



Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board
Tuesday, May 3, 2022, at 7:00PM
Virtual Meeting

Meeting Minutes/Legal Action Report—DRAFT

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Members Present: Michael Bell, Elaine Hill (Co-Chair), Mary Lou Fragomeni, Carol Maywood, and Chris Jech (Co-Chair)

City Staff Present: Jodie Brown

Guests Present: David Pietz, Rishi Madhvani, Drew Cook, Dave Sherwood, Steve Bohn, Debra Lazar, Corky Poster, Philip Zimmerman, Steve Horn, Richard Bierce, Linda Whitaker, and Jasmine Chan.

A quorum was established, and the meeting was called to order at 7:00PM.

1. Approval of Minutes/LAR: January 25, 2022

It was noted that there were some corrections needed in the Minutes/LAR. The corrections were noted under item 3b and included a typo on roof, that the driveway needs gravel, and that it is the stucco that needs repair and not the adobe. A motion to approve the Minutes/LAR with the corrections was made by Fragomeni and seconded by Jech. The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

2. Reviews

a. HPZ 22-035, 5440 E Presidio (T21CM07764/T22SA00197)

Construction of new pergola, rear yard gate, front door on main house and windows at front entrance.

Full Review/Non-Contributing Historic

Steve Bohn, the architect, presented the project.

Board members had a number of questions/comments about the proposed project.

- Will the pergola be visible to the neighbor?
 - You may see it depending on how far back you are.
- Is there an elevation difference between the buildings where the pergola spans?
 - The house is 1' above the guest house.
- Elevation shows there is a slope, how will it be addressed?
 - We will taper it down gently.
- Are there any round posts in the neighborhood?

- Round poles were shown previously on the guest house and now you are recommending a change?
- Are you now moving the sahuaro?
 - Correct, off to the side.
- Do you have the door or is this a picture of one that you like?
 - It is one that we like. We plan to have it custom built.
- Does the gate adjoin a wall?
 - No, it is just a 6" square post.
- Are there any plans for a future wall?
 - No.
- The faux vegetation scene on the gate is not something that you see in the historic district.
 - The house down the street has a similar design. We can agree to simplify it.
- Based on the porch posts on the guesthouse, are they different than the main house?
 - Yes.
- Will you be using flagstone everywhere?
 - It is currently on the decking and porch walkway. It seemed to be fitting to have it for the porch caps. (A board member recommended using brick for the cap. Other members felt that the flagstone was appropriate given the extensive use.)
- Would you consider changing the exterior color?
 - No, it was not required in the Decision Letter.

Fragomeni made a motion to recommend approval with several conditions that included that the posts on the guesthouse are square, rusticated and with a base topped with flagstone, that the drainage will continue with a gentle slope, and that if the applicant is unable to get the design proposed for the door they will return for a Minor review. The motion was seconded by Jech. The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

b. HPZ 22-036, 2900 N Craycroft (T22CM02664/T22SA00198)

Exterior façade repair at the commissary building and museum building.
Full Review/Individually Listed on National Register, Historic Landmark

The project was presented by Jasmine Chan, Corky Poster and Drew Cook.

The board members had several questions/comments.

- Will you remove the stucco to repair?
 - The cracks will be repaired. We will remove the loose stucco then skim coat with lime stucco.
- What about the damaged adobe?
 - We will repair with like adobe.
- Will the whole commissary get a skim coat?
 - Yes.
- Will you be abandoning the swamp coolers?
 - Yes, we will be using mini-splits, and nothing will be on the roof.
- Will the concrete be colored?

- They will all be grey.
- Will you be trimming any of the vegetation?
 - Along Craycroft that is damaging the walls.
- Will there be any electrical work done?
 - Yes, will update the panel and the feeder so in case of fire it can be turned off.
- Will it be underground?
 - Yes.
- I thought it would be a good idea to tear down the existing museum building and rebuild it where it was historically, but I like how it is being handled.
- I am delighted that the city is getting around to addressing these structures.
- The metal roofs are being replaced with a white roofing material on the commissary, will it be noticeable?
 - No.
- Do we know the age of the metal roof?
 - No.

A motion was made Jech to recommend the project for approval as presented. The motion was seconded by Fragomeni. The motion was approved 4-0-1 (Maywood was unable to unmute).

c. HPZ 21-078, 5310 E Placita de Mesquite (T21CM08138)

Construct new single-story single-family home.

Full Review/Vacant Lot

At the request of Co-Chair Hill, staff read a public comment from Philip Zimmerman into the record who was concerned about the proposed new construction's impact on the existing neighborhood.

The project was presented by Rishi Madhvani.

Co-Chair allowed members of the public to speak on the project.

Philip Zimmerman

- Concerned about the proposed size.
- None of the existing houses have three car garages.
- The house façade does not look like any of the houses in the neighborhood.
- If the façade is integrated better, it would be an improvement.

Dave Sherwood

- Concerned about the size.
- The proposed house just doesn't fit.
- Look to alternatives to fit into the existing neighborhood.

Board members also had a number of comments/questions.

- The landscape plan should include the trail easement.
- The design does not take advantage of the view.

- Need to see the NPPO to understand the species and what is remaining on the site.
- Need to see the Zoning comments.
- The wash ordinance and drainage need to be addressed.
- The new perimeter wall encroaches on the trail easement.
- Heights have to be addressed considering that you are bringing in fill.
- The garages should be recessed from the front façade.
- Concerned about the wainscoting with adobe on the bottom and stucco on the top. This is not something this is seen on the other houses on the street.
- The coping on the roof line needs to match what is being used in the neighborhood.
- The windows should be casements.
- The corners on the house should be rounded.
- The site plan should show which trees are proposed for removal.
- The porch design is not appropriate. To be consistent, it should be sloped with wood beams. Porches in the neighborhood have the appearance of being added on, they are not integrated into the design.
- Other minor details should also be addressed i.e. caps, divided light, etc.
- This is a historic district, so the other facades should also be addressed as they are visible from the walking trail.
- Large picture windows are not appropriate in the historic district.

It was suggested that the applicant review all of the comments and return for a courtesy review.

A motion to continue the item to allow the applicant to redesign the project based on the comments was made by Fragomeni. The motion was seconded by Jech and passed with a vote of 5-0.

3. Elections

A motion was made by Bell to retain the current officers (Hill and Jech as Co-Chairs). The motion was seconded by Jech. The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

4. Fort Lowell Historic Zone Inventory Discussion

Co-Chair Hill gave an update on the inventory discussion.

5. Call to the Audience

The comments that were received were read during the item.

6. Staff Updates

Staff updated the board members on the Historical Commission separation and code update.

7. Future Agenda Items—Information Only

No updates.

8. Adjournment

Jech made a motion to adjourn the meeting which was seconded by Fragomeni. The motion passed with a vote of 5-0. The meeting was adjourned at 9:24PM.