted.

Motion passed unanimously. Voice Vote 6-0.

- b. **HPZ-18-69** – Chiquette Property - New Detached Accessory Structure-811 South 4th Avenue - (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the recommendations from the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) meeting of 6-18-18.

Property owner Fernando Chiquette presented the project.

The subcommittee had discussions and asked for clarifications. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables [and amended] to recommend approval of project as submitted, with the following conditions: (1) PRS concurs with recommendation from APHZAB condition that the overhang should fall within the wall/pillar caps by at least four inches (4"), (2) PRS concurs with recommendation from APHZAB that the duplicate north elevation as shown on the plans be amended to reflect a south elevation, and (3) motion amended to recommend that building setbacks be waived.

Amended Motion passed unanimously. Voice Vote 6-0.

5. Unified Development Code (UDC) Text Amendment Review Cases

UDC Section 3.7 for comments from Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission, Plans Review Subcommittee.

HPZ-18-74 Historic Preservation Zone Height Modification: Proposed Text Amendment to the UDC and Technical Standard Manual, to allow for modification of building heights within an HPZ (Citywide)

Staff Taku, Dan Bursuck, and Allison Diehl (PDSD) presented rationale for the amendment. Staff noted that this is in response to the removal of a property from West University HPZ and Armory Park HPZ in search of additional building height. Mayor and Council (M&C) amended the boundary of both HPZs. Given the difficulty of the process and concerns from the historic preservation community, M&C directed staff to initiate a text amendment process for a mechanism to adjust height in HPZs without amending the boundary. Staff described all steps and limited support from the Historic Zone Advisory Boards. Staff also stated that M&C directed staff to continue with current text amendment for consideration. The same map previously distributed to the Advisory Boards was provided to the PRS showing the areas where the Infill Incentive District overlaps HPZ boundaries. Vacant properties within the overlapping areas are highlighted on the map to show parcels that would be affected by the proposal.

Subcommittee asked questions to understand the benefits and impacts of the requested amendment on historic zones. There was a request for a return to advisory boards to discuss the possibility of revising the height limits to match the tallest contributor in each HPZ. At the request of the subcommittee, John Burr provided background on the text amendment request. The consensus was for more time to reflect prior to a formal vote.

Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to continue discussions at a future date to allow the subcommittee time to review the materials presented for the revisions to text amendment to the TSM on height.

Motion carried unanimously. Voice Vote 6-0.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

- a. Minor Reviews

Commissioner Jenkins and city staff conducted on-site reviews in West University on 8-31-18. New reviews are scheduled on 9-14-18 in Armory Park(HPZ-18-67; 72 & 73).

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

PDSD and City Attorney staffs are working with Code Enforcement on citation for demolition of a contributing property in the Barrio.

d. Review Process Issues

PDSD Training for Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) scheduled for 9-27-18 at 4pm at the Planning and Development Services Department, Public Works Building, 3rd floor conference room, 201 N. Stone Avenue. The training is open to the public, and all HZAB and PRS members are invited.

7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

John Burr informed PRS of a project by Rio Nuevo to enhance Armory Park with historic lights.

8. Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

New Addition & Proposed Wedding Venue (BH); Celtic Kitchen, Detached Accessory Carports/Porch; Enclosed Porch (WU); and New SFR; Historic Street lights (AP).

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:19 P.M.

2018

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, October 25, 2018

4th Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library, 101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ
85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:05 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair); Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson, Michael Becherer, Jill Jenkins, and Sharon Chadwick

Commissioner Absent/Excused: Arthur Stables

Staff: Taku Michael, Daniel Bursuck, and Jodie Brown (PDSD), and Alison Miller (Ward VI)

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) for the Meeting(s) of 10-11-18

Motion by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins [and amended] to recommend approval of the Legal Action Report with revisions to add votes on items #4 and #5 for the meeting of 10-11-18.

Amended Motion passed unanimously. Voice Vote 6-0

3. Unified Development Code (UDC) Text Amendment Review Cases

UDC Section 3.7 for comments from Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission, Plans Review Subcommittee.

HPZ-18-74 Historic Preservation Zone: UDC Text Amendment to the Technical Standard Manual (TSM) [Continued Case 9-13-18] - To allow for modification of building heights within an HPZ (Citywide)

Staff members Taku and Bursuck presented the changes to the amendment from the previous review. Staff noted the proposal was presented to the Planning Commission on 10-24-18 and was generally well received, but was awaiting a recommendation(s) from PRS. Staff

stated that the proposal was in response to the removal of a property from West University HPZ and Armory Park HPZ in search of additional building height. Mayor and Council (M&C) amended the boundary of both HPZs. Given the results from the Historic Zone Advisory Boards presentations (2 in favor and 2 opposed), M&C directed staff to continue preparing the amendment. Staff proposed changes include: (1) In lieu of 48 feet height limit, use tallest contributing structure in the HPZ, and (2) building height measured by HPZ standards not UDC height measurement standards. Staff outlined the next steps as a public hearing on 12-5-18 to coincide with the IID hearing and M&C for January 2019.

The subcommittee asked questions to understand the benefits and impacts of the requested amendment on historic zones. The consensus was to specify heights for the various HPZ in the text of the IID. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to recommend to the Planning Commission approval of the revisions to the text amendment to the TSM on height as presented with the following: adopt specific height for each HPZ; define height measurement; and PRS to be part of the review process.

Motion carried unanimously. Voice Vote 5-0. *Commissioner Sauer recused.

4. **National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) Nominations**

The Residential Design of Thomas Gist Houses in Southern Arizona: [1947-1981] - (Multiple Property Submission).

*Commissioner Sauer return to review deliberations.

Staff member Brown provided a summary of the nomination requested.

Subcommittee provided feedback.

The John C. Sievert House (Evaluated under the existing Residential Architecture of Josias Joesler and John and Helen Murphey: 1927-1956 Multiple Property Submission) - 1340 East 12th Street.

Staff member Brown provided a summary of the nomination requested.

Subcommittee provided feedback.

Sunshine Mile Historic District [Broadway Boulevard Commercial District] - Broadway Boulevard: Between Euclid and Country Club Road.

Staff member Brown provided a summary of the nomination requested.

Subcommittee provided feedback.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff member Taku and Commissioner Jenkins provided updates on reviews in Armory Park.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

None at this time.

d. Review Process Issues- Combined Training for ALL HZABs

Staff member Brown informed subcommittee members of an upcoming all Advisory Board members training that they were welcome to join. Once the date of the training is scheduled, they would be informed.

6. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

John Burr commended the subcommittee for its vote to move the text amendment forward; mentioned Armory Park Guidelines revision and bylaws.

7. Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

Marriot Residence Hotel; Celtic Kitchen Restaurant; Remodel (WU); Perimeter Wall, Wedding Venue (BH); Historic Lights and Zoning Violation (AP)

8. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:59 PM.