City of Tucson, Arizona Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures Biennial Certification of Land Use Assumptions, Infrastructure Improvement Plan and Impact Fees

for the Period July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2018

CITY OF TUCSON, ARIZONA TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
Independent Accountant's Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures	1
Results of Procedures	3
Appendix – Schedule of Project Expenditures – Budget Basis	10



INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council City of Tucson, Arizona

We have performed the procedures enumerated below, on the City of Tucson, Arizona's (City) application of requirements as set forth in Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) 9-463.05.G.2 "to provide for a biennial certified audit of the municipality's land use assumptions, infrastructure improvements plan and development fees". Such procedures, which were agreed to by the management of City of Tucson, Arizona, were performed to assist management in evaluating the City's compliance with the progress reporting requirements of the infrastructure improvement plan for the period from July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2018, as specified in A.R.S. 9-463.05.G.2. Management is responsible for the City of Tucson, Arizona's compliance with those requirements. The sufficiency of these procedures is solely the responsibility of those parties specified in this report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

We have applied the following procedures:

- 1. Compare growth projections to include square footage of buildings, housing units, population and employment, as reported in the Land Use Assumptions Final Report dated July 29, 2014, to actual current amounts for the proportionate 10-year projections. A list of all variances will be reported.
- 2. Select a sample of 60 building permits issued and determine fees were charged in accordance with authorized fee schedules and that each permit holder is charged the same rate as another equivalent permit holder.
- 3. Select a sample of 60 expenditures and determine that the expenditure was associated with an approved project in the City's IIPs.
- 4. Evaluate any inequities in implementing the plan or imposing the development fee through recalculating impact fees at the transaction level for the sample mentioned in procedure 2 above.

5. Obtain the fiscal year 2017 and 2018 Schedule of Project Expenditures – Budget Basis (see Appendix) from the City-prepared Annual Development Impact Fees Report documenting the progress of each project identified in the Infrastructure Improvement Plans (IIPs) and agree expenditures to the underlying accounting records.

The accompanying Results of Procedures describes the items we noted.

This agreed-upon procedures engagement was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. We were not engaged to, and did not, conduct an examination or review, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion on the City's compliance with the requirements described above. Accordingly, we do not express such an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the management of City of Tucson, Arizona, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

Heinfeld, Meech & Co., P.C.

Heinfeld, melch & Co., P.C.

Tucson, Arizona January 8, 2019

PROCEDURE NO. 1

Compare growth projections to include square footage of buildings, housing units, population and employment, as reported in the Land Use Assumptions Final Report dated July 29, 2014, to actual current amounts for the proportionate 10-year projections. A list of all variances will be reported.

Exception:

Variances were noted for square footage, housing units, and population growth as reported in the Land Use Assumptions Final Report when compared to actual results. In addition, the City did not maintain a list of employment growth by service area.

Management Response:

By State Statute ARS 9-463.05 the City Of Tucson is required to update the Land Use Assumptions Report at least every five years and not on an annual or biennial basis. The City will update the report with current data, including employment growth, keeping in compliance with what is required by the State of Arizona. Assumptions of equal growth of land development and the resulting fees averaged over a set period of time do not reflect the reality of how development occurs. Variances should be expected for a number of reasons: the state of the economy, actual market conditions versus projected market conditions, and the demand and availability of different types of land use.

SQUARE FOOTAGE OF BUILDINGS

Note: The projected amounts for square footage growth assume equal growth for each year of the 10-year period.

NOTIFICE AT THE HEAVE SHAPE WAS DESCRIBED.	2	2017	War West Hill Commission Co.	
	Projected	Actual	Variance	Variance %
Retail	-	<u></u>		
Central	138,000	7,698	(130,302)	-94%
East	78,200	6,014	(72,186)	-92%
Southeast	177,000	1,078	(175,922)	-99%
Southlands	12,300		(12,300)	-100%
West	55,300	5,700	(49,600)	-90%
Office				
Central	311,800	69,596	(242,204)	-78%
East	243,300	8,883	(234,417)	-96%
Southeast	521,200	1,445	(519,755)	-100%
Southlands	66,300		(66,300)	-100%
West	138,400	8,575	(129,825)	-94%
Industrial				
Central	57,100	15,054	(42,046)	-74%
East	37,900	9,354	(28,546)	-75%
Southeast	816,400	29,400	(787,000)	-96%
Southlands	83,100		(83,100)	-100%
West	1,064,400	30,707	(1,033,693)	-97%

PROCEDURE NO. 1 (Continued)

