



**Draft Meeting Summary
BROADWAY BOULEVARD CITIZENS PLANNING TASK FORCE**

February 6, 2014

5:30 p.m.

Child & Family Resources Angel Charity Building
2800 East Broadway Boulevard
Tucson, Arizona 85716

The Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force meeting summaries provide a brief descriptive overview of the discussions, decisions and actions taken at the meetings. The summary and the audio recording of the meeting comprise the official minutes of the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force Meeting.

Meeting summaries and audio recordings of the meetings are available online at the City Clerk's web page at:

<http://cms3.tucsonaz.gov/clerks/boards?board=100>.

Requests for CD copies of the audio recordings are taken by the City Clerk's Office at (520) 791-4213.

MEETING RESULTS

1. Call to Order/Agenda Review/Announcements

The meeting was called to order by Meeting Facilitator, Nanci Biezer. A quorum was established, brief announcements were made by the project team and handouts were distributed to the Task Force with supplemental information, and the agenda for the meeting was reviewed by Nanci Biezer.

Citizen Task Force Members

Present			Absent
Bob Belman	Naomi McIsaac		Dale Calvert
Michael Butterbrodt	Shirley Papuga		Anthony R. DiGrazia
Mary Durham-Pflibsen	Diane Robles		Colby Henley
Jon Howe	Jamey Sumner		Bruce Fairchild
Joseph Maher Jr.			

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

2. Approval of January 23, 2014 CTF Meeting Summary

The project team asked the Task Force for their approval of the January 23, 2014 CTF Meeting Summary. The Task Force tabled the approval of the meeting summary until the February 25, 2014 meeting to allow more time for review. All previous meeting summaries as well as up to date project information can found on the project's website: www.tucsonaz.gov/broadway.

3. Discuss/Approve Authoring a CTF Letter of Support for the Sunshine Mile Bond Project

At the January 23, 2014 CTF Meeting the Task Force requested a discussion to be held regarding authoring a letter of support for the Sunshine Mile Bond Project. The Task Force discussed the topic and approved the letter of support, to its general content and form. CTF Chair, Mary Durham-Pflibsen, volunteered to draft the letter and circulate it for review prior to submitting it to the City of Tucson Bond Projects Advisory Committee.

4. Call to the Audience

Two members of the public filled out speakers cards and were called on to address the Task Force:

Ron Spark

Thank you for the opportunity to speak, I am Ron Spark. I would like to thank the staff and your devoted task force for being committed, doing your homework and really trying to get a sense of what should happen on the Broadway Corridor.

I am here tonight to ask you to place an agenda item or action, to request from the City of Tucson and the RTA, to fund a formal transit study of the Broadway Corridor to give us comprehensive data so it could qualify for ADOT, FTA and other funding sources. Let's review what has happened in the past with the Broadway Corridor task force discussion. I think I heard that you all recognize the value of having a comprehensive transit study. So you have information that you could use as a basis to make an alignment.

That information should be gotten and studied before you decide on an alignment. So why is that? And what was the basis of the decision? Because you realize that choosing an alignment without this information might preclude some of the options for high capacity transit. We all know that Broadway deserves high capacity transit, but the worst part is that with all your work,

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

when that transit study comes through, and we know that it will eventually, it may undo or engineer-out all your hard work. So that's what you are facing. So that there is a certainty that that transit study will occur. So I think you agreed that you were interested in that and we heard from a TDOT person that said there was no money for this. As far as I know the RTA plan doesn't have any money for this, the City of Tucson says that they don't have any money. So what does that mean? Let's quickly review. Gene Caywood and I - and, full disclosure, I am part of the Southern Arizona Transit Advocates - presented to you a number of options, and one would be actually very little or minimal widening of Broadway to those that would have side transit or middle transit.

All these options were presented. So I am going to ask you, on what evidence based data expertise will you make a decision on your alignment and you need it. On the basis of that, Broadway Coalition asked Farhad to come and visit with us and as a derivative of our discussion, when we brought up that a transit study needed to be made before an alignment was assigned, he was very supportive. He said yes, this Broadway Citizens Task Force deserves having that study before you make a final alignment. He went on record before us and I am sure that he will verify that. So, in closing I would like you to set on your agenda next time to formally ask TDOT and RTA to fund a comprehensive transit study for the Broadway Corridor that would coincide with your assigning of a final alignment recommendation.

Laura Tabili

Hi it's me again, I just had one thing to say and, now I have two because, as always, things happen as soon as the meeting starts. I just want to talk about the first thing, which is that I understand that tonight's discussion is going to be about sidewalks, which are dear to my heart because I am a pedestrian. I just wanted to point out that we already have continuous sidewalks west of Campbell for pretty much the whole stretch; there are a couple of places where someone has run an asphalt paver across where the sidewalk ought to be. In general, there already are continuous sidewalks west of Campbell, so if it ain't broke, don't fix it. After I thought about that, I thought that should be the byword for the whole project: If it ain't broke, don't fix it. And, even beyond that: if it ain't broke, don't break it.

