

Westmoreland Lot Affordable Housing Project Survey Results and Summary

Introduction

The Menlo Park Neighborhood Association Survey provided the Neighborhood Association and the City of Tucson with resident feedback on an Affordable Housing project at the Westmoreland Lot property. The specific site this survey sought feedback on was for the vacant property on the east side of Westmoreland Avenue between Fresno St and St. Mary's Rd (adjacent to the west boundary of the park). The Ward 1 Office and City of Tucson Department of Housing and Community Development are invested in better understanding what the neighbors in the area would like to see incorporated into the affordable housing project. Following are the results of the survey providing input on this development.

Key Areas of Interest

- Housing affordability and availability (home ownership and rental opportunities).
- Transportation, mobility, and parking.
- Density and design.
- Character of the neighborhood (housing maintenance, beautification, neighborhood safety).
- Sustainability and green design features.
- Access to Menlo Park.
- Equity.

Overview of Respondents

The survey was distributed in both paper and digital formats and received a total of 70 responses. It was advertised through the Menlo Park Neighborhood Association, the City of Tucson's Housing and Community Development department, and the Ward 1 office using multiple email lists and the NextDoor application. Paper copies of the survey and flyers were also distributed door to door in the immediate area surrounding the Westmoreland Lot.

Of the 70 respondents:

- 63 (90%) live in the Menlo Park neighborhood, and 53 (75.7%) live within ½ mile of the property.
- 30 (42.9%) of the respondents have lived in Menlo Park for more than 10 years, and 21 of those have lived there for 20+ years.
- 60 (85.7%) of the respondents are homeowners.
- 10 (14.3%) are renting their homes.

Key Takeaways

The Menlo Park neighbors are generally supportive of the affordable housing project; however, some respondents expressed concern that the housing will not be well-maintained and will negatively impact home values in the surrounding area. Some of the existing challenges that Menlo Park residents identified as most critical include an increasing gap of unaffordability due to real estate redevelopment and concern about losing the neighborhood's rich history and cultural assets that have long defined the area.

The majority of respondents demonstrated interest in a housing development that incorporates the following critical components:

- Multi-modal transportation options to free up space for more housing and green areas
- Medium density design to benefit neighborhood businesses and promote further development
- Design features that are similar to existing Menlo Park housing to maintain the cultural character of the historic neighborhood.
- Improvements in modern efficiency, ease of maintenance and sustainability (ie. green infrastructure and use of solar electricity)
- Community features that will attract a family demographic such as increased security and park accessibility through an east boundary entrance to the development.

Overall, the respondents were supportive of intentional, thoughtful, affordable housing that incorporates principles of equity, safety, and sustainability. The process of planning for this development should be creative and inclusive to make sure residents' voices are heard and input is incorporated into the planning for this and other housing developments. According to one resident, "what is developed can be a model for future sites so that we as a neighborhood can be sustainable and push for climate justice and equity."

Attached Documents

Westmoreland Lot Survey Results (PDF)
Westmoreland Lot Survey Comments Summary (PDF)

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

Summary Of Responses

As of March 22, 2021, 10:56 AM, this forum had: Topic Start Topic End

Attendees: 88 February 9, 2021, 11:57 AM March 19, 2021, 1:38 PM

Responses: 70

Hours of Public Comment: 3.5

QUESTION 1

1. What do you think of when you hear the term Affordable Housing?

Answered 70 Skipped 0

8 able afford **affordable** area available below **bracket built** certain community **families** good government home homes **hope housing** income level like living low **lower** means more neighborhood over **people** poverty property quality reasonable rent residents right section think what who

QUESTION 2

2. What are some of the challenges around housing in Menlo Park Neighborhood? Please check all that apply.

	%	Count
Rental Affordability	55.7%	39
Home Ownership Affordability	72.9%	51
Land Use	38.6%	27
Wages	42.9%	30
Transportation/Mobility	25.7%	18
Other:	32.9%	23

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

QUESTION 3

3. If you selected "Other" in question 2, please describe these challenges:

Answered 25 Skipped 45

adorable apartments brings coating customer developers different down from gentrification graffiti gut homes housing investors isn keep kicking kind like live neighborhood other out people renovate road S stop sugar t targeting them they tolerate up westmoreland what why willing

