

April 15, 2015

Sally Stang Director,
Housing and Community Development Department City of Tucson
310 North Commerce Park Loop
PO Box 27210,
Tucson, Arizona 85726-7210

## RE: Mitigation of Adverse Effects of Downtown Motor Hotel

The Downtown Motor Hotel undertaking represents the permanent loss of an important Historic Resource in Tucson, Arizona. The proposed undertaking includes the destruction and delisting of a pre-WWII modernist motor court designed by one of region's most celebrated 20<sup>th</sup> century architects Josias Joesler. The property is listed on the National Register of Historic Places as a contributor to the Armory Park National Register Historic District and individually eligible under the pending Josias Joelser National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form as the work of a master. Additionally, over the last decade there has developed a strong community interest in Midcentury Modern Architecture, this has resulted in the creation of the nonprofit Mid-century Modern Architecture Preservation Project of Tucson and the development of Tucson Modernism Week. The loss of this early modest building irreversibly damages and adversely effects the broad community a contributor to this important historic theme, Armory Park and Barrio Libre.

The proposed new construction is an intrusive non compatible four story building that is out of scale and context with both Armory Park Historic District and the adjacent Barrio Libre Historic District which we believe is eligible for National Historic Landmark designation under the American Latino Theme Study and as one of the largest concentrations of Sonoran and Transformed Sonoran Adobe architecture in the Untied States. The proposed undertaking will forever damage the historic districts eroding their distinctive sense of place.

The undertaking will result in the loss of an important historic resource, will harm community organizations that work to preserve Midcentury Modern Design, will Adversely Effect two historic districts and the individually listed Velasco House (listed 1974), The damage will permanently reduce heritage tourism potential and negatively effects the Tucson community.

The cost of mitigation should be proportionate to the property's significance and the scale of the effects of the project. In this case the property is very significant and The total project cost exceeds 10M dollars. We believe there must be a clear connection between the resource affected and the mitigation plan and it must be demonstrable that the mitigation is in the public interest.

We have developed a list of primary, secondary and city mitigations that we feel would begin to appropriately address the scope and scale the damage this undertaking will create.

## **Primary Building Mitigation**

- 1. An honest assessment of viable alternatives to reduce the damage to the historic resource. Since the beginning of this project there has been a refusal to examine alternatives to the 4 story plan.
- 2. Reduction of the height and scale to be compatible with surrounding historic buildings.
- 3. Shift all vehicle ingress and egress to Russell Avenue, convert the front courtyard into green space.
- 4. Use operable recessed double hung wood windows to reflect the design of the surrounding neighborhood.
- 5. Eliminate expansion joints.
- 6. Permeable asphalt.
- 7. Conveyance of a conservation easement of the front part of the building and the sign to the City of Tucson.

## **Secondary Mitigations**

- 8. HABS Level III documentation and submission to the Library of Congress.
- 9. 100K fund for investment for low-income owner occupied homes located in Armory Park and Barrio Libre.

- 10. 20k fund for the 501(c)3 WomanKraft Art Center directly across the street for repair of their historic building.
- 11. Final building colors must be approved by the Barrio Libre Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board.
- 12. No exterior floodlight
- 13. Tress, curb cut and water retention swales on Stone Avenue.
- 14. Cover the north south and west walls with a "Green Wall System" to reduce heat gain and soften the design.
- 15. Permanent Joelser Exhibit, historic interpretation and annual educational program.
- 16. Move the stairway tower from the Southwest corner to the northwest to reduce impacts on the adjacent contributing historic resources.

## **City Mitigation**

- 17. City of Tucson Leadership Staff to attend a ACHP section 106 training on a five year rotating basis.
  - 18. City to update and re-inventory both Armory Park and Barrio Libre Historic Districts in the two next years.
  - 19. City to create a preservation plan for Barrio Libre with community participation
  - 20. Installation of Historic Replica lighting on stone.

Thank you for your attention to our requests.

Demion Clinco Tucson Historic Preservation Foundation PO Box 40008 Tucson, Arizona 85717