SQUARE FOOTAGE OF BUILDINGS

1	2	018	11 1	
	Projected	Actual	Variance	Variance %
Retail				
Central	138,000	19,167	(118,833)	-86%
East	78,200	18,900	(59,300)	-76%
Southeast	177,000	16,923	(160,077)	-90%
Southlands	12,300	25,175	12,875	105%
West	55,300	27,771	(27,529)	-50%
Office				
Central	311,800	22,063	(289,737)	-93%
East	243,300	22,821	(220,479)	-91%
Southeast	521,200		(521,200)	-100%
Southlands	66,300		(66,300)	-100%
West	138,400	3,218	(135, 182)	-98%
Industrial				
Central	57,100	49,180	(7,920)	-14%
East	37,900	50,241	12,341	33%
Southeast	816,400		(816,400)	-100%
Southlands	83,100		(83,100)	-100%
West	1,064,400	90,152	(974,248)	-92%

PROCEDURE NO. 1 (Continued)

HOUSING UNITS AND POPULATION BY SERVICE AREA

Note: The projected amounts for housing units and population assume equal growth for each year of the 10-year period with the incremental total presented for each year.

	2	017		
	Projected	Actual	Variance	Variance %
Multi-				
Family/Apartments				
Central	318	102	(216)	-68%
East	103		(103)	-100%
Southeast	232	38	(194)	-84%
Southlands	5		(5)	-100%
West	168		(168)	-100%
Condo/Townhome				
Central	100		(100)	-100%
East	85		(85)	-100%
Southeast	138		(138)	-100%
Southlands	6		(6)	-100%
West	65		(65)	-100%
Single Family				
Central	261	186	(75)	-29%
East	401	96	(305)	-76%
Southeast	938	257	(681)	-73%
Southlands	19	30	11	58%
West	219	122	(97)	-44%
Resident Population				
Central	157,785	152,369	(5,416)	-3%
East	178,984	172,840	(6,144)	-3%
Southeast	72,811	70,312	(2,499)	-3%
Southlands	16,104	15,551	(553)	-3%
West	124,758	120,475	(4,283)	-3%

PROCEDURE NO. 1 (Continued)

HOUSING UNITS AND POPULATION BY SERVICE AREA

= =	20	18		
	Projected	Actual	Variance	Variance %
Multi-				
Family/Apartments				
Central	318	16	(302)	-95%
East	103	4	(99)	-96%
Southeast	232		(232)	-100%
Southlands	5		(5)	-100%
West	168	2	(166)	-99%
Condo/Townhome				
Central	100		(100)	-100%
East	85	2	(83)	-98%
Southeast	138		(138)	-100%
Southlands	6		(6)	-100%
West	65		(65)	-100%
Single Family				
Central	261	73	(188)	-72%
East	401	134	(267)	-67%
Southeast	938	211	(727)	-78%
Southlands	19	29	10	53%
West	219	64	(155)	-71%
Resident Population				
Central	159,090	153,009	(6,081)	-4%
East	180,289	173,397	(6,892)	-4%
Southeast	75,748	72,852	(2,896)	-4%
Southlands	16,169	15,551	(618)	-4%
West	125,672	120,868	(4,804)	-4%

EMPLOYMENT BY SERVICE AREA

Note: The projected amounts for employment growth assume equal growth for each year of the 10-year period.

	2	017	* * *	
	Projected	Actual	Variance	Variance %
Industrial				
Central	23		(23)	-100%
East	15		(15)	-100%
Southeast	327		(327)	-100%
Southlands	33		(33)	-100%
West	426		(426)	-100%
Office				
Central	780		(780)	-100%
East	608		(608)	-100%
Southeast	1,303		(1,303)	-100%
Southlands	166		(166)	-100%
West	346		(346)	-100%
Retail				
Central	230		(230)	-100%
East	130		(130)	-100%
Southeast	295		(295)	-100%
Southlands	21		(21)	-100%
West	92	*	(92)	-100%

P	2	018	r i	
	Projected	Actual	Variance	Variance %
Industrial				
Central	23		(23)	-100%
East	15		(15)	-100%
Southeast	327		(327)	-100%
Southlands	33		(33)	-100%
West	426		(426)	-100%
Office				
Central	780		(780)	-100%
East	608		(608)	-100%
Southeast	1,303		(1,303)	-100%
Southlands	166		(166)	-100%
West	346		(346)	-100%
Retail				
Central	230		(230)	-100%
East	130		(130)	-100%
Southeast	295		(295)	-100%
Southlands	21		(21)	-100%
West	92		(92)	-100%

PROCEDURE NO. 2

Select a sample of 60 building permits issued and determine fees were charged in accordance with authorized fee schedules and that each permit holder is charged the same rate as another equivalent permit holder. Any waivers of fees will be reported investigated for proper authorization.

No exceptions noted.

PROCEDURE NO. 3

Select a sample of 60 expenditures and determine that the expenditure was associated with an approved project in the City's IIPs.

No exceptions noted.