QUESTION 4

4. Do you live in the Menlo Park Neighborhood?

		% Count
Yes	90.0	% 63
No	10.0	% 7

QUESTION 5

5. If yes, how many years have you lived in Menlo Park?

	%	Count
0-2 Years	20.0%	14
2-5 Years	14.3%	10
5-10 Years	22.9%	16
10-20 Years	12.9%	9
20+ Years	30.0%	21

QUESTION 6

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

6. How close to the Westmoreland Lot do you live?

	%	Count
Within 1/4 mile	61.4%	43
Within 1/2 mile	14.3%	10
Within 3/4 mile	10.0%	7
Within 1 mile	8.6%	6
Further than 1 mile	5.7%	4

QUESTION 7

7. Which of the following best describes your current housing situation?

	%	Count
Renter	14.3%	10
Homeowner	85.7%	60

QUESTION 8

8. Are you satisfied with the housing situation in Menlo Park?

	%	Count
Yes	30.0%	21
No	70.0%	49

QUESTION 9

9. Could you explain why you answered "Yes" or "No" to question 8?

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

	%	Count
Property values are too low	7.1%	5
Property values have increased	42.9%	30
Housing is affordable	7.1%	5
There are enough housing options	11.4%	8
Other:	61.4%	43

QUESTION 10

10. If you answered "Other", please describe why.

Answered 43 Skipped 27

affordable close could crime displacement enough family get high home house housing just long menlo more mp much need neighborhood now one options out park people prices rent rental residents s some t they too trash type very was who

QUESTION 11

11. In which type of housing do you currently live?

	%	Count
Apartment	1.4%	1
Single Family Home	82.9%	58
Duplex (2-unit home)	10.0%	7
Condominium	5.7%	4

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

QUESTION 12

12. Would you prefer housing at the Westmoreland Lot site to be:

	%	Count
Owner-occupied	41.4%	29
Rental	8.6%	6
A mix of both	32.9%	23
I don't have a preference as long as the site is clean and crime-free	17.1%	12

QUESTION 13

13. Please explain why you selected the above option?

Answered 65 Skipped 5

affordable apartments **area** both buy Care community **crime don folks home homes housing** like live mento **mix more need** neighborhood **opportunity options own** owners ownership people **pride properties** property **rent** rental residents See some t take they think **want who**

QUESTION 14

14. The minimum number of units for Westmoreland Lots is six (6), what would you like the maximum number to be?

	%	Count
9	28.6%	20
12	20.0%	14
14	12.9%	9
Other	38.6%	27

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

QUESTION 15

15. Do you prefer:

	%	Count
One-story housing	50.0%	35
Two-story housing	14.3%	10
Three-story or higher housing	5.7%	4
It depends	11.4%	8
I don't have a preference if the designer can address concerns with multi-story	18.6%	13

QUESTION 16

16. If you answered "It depends", please describe why.

Answered 10 Skipped 60

buildings homes housing how keep more neighborhood one people see stories story t think three two units Want well

QUESTION 17

17. Do you prefer new housing in Menlo Park to maintain similar housing features?

Answered 70 Skipped 0

adobe architectural build car development existing fancy features feel garages historic homes houses housing important like long look maintain mento modern more much neighborhood new older open park reflect revival similar site so something space style styles than think traditional

QUESTION 18

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

18. Do you prefer new housing in Menlo Park to take on different features? If so, what features would you like to see more of?

Answered 70 Skipped 0

affordable area benefits built community design designs efficient energy environment features garden harvesting homes houses housing keep landscaping like material modern more native park passive play sidewalks similar solar something space spanish style tech think townhomes traditional trees w water

QUESTION 19

19. How important is the character of the neighborhood as a priority for the building of this area?

	%	Count
Very important	75.7%	53
Somewhat important	21.4%	15
Not important	2.9%	2

QUESTION 20

20. Are you interested in requiring a certain level of energy efficiency for these units?

	%	Count
Yes	92.9%	65
No	7.1%	5

QUESTION 21

21. Are you interested in requiring a certain amount of energy use come from renewable sources?

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

	%	Count
Yes	91.4%	64
No	8.6%	6

QUESTION 22

22. What other green design features would you want to see?

	%	Count
Passive water harvesting	67.1%	47
Active water harvesting	67.1%	47
Shared laundry	25.7%	18
Community garden	62.9%	44
Stormwater harvesting features	78.6%	55
Native landscaping (including low water use trees to provide shade canopy)	91.4%	64
Other:	22.9%	16

