

2019

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, May 9, 2019

**Basement (Lower Level) Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ 85701**

1. **Call to Order and Roll Call**

Meeting called to order at 1:02 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Jim Sauer, Michael Becherer, Helen Erickson, Jill Jenkins, and *Sharon Chadwick (**arrived 1:10 P.M.**)

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Arthur Stables

Staff Members Present: Jodie Brown, Michael Taku, Carolyn Laurie, and Andrew Connor (PDSD)

2. **Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 4-25-19**

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0, to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 4-25-19.

3. **Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/ Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

HPZ-19-29 – New Single Family Residence. Revision to an approved design with changes to the overall height of the main house and the new accessory structure – 575 S Main Avenue - (Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone)

*Commissioner Chadwick arrived at 1:10 PM

Staff Brown and Taku summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) meeting of 4-8-19.

Property owners Paolo de Lorenzo and Claudia Valent presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval of the project as presented.

HPZ-19-33- Install accordion-style windows at the east patio—865 E. University - (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Brown summarized the project and the review process. Staff read into the record the recommendation from the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) meeting of 4-16-19.

Project architect Chuck Meyer from CMA Architect, LLC presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 6-0 to recommend approval of the revisions to the project as presented.

4. Infill Incentive District/Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases
UDC Sections 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

IID-17-01//HPZ-19-34 – La Placita- Rehabilitation of the existing historic building. Construction of a new theatre addition-110 S. Church Avenue - (Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District)

Staff Brown and Connor summarized the project and the review process.

Project architect Tazmine Khatri, from Motley Design Group, LLC along with Teresa Vasquez, from HSL Properties, presented the project.

Discussion was held. The subcommittee expressed concerns about mechanical equipment being visible on the roof of the historic building. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Jenkins, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 (*Commissioner Becherer recused from review) to recommend continuing the review to allow applicant to return to PRS with a view shed analysis.

IID-18-08//HPZ-19-35 – Cypress Civil Development – Proposed Six-Story Hotel Development on a vacant lot. Applicant to provide information on compatibility with Adjacent Historic Properties or Eligible to be listed in the National or Arizona Register of Historic Places or as Contributing Properties] -141 S. Stone Avenue -(Rio Nuevo Area/Downtown Core Sub-District)

Staff Brown summarized the project and the review process. Staff summarized the Design Professional's comments as they relate to the historic preservation concerns. Carolyn Laurie provided background on the Infill Incentive District process and review.

Michael Desmarteau of Seaver Franks Architects presented the project.

Commissioners expressed a concern related to not getting the full Design Professional Report prior to review. The subcommittee expressed the desire for PRS to be consulted earlier in the process to provide more meaningful feedback. The subcommittee reiterated same concerns as expressed at the 4-25-19 review related to the proposed south façade and its relationship to the historic neighborhood and the narrow street; concerns about the north façade and high window wall not being compatible with historic storefronts, and concerns about the provided contextual photos not meeting the compatibility criteria. The consensus was a lack of compatibility with adjacent historic properties or those eligible to be listed in the National or Arizona Register of Historic Places or as Contributing Properties.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and carried by a voice vote of 5-0 (*Commissioner Becherer recused from review) to recommend that the project not be approved, noting that the design was not sufficiently compatible with, and not sufficiently complementary to, the adjacent historic properties and districts.

5. **Courtesy Review**

Tucson Community Center- An informational presentation on replacement of the wood components of the benches within Tucson Community Center—No action required—(National Register-listed Eckbo Plaza)

*Commissioner Becherer returned to review.

Karla Van Drunen Littooy, from TCC Today presented the project; discussed many failed wood tested materials, and proposed Cemrock, an integrally colored concrete, as a replacement material.

Discussion was held. Commissioner Erickson, chair of Historic Landscapes Subcommittee (HLS), confirmed that HLS had reviewed the proposed product and made recommendations for approval.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff mentioned that a replacement plan for the demolished property (zoning violation) at 508 W 18th Street was in the review process.

d. Review Process Issues/Discussion

Subcommittee expressed concerns on the IID review sequencing not allowing PRS enough time for meaningful review input.

7. Call to the Audience (Information Only)

Karla Van Drunen Littooy commented about her role representing Ward 2 on the TCC Commission.

8. Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS.

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:52 P.M.