

Design Professional Review Comments

Date: 4 September 2019

To: Maria Gayosso, Lead Planner
 Planning and Development Services
 City of Tucson
 201 N. Stone Avenue
 Tucson, AZ 85701

From: R. Fe Tom, AIA, Design Professional

Project: **Case # IID-19-06**
 Project Name: 127 S 5th Ave
 Address: 111-127 S 5th Ave
 Parcel #: 117-06-2060 & 117-06-2070
 Related Activity Number: # T19SA00132, DP19-0122

Re: Design Professional Preliminary IID Major Review Comments for Case # IID-19-06

The purpose of this review is to provide a Preliminary Major Design Review of Infill District Case # IID-19-06: 111-127 S 5th Ave, dated 8/6/2019 with related Development Package # DP19-0122, and permit T19SA00132 and Preapplication Meeting Notes, dated 4/11/2019.

5.12.8: GENERAL IID ZONING OPTION DESIGN STANDARDS for a Major Design Review		
UDC Article	OBSERVATION	COMMENTS
5.12.8.A: Streetscape Design		
5.12.8.A.1: Pedestrian-orientation: Project shall comply with all UDC Sections 5.12.8.A.1.a through 5.12.8.A.1.h		
5.12.8.A.1.a: Architectural elements/details at the first 2 floor levels.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Varying materials provided at first and second levels. Tinted glazing, CMU, metal panels. • Color: Natural Material colors and painted stucco. • Windows: Glazed openings and storefront. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.8.A.1.b: Provide window, window displays, or visible activity on at 50% of the frontage.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appears to be recessed storefront across entire 5th Avenue street frontage. • No windows/storefront provided along Herbert Avenue. Fencing with car circulation visible. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.8.A.1.c: Façade shall be no longer than 50' without architectural details	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Facade has varying architectural details across span of facade. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.8.A.1.d: Front door shall be visible from the street and visually high lighted by graphic, lighting or similar features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A separate single door residential entry and double door building lobby entrance provided. • No graphic/signage identifying as such is indicated on provided drawings but is identified within the package under "IID Scope of Work - there will be lighted for viability...and lighted signage or graphics, pg63." 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies

<p>5.12.8.A.1.e: Retail/Commercial Trade Uses that encourage street level pedestrian activity are preferred on the 1st floor of multi-story buildings</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No public commercial/retail space provided. • Public and Building Lobby provided at first floor. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.A.1.f: Sidewalks may be widened to allow for sidewalk dining.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New sidewalk provided along 5th Ave and Herbert Ave. Widened brick sidewalk to building entrances in between new concrete sidewalk provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.A.1.g: To the extent practicable, bus pull-out shall be provided where bus stops are currently located</p>	<p>N/A</p>	
<p>5.12.8.A.1.h: If Drive-Through service is proposed, it shall not interfere with pedestrian access to site from right-a-way</p>	<p>N/A</p>	
<p>5.12.8.A.2: Shade: Shade shall be provided for at least 50% of all sidewalks and pedestrian paths</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Site plans comply with shade requirements, shade calculation provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.B: Development Transition Standards</p>		
<p>5.12.8.B.1: <u>Applicability</u> Where a project abuts an affected residential property or duplex dwelling the developing site shall comply with this section</p>		
<p>5.12.8.B.2: <u>Mitigation of Taller Structures</u></p>		
<p>5.12.8.A.2.a: Within the GIIS; the maximum building height is 25 feet within 30 feet of the property line adjacent to an affected residential property.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adjacent residential property to the south (133-135 S 5th Ave) • 4' setback provided, nearest 28' portion of the building is below 25'. The total setback of the seven story portion of the building to the south property is 32'. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.B.b: <u>Building Bulk Reduction:</u> Where a <u>building</u> façade faces a property line <u>adjacent</u> to a</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Although the building to the south is an apartment zoned C-1, the packaged indicates that bulk reduction has been requested. • The seven story building is 32' setback from property line. Building Lobby, a 23'-4" portion of the structure located at the southwest. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. Reduced height and prominent setback from residential property provided.