QUESTION 23

23. If you selected "Other", what other green design features would you like to see?

Answered 19 Skipped 51

assuming control cooling doesn don dust energy garden heat homes landscaping less m mention need north orientation panels parking passive renters shade shared solar sold spaces t trees walls water West why Windows

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

QUESTION 24

24. Would you be interested in this project opening up to the park on its east boundary?

	%	Count
Yes	71.4%	50
No	28.6%	20

QUESTION 25

25. Why did you answer "Yes" or "No" to question 24?

Answered 70 Skipped 0

access been community could crime east easy encourage families feel from get good homeless housing important more neighborhood open opening park part past people privacy provide residents side some space to they think through traffic USE walk was westmoreland

QUESTION 26

26. What parking options would you prefer for this lot?

	%	Count
On-site parking (driveway, garage)	62.9%	44
On-site parking (front or rear of units)	52.9%	37
Angled parking along Westmoreland Av.	22.9%	16
Other on-street parking	8.6%	6

QUESTION 27

27. Do you have any additional comments about the affordable housing project you'd like us to consider?

Please give us your feedback on the Westmoreland Lot property in Menlo Park.

Answered 47

Skipped 23

affordable apartments build cars community don good great home house house housing just like live look make menlo need **neighborhood** other park **parking** people please project property really residents S see spot t them they think traffic very want westmoreland

QUESTION 28

28. Are you interested in participating in further discussions around affordable housing in Menlo Park?

	%	Count
Yes	50.0%	35
No	50.0%	35

QUESTION 29

29. If you answered yes, would you please give us your name, email, and phone number?

Answered 32

Skipped 38

520 **520-401-2281 com** contact gmail greenwood hamed hotmail information jjgj001 john kennedy laura question response rodriguez sami stump yahoo

Westmoreland Lot Survey Comment Summary

1. What do you think of when you hear the term Affordable Housing?

"I think of clean, safe, affordable homes for low-income families in areas where they have access to grocery stores, medical care, transportation, education, and employment."

"I think about taking care of all people in our community!"

"Hope"

"Very pro! I hope it means quality, accessible to families, and accessible to people of different immigration statuses."

"I think of equitable opportunities for potential long-term residents who can embed themselves and contribute to the community."

"I think of homes that are affordable. I also know that sometimes these homes can be neglected and not kept up by the people who own them (not the tenants themselves) and are densely packed in with no real planning."

"Section 8, housing with rents reasonable for people with low income. A means to assist people who are living at or below the poverty line."

"Housing - home ownership or rentals - that is reasonably priced and available to the residents of the area."

"I think of having to compete for it. It's intimidating. But wow, having access to this would be amazing. I think of cool communities with murals and kids playing."

"Usually, government housing-cheaply and rapidly built and not maintained. There should be good quality affordable housing that gives hope and joy to people living there and to the surrounding community."

2. What are some of the challenges around housing in Menlo Park Neighborhood?

"Gentrification of the greater neighborhood and west side is forcing up the price of existing homes and rents. Long-time Latino families, for financial and other reasons, are selling to high-bidding non-Latinos."

"The other has to do with the potential of increase in traffic that additional housing brings."

"People not showing pride of ownership in where they live. There are many homes and RENTALS that are in total disrepair or have junk in the yard."

"I spoke to a employee of one of the local apartment complexes in MP to my surprise he said when lower income tenants are moving out they are taking that opportunity to gut out apartments and renovate them and that they are targeting a different kind of customer. Stop sugar coating gentrification why keep kicking the can down the road. This isn't about adorable housing this is about what the neighborhood is willing to tolerate from investors/developers."

"Possible gentrification that will reduce the quaintness and historical aspects of the neighborhood. I prefer to keep the neighborhood quaint and comfortable. I like the cultural vibe."

