



Meeting Summary
BROADWAY BOULEVARD CITIZENS PLANNING TASK FORCE

November 8, 2012

5:30 p.m.

Child & Family Resources Angel Charity Building
 2800 East Broadway Boulevard
 Tucson, Arizona 85716

The Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force meeting summaries provide a brief descriptive overview of the discussions, decisions and actions taken at the meetings. The summary and the audio recording of the meeting comprise the official minutes of the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force Meeting.

Meeting summaries and audio recordings of the meetings are available online at the City Clerk's web page at:

<http://cms3.tucsonaz.gov/clerks/boards?board=100>.

Requests for CD copies of the audio recordings are taken by the City Clerk's Office at (520)791-4213.

MEETING RESULTS

1. Call to Order/Agenda Review

The meeting was called to order by Citizens Task Force (CTF) facilitator Nanci Beizer. A quorum was established and the agenda for the meeting was reviewed by Nanci Beizer.

Citizen Task Force Members

Present		Absent
Bob Belman	Farhad Moghimi	Steven Eddy
Michael Butterbrodt	Shirley Papuga	Dave Nasser*
Anthony R. DiGrazia	Elizabeth Scott	Jamey Sumner
Mary Durham-Pflibsen	Diane Robles	
Colby Henley		
Jon Howe		

**Mr. Nasser has resigned from the Citizens Task Force*

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

2. Existing Conditions Reports: Historic Buildings Inventory and Land Use, Urban Form, and Significant Structures

Project team members Phil Erickson (Community Design + Architecture), Phil Swaim and Laura Vertes (Swaim Associates Ltd), and Jonathan Mabry and Jennifer Levstik (for Tucson Historic Preservation Office) provided an overview of two reports commissioned for the project area to assess the current conditions. The presentation followed the general outline of the *Land Use, Urban Form, and Significant Structures Report*, addressing the following sections/topics for the project area, in order: an overview of the project area and general demographic characteristics garnered primarily from Census Data; existing land uses; a discussion of the urban form; an overview of the segments and subareas; and an analysis of the assets, needs and opportunities that exist.

The rankings of significant structures in the *Land Use, Urban Form, and Significant Structures Report* were determined through a two-tiered process: a historic buildings inventory (identifying historic status), and an assessment using six criteria developed by architects on the project team.

The first process, the historic buildings inventory, utilized the standards and guidelines set by the National Parks Service for listing properties on the National Register of Historic Places. Evaluations of each property adjacent to Broadway were performed by trained professionals on Arizona State Historic Property Inventory Forms to identify their status:

- currently historic (for example, a contributor to the pending Rincon Heights Historic District);
- potentially historic, as a contributor to a future historic district, or eligible to be listed individually on the National Register of Historic Places; or,
- currently ineligible, due to different reasons such as the building not being old enough, or having lost its historic fabric or historic integrity from alterations.

The results are included in a separate report, the *Phase I: Historic Buildings Inventory Report*.

The second process was an assessment developed for this project, and conducted by, trained architects. The assessment involved six criteria:

- *Design Quality (architectural significance, character-defining features, design integrity)*
- *Condition (assessed level of disrepair from visual inspection)*
- *Contribution to Streetscape (landscaping quality, shielding of parking, shade elements at sidewalks, interest of building design from the street)*
- *Site Functionality (assess both current function of site and future function if partial acquisition is required)*

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

- *Economic Value* (assess investment made into property, including successful renovations, construction, landscaping, building improvements; this did not look at revenue generated by the business)
- *Community Function* (based on use at the time of evaluation; assesses importance to surrounding communities as well as the difficulty of relocation)

Properties along Broadway were evaluated using forms and a ranking system of 1 (lowest) to 5 (highest). These results were analyzed, and it was ultimately decided that the primary criteria to help support an evaluation of a building as 'significant' was the design criteria.

The design assessments and rankings were merged with the historic status results, and the resulting maps are found in the Land Use, Urban Form, and Significant Structures Report.

Following the presentation the project team engaged the CTF in a discussion regarding the above mentioned topics. Listed below is a summary of the questions asked by the Task Force and project team responses.

CTF Questions

- Question regarding the scale that has been established for the ranking system (1-5) and how significance is rated: is a ranking of 1 high or low?
- Do you see what we have on Broadway in terms of historic and significant structures in other corridors?
- In regard to the study area on the map [in the *Land Use, Urban Form, and Significant Structures Report*], what are the project boundaries? What is the area?