<p>single-family detached or duplex residential property, the proposed design provides an effective way of breaking up the mass so that the building mass of the façade is less imposing.</p>		
<p>5.12.8.B.2.c and d: Reduce views into adjacent residential yards from 2nd floor windows and balconies</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Balconies/Windows along the south property side can see into adjacent residential yards. • Roof deck at building lobby adjacent to residential property 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • Lobby roof deck looks onto the roof of adjacent residence. However, because this is a commercial property, view onto the roof is acceptable. • Residential balconies have been setback 60'-6" reducing visibility into adjacent resident.
<p>5.12.8.B.1.e: Buildings shall be oriented so as to reduce views onto an affected residential property</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Balconies and windows along south facade have views into adjacent residential property. • Documents indicate that the balconies are setback 60'-6" from adjacent residential building facade. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.B.1.f: Buffers and/or screening shall be provided between a developing site and affected residential properties</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No buffers or screening have been provided. • Seven story structure has been setback from adjacent residential property. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.B.3: <u>Mitigation of Service Areas</u> Service area shall be mitigated to reduce the noise and view of the service features, reduce the emission of offensive odors to owners or occupants of adjacent properties or create a nuisance or hazard beyond the property lines of the project site, and prevent vibrations that are discernible beyond the property lines of the projects.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trash is located along Herbert Ave within a 8" CMU screen enclosure. • Project proposing a compactor trash enclosure, rolling bins to street and pickup 3x a week. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • Noise and views appear to be mitigated. • Modification requires approval by COT Environmental Services.

<p>5.12.8.B.4: Mitigation of Parking Facilities and Other Areas Where the site has parking areas or an area with noise and outdoor lighting features, the areas shall be screened from affected residential property by a combination of a wall or opaque non-chain link fence with a vegetative hedge or a row of trees that shall be dense enough to screen views onto the development site.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New 4' CMU wall has been provided along south property line. • Parking Canopy located over parking spaces at the south property line provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.C: Alternative Compliance The PDSO Director may approve an urban design best practice option for compliance with Section 5.12.8.A, Streetscape Design and Section 5.12.8.B Development Transition Standards.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide best practice as needed for PDSO approval. 	
<p>5.12.8.D: Utilities Plans shall include information on the layout and demonstrate availability of utilities such as water, wastewater, natural gas, electric, and telecommunication utilities.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide drawing for approval from City agencies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • Development Plan has been submitted
<p>5.12.8.E: Parking</p>		

<p>5.12.8.E.1.a and b: Parking spaces located on-site or off-site within 1/4 mile of site with a City approved shared parking agreement</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parking has been provided onsite. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • IPP has been approved.
<p>5.12.8.E.2: Required vehicle and bicycle parking may be reduced pursuant to an IID Parking Plan in accordance with Section 7.4.5.A.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vehicle Parking: Reduction from required 72 vehicular parking spaces to 50 spaces was approved by an Individual Parking Plan dated 7/11/19. • Bicycle Parking: The bike parking requirements exceed requirements, provided 12 short term and 144 long term bike parking spaces 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • IPP has been approved
<p>5.12.8.E.3: Where Parking is provided, the parking area must comply with the standards of Section 7.4.6.C and D.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parking requirement modified per IPP. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • IPP has been approved
<p>5.12.8.E.4: Parking must be in a parking structure with the ground floor of the parking structure screened from view.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parking is partially screened from south property. • Parking is screen from street view. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • IPP has been approved
<p>5.12.8.E.4.a: Exception: Parking may be located on a surface parking lot if it is determined by the PDSD Director to be impracticable to be located elsewhere and other options are not available. If located onsite, parking areas must be located at the rear or side of the building.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A
<p>5.12.8.E.5: <u>Special IID Parking Agreement:</u></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A

<p>5.12.8.E.5.a: A percentage of long-term residential parking may be located in a City public parking garage by an agreement with Park Tucson if the project is of significant economic benefit to the City to allow this option.</p> <p>5.12.8.E.5.b: The agreement must be reviewed by PDSD, the Design Professional, Park Tucson and approved by the City Manager.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A
<p>5.12.10: DOWNTOWN CORE SUBDISTRICT (DCS)</p>		
<p>5.12.8.A: Permitted Uses</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project is in accordance with permitted uses outlined 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.B: Standards</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project is in accordance with permitted uses outlined 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.8.C: Exemptions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Owner has complied with exemptions listed with the exception of 5.12.8.C.7 Landscaping and Screening Standards 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.12.7: RIO NUEVO AREA (RNA) ZONING DESIGN STANDARDS</p>		
<p>5.12.7.A. <u>Applicability</u> 1. This Section 5.12.7 applies to the developments types listed in Section 5.12.4 and this Section. 2. The provisions of this Section 5.12.7 are mandatory for proposed development of properties in the RNA under existing underlying zoning.</p>		
<p>5.12.7.B <u>Permitted Used and Building Height</u></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A 	<p>Complies</p>
<p>5.12.7.C <u>Building Design Standards</u> Development within the RNA is required to comply with the following building design standards .</p>		
<p>5.12.7.C.1 Buildings shall respect scale within the development zone pursuant to Section 5.12.8.B</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In accordance with requested cited by COT the building adjacent to the residential property 25' in height. • The 7 story structure is setback 32'. 	<p>Complies</p>