"Gentrification of the greater neighborhood and west side is forcing up the price of existing homes and rents. Long-time Latino families, for financial and other reasons, are selling to high-bidding non-Latinos."

"Not enough housing options for people who want to live in the area."

"Crime and graffiti which keep property values low."

8. Are you satisfied with the housing situation in Menlo Park?

"Housing costs are climbing so fast. I worry it will incentivize longtime homeowners to leave or challenge folks on fixed incomes with higher property taxes. These can lead to displacement."

"Displacement of longtime residents some renters and homeowners. MP used to be field with kids on basketball courts and soccer fields walking on sidewalks and alley ways enjoying themselves. This neighborhood has taken on a different type of scene of hipster and modernization. No one's worried about MP School just the next housing project and unauthentic vegetarian Mexican food spot they can cram in MP."

"Menlo Park is great, but there are so many opportunities for MORE housing. It is one of the few walkable / bikeable places in Tucson. Poor people, who sometimes cannot afford cars, would benefit from living here - but they are priced out."

"Menlo Park is one of the most wonderful neighborhoods in Tucson-- close to downtown, close to the mountains, strong Latinx history and culture. Rental and housing rates are skyrocketing, and risk displacing people who could most benefit from this community: Latinx people, elderly, those of us without vehicles who depend on transit, young families who love the open space."

"It could be beneficial to see a bit more density in this area, as long as we have some infrastructure such as parks, stores, smart streets, and trees."

"It is a quaint neighborhood with very little trouble. it doesn't have too much traffic. It seems that most houses are owner-occupied. I like the stability. It's not too "busy" around the neighborhood so it's relatively quiet. "

"Not enough rental housing - I am living in a rental home that is managed by a large company that puts several barriers to rental (extensive credit checks, income verification, cleaning fee above and beyond deposit). When my family was trying to find a home to rent in this neighborhood, there were no options and expensive options. When the house we are in was posted, I applied the same day."

"I wish I could have answered, "Yes, but...." As I compare Menlo Park to the rest of the city of Tucson, on balance I think the housing situation is better in Menlo Park than in many neighborhoods. At least we have some affordable housing, some diversity, some options for the future, but this could all disappear into another "Convention Center" type development, paved wall to wall, cement, high rises, etc. unless we plan now. Fortunately, we have citizen involvement, but it's always challenging to get and keep the attention of the Mayor and Council. As a long-time Tucsonan with a big local family, the other members of my family like Menlo Park and wish their neighborhoods could get some decent, dignified affordable housing. We must take advantage of every opportunity and continue to fight for more affordable housing every chance we get."

"Too much crime. Property values are way overblown. Duplex rentals horribly out of date. Cold comes through the windows and need to be remodeled. Rent has gone up 20% in one year."

12. Would you prefer housing at Westmoreland Lot site to be owner-occupied, rental, a mix of both, or no preference?

"A mixture makes more housing available to different incomes in a central area."

"We need both ownership and rental opportunities in Menlo. Renters have the least options right now for affordable housing."

"People take pride in ownership and try to take care of their investment."

"I think a mix is a good idea. I think condos would be good on the site."

"It seems like home ownership helps to build people wealth, which is important, but I remain open minded on the mix."

"If they own their home, they will take care of it, value it and bring a sense of community rather than being transient not investing in our neighborhood."

"Balance"

"I would also support an affordable cooperative ownership structure. Homeownership is almost never affordable to the people who most need affordable housing. If we are going to build affordable housing, it should be truly affordable. A limited equity cooperative can also ensure that the housing is affordable, while giving residents more control over their housing."

"Owners are more likely to care for their property. Rentals, unfortunately, turn over too often. The neighborhood has a lot of rentals, both homes and apartments. Menlo could use more homeowners."

"A mix reflects the rest of the neighborhood. It would be great for the design to include rentable guests' quarters in each of the individual homes."

"Our neighborhood is saturated with too many apartments. I feel that homes should be built so young families can afford to be able to purchase a home."