Then the second thing that just came up, is this idea that task force members comments appear in the written record (the public record) without their names on them and, of course, some of us like myself have nothing better to do than to come to all of these meetings every time and so when I read the transcript, I

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

know who made the comment. But, if somebody can't make it to the meeting and they would like to know whether their representative (if they are a stakeholder for a particular constituency) if they have a certain position that they may be taking. They can't tell if the names of the task force members aren't actually attached to the comments so that is just something that occurred to me so thank you very much for your time.

5. Public Input Report (updated for 11/23/2013-1/13/2014), and Reports on Project Presentations and Outreach

Jenn Toothaker, reviewed recent project presentations and project outreach, as well as the Public Input Report with the CTF. The report consisted of documentation of public input received from January 14, 2014 through January, 31 2014.

Panda Buffet Building Demolition at 2419 E. Broadway. Jenn provided a brief update from the following presentations that were made since the last CTF Meeting: *January 23, 2014 RTA Board Meeting and a January 30, 2014 UA Class Presentation.* Jenn also stated that a UA class will be assisting with the public process related to the demolition of 2419 E. Broadway property (Panda Buffet) and the post-demolition site treatment.

CTF Questions and Comments with Summarized Project Team Responses (Italicized)

- **Was it brought up that the post-demolition site treatment should be put on hold until the project is finalized? I think it is a waste of time and money to do something there if it is just going to get torn up again.**
That particular question was not raised but it may be brought up as we move forward. The UA students had great questions and are enthused to take part in the process.
- **The city spent \$840,000 on acquisition; that seems like quite a bit of money that could have gone somewhere else.**

The purchase was for more than the Panda Buffet restaurant building and property. It was actually for a total of 5 parcels: the building and all the surrounding asphalted parking lot.

January 23, 2014 RTA Board Meeting. Jim DeGroot shared that, at the January 23, 2014 RTA Board Meeting, the revenue forecast conducted by the Eller College of Business was discussed. This report highlighted that the economic downtown has had a negative impact on the revenue collected by the RTA. According to the report, there will be a \$342 million shortfall of the originally projected \$2.1 billion. RTA staff has been working with the

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

jurisdictions on how to best handle this projected shortfall. There have been several suggestions brought up, including, funding all of the roadway element projects and selectively funding the transportation element projects and limiting the funding of projects to just what their funding levels are in the RTA Plan (i.e. not spending more than what the plan states).

Additionally, we will be implementing a “build to budget” policy where scopes are refined to fit within the budget while not compromising the multi-modality of the project. This shortfall will have impacts on projects. We just do not know the extent of that yet.

CTF Questions and Comments with Summarized Project Team Responses
(Italicized)

- **If I remember correctly the budget for the Broadway project is \$72 million, will this still be available?**
The RTA is responsible for \$42 million for the Broadway project. The County will be putting up \$25 million and the City will contribute an additional \$3 million. I cannot speak to the other two funding sources but the \$42 million from the RTA will still be available.

6. Presentations and Discussion: ADA Compliance and Universal Design Considerations

This presentation allowed the project team an opportunity to raise awareness and engage the Task Force in a discussion regarding how design influences the way people experience their environments. City of Tucson Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Specialist, Martin DuPont, and University of Arizona Disability Resources Coordinator, Sherry Santee, presented. Examples and information regarding the ADA legislation provided minimum requirements, which must be followed. Universal Design creates environments that can be used by everyone, without adaptation. The following discussion took place after the presentation:

CTF Questions and Comments with Summarized Project Team Responses (Italicized)

- **What is the ADA minimum requirement for sidewalk widths?**
36 inches is the minimum requirement, but if the sidewalk is continuous you need a 5 foot by 5 foot area to facilitate passing and turning around after 200 feet; so, it makes sense to design the sidewalk to be at least 5 feet wide. (Note that the proposed ADA guidance for public rights of way, which should be in effect prior to the Broadway project construction requires a minimum width of 48 inches.)
- **The landscaped area of a walkway seems very rough for the visually impaired. What would be your recommendation for designing such an area?**

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTAmobility.com.

There are different ways to treat the landscaped area. What is important is that there is a noticeable barrier and the visually impaired realize there is a transition in the environment. You can do things such as place a grate, or rock, or even decomposed granite. It's the same concept as the truncated domes.

- **How does a visually impaired person know that there is a driveway?**

They know by the different cues when the environment changes. There could be a change in the slope or elevation of the walkway or a change in the material of the walkway, stamped concrete or a variation in the color. Truncated domes are only required for the right-of-way.