PROCEDURE NO. 4

Evaluate any inequities in implementing the plan or imposing the development fee through recalculating impact fees at the transaction level for the sample mentioned in procedure 2 above.

No exceptions noted.

PROCEDURE NO. 5

Obtain the fiscal year 2017 and 2018 Schedule of Project Expenditures – Budget Basis (see Appendix) from the City-prepared Annual Development Impact Fees Reports documenting the progress of each project identified in the Infrastructure Improvement Plans (IIPs) and agree expenditures to the underlying accounting records.

No exceptions noted.

APPENDIX

Development Impact Fees

Schedule B: Schedule of Project Expenditures - Budget Basis Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2017 (Unaudited)

Program Area	Fund Project		Location	Expenditures	
Streets					
West District	063				
		Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	\$ 504,427	
		Sunset: Silverbell to I-10 to River	Sunset: Silverbell to I-10 to River	1,663,917	
East District	064				
		Houghton Road/Broadway	Houghton Road/Broadway	(128,680)	
		Intersection Improvements			
		Houghton Road: 22nd Street to	Houghton Road: 22nd Street to	75,761	
		Irvington	Irvington		
Central District	065		-		
		22nd: I-10 to Kino	22nd: I-10 to Kino	42697	
		Grant: Oracle to Stone	Grant: Oracle to Stone	25878	
West District	033				
		Irvington Road - 5CR to I-19	Irvington Road - SCR to I-19	240,236	
		Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	1,393,602	
		Sunset: Silverbell to I-10 to River	Sunset: Silverbell to I-10 to River	336,083	
East District	034				
		Houghton Road/Broadway	Houghton Road/Broadway	2,892,678	
		Intersection Improvements			
		Speedway: Camino Seco to	Speedway: Camino Seco to	47,360	
		Houghton	Houghton		
Central District	035				
		Arroyo Chico, MUP, Tucson Blvd.	Arroyo Chico/ Tucson Blvd.	464	
Southeast District	036				
		Valencia; Alvernon to Kolb	Valencia; Alvernon to Kolb	88	
		Houghton Road: Irvington to	Houghton Road: Irvington to	241,458	
		Valencia	Valencia		
			Streets Total	\$ 7,335,969	

Development Impact Fees

Schedule B: Schedule of Project Expenditures - Budget Basis Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2017 (Unaudited)

Program Area	Fund	Project	Location	Ехре	enditures
Parks					
West District	063				
		Christopher Columbus Park	4600 N Silverbell Rd - 85745	\$	7,7 7 0
		Expansion	45555 1 61 11 01 1 05743		
F . D'	064	San Juan Park	1665 S. La Cholla Blvd - 85713		600
East District	064	Areadia Dark Dhasa I	N. Araadia Aug		0.4
		Arcadia Park - Phase I Parks Strategic Plan	N Arcadia Ave N/A		94
Central District	065	Parks Strategic Flair	N/A		2 3,344
Cellifal District	003	Limberlost Family Park ADA and	4255 N. 4th Avenue - 85705		10,404
		Pathway Project	4255 W. 401 AVENUE - 05705		10,404
		Reid Park Expansion - Phase I	1100 S. Randolph Way - 85713		9,928
Southeast District	066				3,520
		Purple Heart Park Expansion	10050 E. Rita Road - 85747		2,800
West District	033				HOLL ♥ 1752 ESCHOL
		A Mountain Improvement	A Mountain		22,434
		Kennedy Park	3700 S. Mission Road - 85713		3,193
East District	034				
		Jesse Owens Park	400 S. Sarnoff Drive - 85710		6,574
Central District	035				
		Arroyo Chico Urban Path	Reid Park to Santa Cruz River Park		6,929
Couthant District	036				
Southeast District	036	Groves Park Playground Project	7400 E. Juniper Drive - 85730		15,564.00
		Groves Fark Flayground Froject	7400 E. Juniper Drive - 83730		13,304.00
		Lakeside Park Improvements	8201 E. Stella Road - 85730		4,260.00
		Lincoln Park Playground	4325 S. Pantano Road - 85730		13,885.00
		Purple Heart Park Expansion	10050 E. Rita Road - 85747		3,995.00
		,	Parks Total	\$	131,774
Police					
Police	031			\$	-0-
			Police Total	\$	-0-
Fire				***************************************	
Fire	032			\$	-0-
THE	032		Fire Total	\$	-0-
Market III Comment of the Comment of			1110,000		
Public Facilities		The Manager of the Company of the Manager of the Ma			
Public Facilities	023		5 116 politica month	\$	-0-
			Public Facilities Total	\$	-0-
			Grand Total	\$	7,467,743

Development Impact Fees

Schedule B: Schedule of Project Expenditures - Budget Basis Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2018 (Unaudited)