"I could get behind both rental or owner-occupied as I see the benefit of both options. I have personally lived in apartments, single-family homes, and townhouses and I think that more townhouses that are available to rent or buy, here in Tucson, would be the way to go. They are spacious enough for a family but are amenable to more density and more community. I'd rather not see certain types of apartment complexes that are very poorly built/the landlords don't maintain them."

15. Do you prefer one-story housing, two-story housing, three-story or higher housing, it depends, or I don't have a preference?

"Three stories seem too high for the area. Ideally one story is great, if two can be designed and transition well with neighbors I am open to supporting that as well."

"Two story makes sense, but one-story Sonoran row housing would be interesting. Shared walls to conserve space and energy would be preferable and cost saving."

"It depends on how units are built and how intrusive more than one-story units would be to surrounding properties."

"I think density can be accomplished in ways Tucsonans haven't really seen before, so I don't want to limit the number of stories but I do want to see some innovative approaches that keep desirability and walkability in mind, and provide as many comfortable housing options for people as possible."

"I own a house right next to the lot. I would appreciate privacy in my backyard."

"I want to keep the view of the mountains and the low-key feel of the neighborhood, but Menlo already has several multi-story apartments and they fit well, mixed in with parks and single-family homes on many different sized lots. The businesses on St Mary's could absorb many more people."

17. Do you prefer new housing in Menlo Park to maintain similar housing features?

"It would be nice for the architecture to reflect the history of housing in the area, but modernized for efficiency, ease of maintenance, and sustainability."

"Yes and no. Several houses in Menlo Park are post-WW II revival. However, styles like Craftsman Bungalow and Spanish Colonial Revival have more curb appeal."

"Yes of course. Anything that can honor the aesthetic of the neighborhood creates a better experience for current residents and future tenants and homeowners."

"Menlo Park is a historic neighborhood. The buildings being built in this neighborhood need to have a historic appearance otherwise why bother having a historic neighborhood if you're just going to build a bunch of cheap boxes that will be the new slums within 10 years."

"I prefer that the new housing retain the feel of the neighborhood, the older homes on Fresno and Westmoreland. Not the townhomes north of the site."

"I think a new design that is efficient, smart and not car centric can also be attractive. Sense there is so many types of housing already existing we can be open to other designs. Open space should include the park with a creative interface between the two."

"Yes, I would like new development to reflect the look of the already established properties. Otherwise, the developments change the look and feel of the Neighborhood too much."

"Yes, it's important to maintain the historic integrity of Menlo Park."

18. Do you prefer new housing in Menlo Park to take on different features? If so, what features would you like to see more of?

"New housing in Menlo Park should take sustainability into account with water harvesting and energy efficient features."

"Community garden."

"No, stay within the confines of the neighborhood"

"Water harvesting, green infrastructure, and desert landscape."

"Trees, landscaping, outdoor shared spaces."

"The style should stay true to the neighborhood. Most of the infill has been stylistically on point so far."

"Accessibility for people using wheelchairs, transit, and bikes. Make it easier to walk and bike to St. Mary's business district."

"Rainwater catchment, gardens, kids' space, multi-use space, community gathering space."

"All newer houses should be built in more eco-friendly ways and consider sustainability. solar energy, water harvesting. for affordable housing it would be good to be built with money saving features to keep costs low."

"LEED, net zero, passive solar, water harvesting designs should be considered for other ways to think about affordability."

"Affordable green options. Water harvesting. Bike racks. Play space. Food gardens. Eco design for cool in summer warm in winter."

"I would like housing to have features that will blend in w/existing housing."

"Trees, citrus and shade; native cactus and succulents; good lighting for safety; artistic color; murals; sidewalks."

"More individual designs. No track homes."

22. What other green design features would you want to see?

"Shared walls. The site has great east/ west orientation. Shared parking area/ less land devoted to cars."

"Give rental discounts or bonuses for tenants that don't own a car and incentivize transit use."

"Solar orientation (more south facing windows and less north and west windows) and landscaping (trees blocking west and north walls) for passive heating and cooling. Solar panels"

"Solar. Shade and dust control. Community garden is a must!!"

"I don't think we need a garden the development, but one in the park would be nice."

24. Would you be interested in this project opening up to the park on its east boundary?

"More access points to the park will encourage use."