5.12.7.C.2 Prevailing Setback	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exempt in accordance with 5.12.10.C 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complies
5.12.7.C.3 Scale defining architectural elements at the first 2 floors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Varying materials, recessed storefront, and architectural details have been provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complies
5.12.7.C.4 Every commercial building frontage shall provide visible activity within 50% of the building frontage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No public commercial/retails space provided. Public and Building Lobby provided at first floor. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N/A
5.12.7.C.5 Single facade at street level may not be longer than 50' without architectural articulation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Window, varying materials and detailing provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complies
5.12.7.C.6 Building façade design shall include pedestrian-scaled, down-shielded, and glare controlled exterior building and window lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Per documentation, down-shielded and glare-controlled exterior building and window lighting will be provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complies
5.12.7.C.7 The front doors of all commercial and government buildings shall be visible from the street and visually highlighted by graphics, lighting, marquees, or canopies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N/A
5.12.7.C.8 Modifications to the exterior of historic buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N/A
5.12.7.C.9 Buildings shall be designed to shield adjacent building and public rights-of-way from reflected heat and glare	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complies
5.12.7.C.10 Safe and adequate vehicular parking areas designed to minimize conflicts with pedestrians	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parking appears to be separated from bicycle parking Parking approved per IPP 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complies

and bicycles .		
5.12.7.C.11 Shade provided for at sidewalks and pedestrian pathways	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overhangs provided at 5th Ave sidewalk with shade trees. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.C.12 Colors, visual interest, variety and street rhythms .	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Varying materials, texture and colors have been provided. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.C.13 New buildings shall use materials, patterns, and elements that relate to the traditional context of the Downtown area	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials include tinted glazing, CMU in redbrick color, metal panels, Steel, exposed concrete. • Materials present around site include redbrick, stucco, exposed steel, glazing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. Appears to be consistent with surrounding material patterns.
5.12.7.C.14 & 15 Mixed uses encouraged to provide 24-hr street activity. Public entries shall be off of sidewalk.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mixed uses provided. Primary public entry off of 5th Avenue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Residential use is compliant with surrounding context as building is located within a "transitional zone" between downtown and the neighborhood to the south. • Primary access is compliant.
5.12.7.D Site Design Standards		
5.12.7.D.1 Vehicular Circulation		
5.12.7.D.1.a All parking area access lanes (PAALs) adjacent to building shall have pedestrian circulation paths between the PAAL and the building, with a min. width of 6'	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pedestrian circulation paths have been provided 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.D.1.b Ingress to parking shall be perpendicular to intersecting street. Minimize vehicular/ pedestrian and vehicular/ bicycle conflicts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Single perpendicular entry and exit provided with ingress and egress gate. • Appear to be separation between parking and bicycle parking. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.D.2 Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parking approved per IPP, July 11,2019. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.D.3 Plazas & Open Space		
5.12.7.D.3.a Plazas & Pedestrians Nodes: 5% of the gross floor area of new construction shall be provided in public plazas or courtyards.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public plaza or courtyard not provided. Private roof deck provided at southwest corner of building. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exemption is approved • Due to private nature of multifamily residence, the building type does not facilitate a public space. • Project makes improvements to public ROW with landscaping and public benches.
5.12.7.D.3.b	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Viewshed corridor seem not to be impeded 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies

Viewshed Corridors Views of all historic properties and all natural elements surrounding the Downtown should be considered during design.		
5.12.7.D.3.c Linkages(Physical and Visual) Neighborhood linkages shall be maintained throughout Downtown	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Linkages have not been alerted from the existing conditions. • Improved sidewalks provided at 5th and Herbert Ave. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.D.4 Streetscape		
5.12.7.D.4.a Streetscapes must be consistent with the Streetscape Design Policy. In streetscape design, priority is given to pedestrian	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved pedestrian sidewalks provided at 5th Ave. • Vehicular access provided off of vehicular oriented Herbert Ave. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.12.7.D.4.b Shade Shade shall be provided for at least 50 percent of all sidewalks and pedestrian pathways.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shade has been provided for at least 50% of side walk with landscaping along 5th and Herbert Ave 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
5.8.9 HPZ DESIGN STANDARDS		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • **While this property does not lie within a HPZ, the property borders on the Armory Park Historic District with the adjacent property directly to the south having 4/5 of the buildings onsite, designated as contributing historic properties. COT has requested compliance with this section. 		
5.8.9.A.General		
5.8.9.A.3 New Construction New construction or alterations or additions to a noncontributing property within an HPZ shall reflect the architectural style of, and be compatible with, the contributing properties located within its development zone.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New construction should not copy existing structure but should be compatible with surrounding architecture. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The building uses materials found throughout Armory Park, especially within buildings in the immediate surroundings. These materials include, redbrick CMU, concrete and stucco.
5.8.9.B Height		
5.8.9.B.3. New Construction New construction or alterations or	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Armory Park is primarily comprised of single family home that are 1-2 stories. The northern edge of the district transitions into downtown with more commercial properties and multistory, multifamily 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The building is within the 75' zoned height restriction.