Other cities would put truncated domes of contrasting colors when there are changes in the walkway. Tucson feels that the approach of using domes only in right-of-way is ADA compliant. This is something we will have to talk about - when to use different treatments to alert the visually impaired of a change in the environment.

Other cities use such treatments as stamped concrete or contrasting colors.

- **With street crossings, does the sidewalk need to align with the opposite side?**

There is a new standard for sidewalks and crossings, the sidewalk needs to be in line with the crossing so it directs individuals into the crossing rather than the intersection or the street.

7. Approve Upcoming CTF Design Charrette Meeting Schedule

The project team presented a revised schedule of dates for an upcoming design charrette for the Task Force's consideration and asked for their approval of the dates. The Task Force approved the following schedule:

- Day 1: Tuesday, February 25, 2014 5:30 pm - 8:30 pm
- Day 2: Thursday, February 27, 2014 5:30 pm - 8:30 pm
- Day 3: Thursday, March 6, 2014 5:30 pm - 8:30 pm
- Day 4: Friday, March 7, 2014 3 pm - 6 pm

The revised charrette schedule will allow more time for:

- The planning team to present information
- The CTF to digest the information and receive clarifications
- The CTF to discuss, gain understanding of benefits and disadvantages of alternatives, and to have in-depth discussion to reach a consensus.

Project team member, Phil Erickson, also re-explained to the CTF what the goals for the Charrette are, including the following:

- Foster CTF dialogue to achieve consensus on:

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.

- The Street Design Concept Alternatives to take to the public workshop.
- What the CTF wants to hear from the public to help the CTF in selecting their recommended street design concept.
- Allow time for CTF members to briefly meet with stakeholders during and between meetings.

The following discussion took place during this agenda item:

CTF Questions and Comments with Summarized Project Team Responses (Italicized)

- **What is the approximate timeline for the next CTF meeting and then public meeting #4?**

Tentatively, the next CTF meeting after the charrette will be in late April and Public Meeting #4 will be in late May. The schedule will be determined by what comes out of the charrette.

- **Can we get any of the materials or information you are developing prior to the charrette. I know it is going to be a lot of information for us to digest - getting some of the materials prior to the meetings would help alleviate the crunch.**

Unfortunately, the project team is likely going to be working right up to the meetings on materials. However, we may be able to get you some things as they come out. We will certainly think about what materials we can get you beforehand and try to provide those to you.

- **Something I have been taking to my stakeholders about is getting an update on where we are at on the performance measures and other materials we have not revisited in a while. Especially if there have been changes made to these.**

We are actually in the process of developing a booklet for you to use during the Charrette. This booklet will have a single sheet on each of the performance measures that explains the performance measure, and the methodology behind the performance measure, and the assessment of the alternatives.

8. Presentation and Discussion: Introduction to Initial Analyses of Design Approaches and Other Tools to Help Mitigate Property Impacts and Acquisitions

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.

Two reports were distributed to the Task Force that document impacts and issues related to the improvement of the Broadway project area roadway. The first report details what the potential impacts would be by just adding sidewalk improvements to the project area. The second report focuses on parking and access issues created by improvements made to the project area, and potential roadway design and policy approaches that could resolve some of these issues. Project team member Michael Johnson from HDR, Inc. gave an overview of both reports. City of Tucson Deputy Director of Planning and Development Services, Jim Mazzocco, gave a brief presentation on zoning and City Code, as well as potential policy solutions that could change zoning allowances in the project area to mitigate property impacts. Additionally, Laura Vertes of Swaim and Associates Architects, presented initial design diagrams that illustrate some potential lot sizes in the project area and what could be built on them. These diagrams will be presented at the charrette with the alternative concepts. The project team members and the CTF engaged in a brief discussion, summarized below, during this agenda item.

CTF Questions and Comments with Summarized Project Team Responses (Italicized)

- How far away can remote parking be for your business?

By city code it can be as far away as 100 feet. But this calls into question the economic vitality of a business if all of the parking is 100 feet or more away.

I would like to interject about the acquisition process. The real estate department can only look at one parcel at a time because of the uniform act they follow. Many of the decisions come down to the individual level of what the property owner wants to do. They could see the viability of creating district parking but that's the risk. We cannot compel the conversation to happen between property owners.

Additionally, if a partial acquisition occurs to help create the shared parking, there still may be an assessment of damage - even though the property owner accepts the partial acquisition additional damages would have to be paid. This would be what we mentioned as a high risk plan - a high risk for acquisition.

The only way you know for sure that the building will be a full acquisition is if it is actually in the right-of-way. There are always a lot of variables to look at in the acquisition process.

The point of all of this is that we cannot know how the acquisitions are going to occur. All we can assess is the risk - this is what our evaluations of the assessments will utilize.