"Easy access to recreation. Encourage people using the park to explore and understand renewable energy and sustainable lifestyle."

"There needs to be a sense of privacy and allow the park and the home to show that ownership of the home is such and ownership of the park us of the community at-large, not homeowners"

"Because of course families will want to access the park! It's a huge perk of that lot"

"Because when it was developed previously, we as kids would have to walk through the little ditch/arroyo to get to Westmoreland. Access to the park."

"To get low income housing we should introduce social education programs that will educate all of us to better understand how to live within communities responsibly."

"I think opening up to a park would give families more opportunities (make it easier/more accessible) to be outside, which equals more play, exercise, fresh air, etc."

"The park is a shared neighborhood resource. Unique access to the park should not be afforded to new builds."

"Too much foot traffic will increase and probably increased crime."

"This part of the park is underutilized and uncomfortable for some. This is an excellent opportunity to work with the parks dept in a design interface so that there is mutual benefit."

"It would be way more welcoming for families to live there if they had access to the park, would bring vibrancy to the park as well."

"There are too many transient and homeless in the park and would encourage walking through the neighborhood."

"The park should be accessible from multiple sides. if it was just one or 2 houses i wouldn't think it's as important to provide easy access to the part. i think some type of fence should be there though, to provide some privacy and funnel the foot traffic. an adobe wall with a couple openings or something would be nice. that would provide a cozier feel for those residents that want to feel more within a neighborhood or don't have interest in the park."

"It would be wonderful to get more people using that part of the park! Especially if there could be a community garden or other infrastructure there to enjoy."

"Currently the crime element is high. It would be easy access to the neighborhood and also an easy escape. It could be open at a later time when crime is lower."

"Access as long as the design doesn't attract crime (Lighting)."

27. Do you have any additional comments about the affordable housing project you'd like us to consider?

"The stereotypes surrounding government housing have changed over the years, but there are still cases where a housing project is put in and there is no follow-up regarding maintenance and safety. I grew up in Louisville, KY, and that is what happened to the housing projects there. On the other side, the housing projects near where I lived in New Orleans were appealing and quiet areas. I bought my house last year and I obviously do not want to see the property values decrease. I picked Menlo Park over other neighborhoods because of the lower crime rate. For the benefit of the neighborhood, I do not want to see a thriving neighborhood jeopardized by increased crime and run-down buildings."

"Together my husband and I, were raised in Menlo Park neighborhood and continue to live in this neighborhood for 60 + years. Together we would want this neighborhood to continue to grow but remain relatively safe and possibly crime free for all."

"My home abuts the property of the Westmoreland lot (on the other side of the small arroyo). If anyone, I would be the most "affected" by this project. And I think that it would be strongly in our community's best interest to build as much housing that is as affordable as possible."

"What I would really like to see here is a community driven, sweat equity rich, pueblo revival/row house design, adobe based vernacular project. This would pay tribute to the 4000-year sustainable history of this area as well as the adobe traditions from arid regions worldwide. Inviting our refugee brothers and sisters to take part would increase the diversity we embrace. Working together would build community. We need to be creative going forward to deal w the many issues we all face!!!"

"This is very good news as Menlo Park rents and home prices skyrocket. Please ensure " affordable" is truly affordable for this city, and not based on the inflation and gentrification taking place in Menlo right now."

"For question #26, please consider NO parking, and encourage people who do not own cars to live there. Menlo Park is a very walkable neighborhood and this project should emphasize that."

"It would be great if the city would use this site as an example of what innovative housing projects can look like. The city should consider using solar, and water harvesting and also look at ecofriendly construction options. They should think outside the box and have some fun with the opportunity to create housing for the community."

"This neighborhood does not need another Menlo Park Apartments. It needs single-family, owner-occupied homes. I think this neighborhood has a lot of potential."

"Too many cars on Westmoreland now - hinders bus, garbage, recycle, mail, emergency vehicles. Make it safe and pleasant for the residents and community. Make it look like nicer homes, not cheap rentals. Make it safe for children to play away from Westmoreland Av."

"Please continue to actively listen to the neighbors."

"Again, we need affordable home ownership plans. Not rich investors preying on our foreclosed properties."