<p>additions to a noncontributing property shall be constructed no higher than the tallest contributing property located within its development zone and shall generally conform to the typical height within the development zone.</p>	<p>properties.</p>	
<p><u>5.8.9.C Setback</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.C.3 New Construction new construction or alterations or additions to a noncontributing property shall maintain the prevailing street and interior perimeter yard setbacks existing within its development zone.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The new building follows a prevailing setback. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The project is per UDC requirements and maintains the prevailing setback within the development zone.
<p><u>5.8.9.D Proportion</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.D.3 New Construction Alterations or additions to a Contributing Property shall be consistent with the proportions of the existing structure and with the prevailing proportions of Contributing Properties within its development zone.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The projects is proportionally larger that buildings with Armory Park. Buildings along the northern edge transition to become proportionally larger as they move toward more commercially oriented downtown. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The project complies with setbacks, zoning heights and provides a stepped-back building to respect adjacent properties.
<p><u>5.8.9.E Roof Types</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.E.3 New Construction New construction or alterations or additions to a Noncontributing Property shall have a roof compatible in configuration, mass, and materials to the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The building has a flat roof 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. • There are varying roof styles, including flat roofs, found throughout Armory Park.

<p>prevailing historic style and period of the existing structures within the development zone in which the proposed structure will be constructed.</p>		
<p><u>5.8.9.F Surface Texture</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.F.3 New Construction New construction or alterations or additions to a Noncontributing Property shall have a surface texture that is appropriate to the historic style of similar structures within the development zone and shall reflect the historic periods existing within the HPZ.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building utilizes a variety of materials including, redbrick cmu, concrete, glazing and stucco. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The building is reflective of surface textures found throughout the district.
<p><u>5.8.9.G Site Utilization</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.G.3 New Construction Site utilization of new construction or alterations or additions to a Noncontributing Property shall be consistent with the site utilization of Contributing Properties within the development zone.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Although at a larger scale, the site used for multifamily housing and for parking similar to the property to the south. • The site is uses screened parking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies • The property is used according to respective guidelines • The screen parking is in accordance with Armory Park Guidelines.
<p><u>5.8.9.H Projections & Recessions</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.G.3 New Construction New construction or alterations or additions to a Noncontributing Property shall have projections and recessions, such as porches, steps,</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The building has details including projections and recessions that reflect the districts architectural details. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies

<p>awnings, overhangs, entrances, and windows, that are compatible with the existing historic styles within the development zone and reflect the historic periods of the HPZ.</p>		
<p>5.8.9.I <u>Details</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.I.3 New Construction New construction or alterations or additions to a Noncontributing Property shall have architectural details, such as cornices, lintels, arches, grill work, shutters, window and door trim, and canals, that are compatible with the existing historic styles and historic periods of Contributing Properties within the development zone.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The building is a contemporary architectural style with appropriate modern detailing. The new construction does not copy existing details 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies
<p>5.8.9.J <u>Building Form</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.J.3 New Construction New construction or alterations or additions to a Noncontributing Property shall have size, mass, and scale that are compatible with the existing Contributing Properties within the development zone.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 7 story building is larger than most buildings within the district. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The building is within the zoning restrictions and makes a concerted effort with "bulk reduction" planning to respond respectfully to the surrounding district.
<p>5.8.9.K <u>Rhythm</u></p>		
<p>5.8.9.K.3 New Construction The proportion, pattern, and rhythm of openings of additions or alterations to a Contributing Property shall be compatible with those of the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The building follows contemporary rhythms with clean-line features reflective of modern materials. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complies. The Building is complementary of the development zones properties while not copying existing styles.

existing structure and with those of Contributing Properties in its development zone.		
5.8.9.L Additional Review Standards • To provide flexibility in the review of applications that reflect the diverse and unique characteristics of the various HPZs, other pertinent factors generally affecting the appearance, harmony, and efficient functioning of the HPZ may be used as appropriate for the particular application, such as the following:		
5.8.9.L.1 Color	• Natural material colors have been used including redbrick cmu, concrete, glazing, steel and stucco.	• Complies
5.8.9.L.2 Landscaping	• Landscaping provided at streetscape.	• Complies
5.8.9.L.3 Enclosures	• Enclosures for vehicle parking and bike parking provided	• Complies
5.8.9.L.4 Utilities	• Per requirements/existing conditions	• Complies
5.8.9.M Signs	• Per requirements, no variance to HPZ required	• Complies
5.8.9.N Motor Vehicle & Bicycle Parking Areas	• The parking has been appropriately screened	• Complies

This concludes the Preliminary Major Design Review of Infill District Case # IID-19-06. The IID has been reviewed and approved.



**Richard Fe Tom, AIA
Design Professional Reviewer:**