Summarized Responses

- Regarding the scale that has been developed for the ranking system, a 5 is the highest ranking and 1 is the lowest.
- There is not the same concentration of historic commercial buildings on other corridors such as Speedway Boulevard or Grant Road. Broadway is unique in that regard.

The historic inventory represents a new standard for the City; it has never been done with this level of detail.

- I believe the study and project area extends a ¼ mile north and south of Broadway Boulevard. We will verify and come back to you with this information. (The project team will provide this information to the CTF.)

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

3. Introduction to Multi-modal Street Cross Section Elements and CTF Hands on Session

Phil Erickson gave a brief presentation introducing various multi-modal street cross-section elements to prepare the Task Force for a hands-on mapping exercise. The presentation gave the Task Force examples of what goes into the roadway design process and showed the different options they could explore when partaking in the exercise. These examples included bike lanes, transit lanes, traffic lanes, varying types of medians, and sidewalk and pedestrian improvements. Prior to the exercise, the Task Force had a few questions and comments regarding the activity. Listed below is a summary of their questions and the project team's responses.

CTF Questions and Comments

- What is the width of the existing street?
- Why partake in such an exercise?
- In response to the project team's comment that one reason to do this exercise is to help those that have never thought about the width of lanes on the road. The topic of lane widths comes up all the time at the Bicycle Advisory Committee's meetings, for example about the difference between an 11 foot and 13 foot traffic lane width. Or sidewalk widths - people in wheelchairs certainly notice the difference in widths of sidewalks. The public does think about such issues.

Summarized Responses

- The existing roadway is 75 feet at its narrowest point and has an average width of 85 feet throughout the current alignment.
- This will help to bring things to a tangible level and helps to explain what it means to design a roadway.
- The project team is interested in knowing what comes out of this and we may do a similar activity at our public open house.

At the conclusion of the presentation, the Task Force broke into two small groups and undertook the mapping exercise, which allowed them to design their ideal roadway. Listed below is a summary of the discussion that took place following the exercise.

CTF Questions and Comments

- This will take a lot of trial and error and we will need to revisit this process. Trying things out will become a part of the process and it will become iterative as we move along.
- There won't be one single solution for the entire corridor.
- We found that we can't have everything we want.

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

- We don't have enough information yet. Some of the gaps of information we have include: parking requirements; options for parking; the ability for the alignment to weave, bulge, or shrink the median along the alignment - not make it just one straight and uniform size.
- We need more information about parking, viability of businesses, and alternatives for business access.
- We need to know the alternatives for transit lanes.
- Transit lanes may not be on the same side of the road and may not be the same size for the entire alignment.
- The size of the bus pullouts are unknown for Bus Rapid Transit vehicles. I would like to know this information.
- Back to unknowns: depending on the occupant and their proximity to the road we don't know enough about how we build the road will impact them. It depends on the building's use. Just because the structure isn't torn down doesn't mean it will be useful to the occupants who currently use it.
- How does the width of the travel lane benefit traffic (in terms of calming or enhancing)? Can it be wider on one side of the alignment?
- There is no talk of bus pullouts and there unknown ramifications.
- What are the impacts to businesses that have to move, what is their success rate? What data exists for this and businesses lost during construction (the project team agreed to look into this data and follow-up with the CTF).
- We noticed to get everything in - sidewalk and pedestrian improvements, bike lanes and transit - implied impacts to something, somewhere. It is not possible with the standard width to not impact something.
- The bike facilities on Broadway are not ideal. We may want to look into allocating resources to create Bike Boulevards in the surrounding neighborhoods.
- You are going to tend to have more experienced bicyclists on Broadway who want 5 to 7 foot widths for the bike lanes. Cycle tracks and shared use lanes do not make sense with so many access points to businesses and residences along Broadway.
- I started this exercise like a deer in headlights but as we moved along I got more comfortable. I realized we couldn't have everything we wanted given the constraints we had.
- We started with a wish list and figured out quickly that what you may want and what's possible may be two different things.
- Where we ended up, we realized you couldn't do that same width all the way down the entire corridor.

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

- Would funding be provided if we designed parallel bike lanes to the neighborhoods or 6th Street? Would this be considered as part of the project? Would consolidated parking be funded? (The project team will get more information about what options exist.)