Program Area	Fund	Project	Location	Expenditures
Streets				
West District	063			
		Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	\$ 39,666
		Sunset: Silverbell to I-10 to River	Sunset: Silverbell to I-10 to River	
East District	064			
		Valencia; Alvernon to Kolb	Valencia; Alvernon to Kolb	19,134
		Houghton Road/Broadway	Houghton Road/Broadway	7,134
		Intersection Improvements		
		Houghton Road: 22nd Street to	Houghton Road: 22nd Street to	593,501
		Irvington	Irvington	
		Broadway Camino Seco to	Broadway; Camino Seco to	10,490
		Houghton	Houghton	
Central District	065			
		Broadway: Euclid to Country Club	Broadway: Euclid to Country Club	1,881,996
		22nd: I-10 to Kino	22nd: I-10 to Kino	1,214,187
		Grant: Oracle to Stone	Grant: Oracle to Stone	2,080,701
Southeast District	066			
		Houghton Road: Union Pacific	Houghton Road: Union Pacific	
		Railroad to I-10	Railroad to I-10	584
		Houghton: Valencia to Mary Ann	Houghton: Valencia to Mary Ann	
		Cleveland	Cleveland	13,909
West District	033			
		Irvington Road - SCR to I-19	Irvington Road - SCR to I-19	646,262
		Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	Silverbell Road: Grant to Ina	721,514
East District	034			
		Houghton Road/Broadway	Houghton Road/Broadway	917
		Intersection Improvements		
Central District	035			
				259,565
		Broadway: Euclid to Country Club	Broadway: Euclid to Country Club	
		Grant: Oracle to Stone	Arroyo Chico/ Tucson Blvd.	712,651
Southeast District	036			
		Valencia; Alvernon to Kolb	Valencia; Alvernon to Kolb	111,334
		Houghton Road: Irvington to	Houghton Road: Irvington to	355,115
		Valencia	Valencia	
			Streets Total	\$ 8,668,662

Development Impact Fees

Schedule B: Schedule of Project Expenditures - Budget Basis Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2018 (Unaudited)

Program Area	Fund	Project	Location	Expenditures
Parks				
West District	063			
		San Juan Park	1665 S. La Cholla Blvd - 85713	\$ 2,532
East District	064			
		Jesse Owens Park	400 S. Sarnoff Drive - 85710	408,033
Central District	065	12-1-1-15-11-0-1-404-1	4255 N. All A	
		Limberlost Family Park ADA and	4255 N. 4th Avenue - 85705	2.410
		Pathway Project	1100 S. Randolph Way - 85713	3,418
West District	033	Reid Park Expansion - Phase I	1100 S. Kandolph Way - 85/13	56,038
West District	033	Christopher Columbus Park	4600 N Silverbell Rd - 85745	29,277
		Expansion	4000 N Silverbell Na US745	23,211
		San Juan Park	1665 S. La Cholla Blvd - 85713	32,987
		Lakeside Park Improvements	8201 E. Stella Road - 85730	347
		Cherry Avenue Improvements	5085 S. Cherry Avenue - 85706	1,126
East District	034	,		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
		Jesse Owens Park	400 S. Sarnoff Drive - 85710	367,210
Central District	035			
		Silverlake Park	1575 E. 36th Street - 85713	8,694
		Reid Park Expansion - Phase I	1100 S. Randolph Way - 85713	46,472
		Limberlost Family Park ADA and	4255 N. 4th Avenue - 85705	125,037
		Pathway Project		
		Himmel Park Improvements	1000 N. Tucson Blvd - 85716	34,459
		Arroyo Chico Urban Path	Reid Park to Santa Cruz River Park	
Southeast District	026			368
Southeast District	036	Croups Park Playground Project	7400 E. Juninos Drivo 95720	172 467
		Groves Park Playground Project Lakeside Park Improvements	7400 E. Juniper Drive - 85730 8201 E. Stella Road - 85730	172,467
		Lincoln Park Playground	4325 S. Pantano Road - 85730	15,921 211,778
		Purple Heart Park Expansion	10050 E. Rita Road - 85747	54,548
		r di pie riear (i ark Expansion	Parks Total	\$ 1,570,709
			1 3110 7 5 31	
Police		D. I.A.: C.	40016 5 1 1 2574	
Police	031	Park Ajo Communication Center	4004 S. Park Avenue - 85714	70,457
		Expansion	Police Tota	al \$ 70,457
	*********			70,137
Fire	022	Park Ajo Communication Center	4004 C Paul A	A 77 C
Fire	032	Expansion	4004 S. Park Avenue - 85714	9,776
		Expansion	Fire Tota	al \$ 9,776
			THE FOR	3,770
Public Facilities	000			<i>k</i> -
Public Facilities	023		Public Facilities Total	\$ -0-
			Tablic Facilities Total	\$ -0-
			Grand Total	\$ 10,319,604