- Regarding curb cuts, I do not recall seeing how big they can be.

Openings (curb cuts) can be up to 35 feet wide.

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.

- How many properties are you going to be able to buy with \$42 million if you spent \$840,000 on just the Panda Buffet building?

We need to keep in mind that the City already owns 25% of the north side. Additionally, the Panda property cost was for purchasing parcels, not just the building.

- Is one side valued more than the other?

We do not know the answer to that at this point. When we initially went through the assessor data it appeared that the south side was worth more, but that includes the Safeway and other properties that won't really be impacted, so we really cannot answer that very well now.

- Is there a study that shows the taxes generated by each side of the road respectfully?

We did get some data regarding this in terms of property tax information recently and it will become part of the analysis.

Property tax and sales tax are not listed as performance measures that you all wanted analyzed as part of the assessment for the charrette. We could get property tax information but it would be hard to get at the detailed geography level for sales tax because it varies so much. It also is a privacy issue.

- I want to understand the lines correctly, what do the yellow lines represent?

The yellow line represents how far you would have to shift the roadway to be sure you do not impact the properties.

- What is the width of the road?

The alignments will show the widths of the roadway. There will be different widths at different locations but these maps and the yellow lines will help guide us as we look at things.

You need to look at the two sides on the map isolated from each other. The detailed alignment drawings will show the width of the roadway.

So this is just describing a base parameter that we are using to guide the alignment, but it is only looking at the full alignment to get the complete picture of the risk for acquisition.

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.

- Either way, if the road is not widened but the asphalt is repaired in the future it will require infrastructure improvements to meet ADA compliance.

Yes and it would be much more expensive than a typical maintenance project due to this. It's a serious issue and we do not know when this would happen. It could be between 5 and 25 years from now but I expect it to be closer to 5 because when we design new roadways the asphalt is only meant to last 20 years and the asphalt on this stretch of Broadway has been there much longer than that.

There was a ruling that just came out by the Department of Justice that stated even if you just do resurfacing, that it would trigger the need to install compliant pedestrian facilities (sidewalks or paths).

- Can you clarify what you mean by acquisition? You stated that there is a potential for 42 historic or potentially historic buildings to be acquired if you were just to install the sidewalks but I am not really sure what you mean by acquisition.

If a building were to be acquired it means that the City owns it and would then become the manager of the property and we would have to look into what we would do with the property. Because RTA funding would be used to acquire the property, the sale of the remnant property would go back to the RTA coffers, but there is no clear indication if the building would be demolished or not. We would not know this until after the final construction plans are drawn. We do know that RTA funding would not be available for maintaining the property.

- I may be remembering wrong but I thought that if the road was widened to the north and properties were acquired the setback would be 60 feet deep.

The remnant parcels would be of varying depths depending of the alignment. We will have diagrams at the charrette that show these depths and the alignment they correlate with.

9. Call to the Audience

Two members of the public filled out speakers cards and were called on to address the Task Force:

Laura Tabili

Mrs. Tabili ceded her time and did not speak.

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.

Gene Caywood

Mr. Caywood ceded his time and did not speak. However, Mr. Caywood made the suggestion that, in the future, the second call to the audience should take place after the presentations in the case that anything comes up that we would like to comment on.

10. Next Steps/Roundtable

The roundtable presents an opportunity for the Task Force to provide feedback on any aspect of the meeting or the project in general. During the next steps, the project team reconfirmed the dates for the design charrette and listed the potential agenda topics. The discussion listed below occurred during this agenda item.

CTF Questions and Comments with Summarized Project Team Responses (Italicized)

What was presented during the call to the audience - doing a comprehensive transit study; it seems that the consideration of transit is a big part of what we are doing. How long would a study like that take if it was funded? Can we, as the CTF, request that this be done (if the data is available and fits in our time frame for making a decision)? *The project team responded that the extensiveness of such a study may be cost prohibitive and would not be able to be done in enough time for the Task Force's purposes. However, there is existing data that it might be possible to use to generate a report. The project team will discuss this with the RTA.*

To piggyback on that, if the RTA does not have the funding for that, can we go on as a collective body and make a recommendation that this is important for the future of Broadway and should be done. *The project team responded that the Task Force can absolutely make that recommendation and suggest that.*

11. Adjourn

Nanci Beizer called meeting to a close at 9:05 p.m.

The presentations given at this meeting can be reviewed by visiting the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Task Force web page at:

<http://cms3.tucsonaz.gov/broadway/broadway-citizens-task-force>

This Meeting Summary has not yet been approved by the Broadway Boulevard Citizens Planning Task Force.

This project is funded by the City of Tucson, Pima County and the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA), and is part of the voter-approved, \$2.1 billion RTA plan that will be implemented through 2026. Details about the plan are available at www.RTA mobility.com.