4. Roundtable

Nanci Beizer and Jenn Burdick led a roundtable discussion with the Task Force that covered many topics, including: the hands on mapping exercise and the information that was presented on the Historic Buildings Inventory and Land Use, Urban Form and Significant Structures report. The following is a summary of the comments made during the roundtable discussion:

- This was a good exercise; it was helpful and it would be helpful for the public to go through it as well.
- The team did a very good job on the reports, they are very helpful and I appreciate the effort put into them. I would like to see a presentation from Imagine Greater Tucson as a part of the Vision and Goals discussion.
- I would like to continue to talk about the aspects of urban form and what that means for the project and the projects relation to corridor expansion, businesses, and neighborhoods. At the end of the day, it is the impact on those of us who are living here (within the project corridor) that will make or break the project. We need to continue to talk about how we actually live and use these facilities.
- I appreciated learning about what makes a structure historical, that it is not just the structure, but the integrity of the design and the setting, and what is around it.
- This was an eye opening exercise. It is now time to go down Broadway and see where to expand. We need to figure out what we want and do it without impacting too many people, for example, just taking the right of way on one side. The road should "snake" around to fit it in with minimal impact.
- The information presented and the activity was useful.
- The activity was helpful, gave concreteness to the work and gave us good experience working with one another. Moving forward, we should include more activities that allow us to work with each other now so we can hear everyone's perspective. It is a good warm up for when the stakes are higher.
- This was a great exercise. I suggest that we revisit this later when we learn more and have more experience with each other and our stakeholders.
- It was great to interact with people in a different way. When we started our wish list we included everything people wanted and then scaled back and

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

starting tossing things out - we scaled back the first cross section we produced three times, each time narrowing the width down.

5. Next Steps

Jenn Burdick led a discussion regarding the upcoming November 10, 2012 CTF Workshop and public notice of invitation for the Tucson Modernism Week's Broadway Design Charrette; and the upcoming November 15, 2012 CTF Meeting. The meeting dates and agendas items were confirmed.

At the November 10, 2012 workshop the following topics will be covered:

- Task Force Lunch and General Discussion of Broadway Project, Tucson Modernism Week Design Charrette, and November 8, 2012 Hands-on Cross-Section Map Activity
- Bus Tour of the Broadway Corridor Project Area
- Debrief and Roundtable Conversation Regarding Bus Tour and Broadway Project

At the November 15, 2012 CTF Meeting the following topics will be covered:

- Review Public Input Report
- Review and Approve Proposed CTF Bylaws
- Introduction to Public Participation Report
- Follow-up Discussions and Questions on Study Session Topics
- Begin Drafting Vision and Goals Framework (Activity)

6. Call to the Audience

Two (2) members of the public filled out speakers cards and were called on to address the Task Force:

Laura Tabili - Ms. Tabili addressed the Task Force to go on record stating the Broadway Coalition's support for saving the First Assembly of God Church located on 1749 E. Broadway Boulevard. She urged the CTF to preserve the building when making their design recommendations for the project and a stated that a petition (which the CTF received at the October 4, 2012 meeting) with over 200 signatures has been presented to the Mayor and Council in support of preserving the building. Ms. Tabili concluded by stating that all historic buildings in the corridor need to be preserved and the best way to do it is within the existing Right-of-Way.

Gene Caywood - Mr. Caywood stated that the exercise the Task Force participated in was valuable and that it seemed like everyone got a lot out of it. Further, the exercise presented how hard the design process is. An issue you need to raise is can you fund transit and other ideas, for example, bike boulevards, outside of the corridor if it is recommended in your design concept. Mr. Caywood stated that if you are going to think outside of the box you need to make sure that the ideas you think of will be funded. This is why the Southern Arizona Transit Advocates (SATA) want transit on Broadway - this is the only area where funding is guaranteed.

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

Mr. Caywood went on to state that the City of Tucson does not have a mechanism to bring property owners together to accomplish consolidated parking. There is no policy, no funding, there is nothing and you will be wasting your time doing it unless you convince the Mayor and Council to adopt policy to enable it. It is going to take real people getting together in a real place and having real conversations to make this happen!

7. Adjourn

Nanci Beizer called meeting to a close at 8:05 p.m.

The presentations given at this meeting can be reviewed by visiting the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Task Force web page at:
<http://cms3.tucsonaz.gov/broadway/broadway-citizens-task-force>

This Meeting Summary was approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force on December 13, 2012.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.