



CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

July 14, 2009

MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, July 14, 2009, 2:00 PM at 2250 E. Broadway at the Community Foundation for Southern Arizona, Tucson, Arizona.

Primary CCC Members in Attendance

- Phil Swaim, Swaim Associates
- Paul Green, Tucson Audubon Society
- Pat Patton, UA Eller School of Business
- Jane Poynter, Paragon Space Development Corp
- John Schwarz, University of Arizona
- Joanie Sawyer, PRO Neighborhoods
- James MacAdam, Watershed Management Group
- Tomás León, Community Foundation for Southern Arizona
- Andy Laurenzi, Center for Desert Archeology

Alternate CCC Members in Attendance

- Gregg Garfin, UA Institute for the Study of the Environment
- Terry Galligan, Old Pueblo Community Foundation
- Barbara Warren, Physicians for Social Responsibility
- Michael Rosenzweig, UA-Tumamoc: People and Habitats
- Bryant Nodine, TUSD
- Julie Evans, Native Seeds/SEARCH

Staff in Attendance

- Nicole Urban-Lopez, Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development (OCSD)
- David Schaller, OCSD
- Leslie Liberti, OCSD
- Laura Burge, Ward 6
- Asia Philbin, Tucson Water
- Ries Lindley, Tucson Water

Public in Attendance

- Mariana Gonzalez, Intern with OCSD
- Sara Hummel-Rajca, Congresswoman Giffords' Office

AGENDA ITEMS

- 1. Call to Order / Roll Call**
 - A quorum was established and the meeting commenced at 2:08 p.m.
- 2. Welcome and Introductions**
- 3. Approval of Amended Minutes for May 21, 2009 and Minutes for June 23, 2009**
 - Jane Poynter moved to approve the amended May 21, 2009 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Julie Evans. Motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.

- Terry Galligan moved to approve the June 23, 2009 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Pat Patton. Julie Evans requested the following amendment to page 4 under Item 3: “Subcommittees must have between 3-7 members, including at least one CCC Primary member. Also, no more than 3 subcommittees can be active at time.” Motion with amendment from Julie Evans passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.
- It was commented that staff does not need to bring copies of all the meeting materials for each CCC member because many of them print their own copies. Twelve CCC members indicated that they would print their own agendas and copies of meeting minutes. This will help save paper use.

4. General Updates

- Nicole Urban-Lopez reported that the Mayor and Council adopted the Mayors’ Climate Protection Agreement (MCPA) by unanimous vote on September 6, 2006. During the Call to the Audience, only one person spoke about the MCPA agenda item. Colleen Crowninshield commented in favor of adopting the MCPA.
- Nicole reported that a link to the Community Sustainability Calendar has been placed on the CCC website. Committee members should check the calendar regularly for educational opportunities and related events. CCC members can email workshop and event notices to Nicole or David to be posted on the calendar.
- Nicole reported that she is still waiting to hear back from the IT Department about whether a password protected area can be added to the CCC website.
- David Schaller distributed a legislative update to the CCC. David explained that State HB 2335 and 2336 would have allowed cities and counties to create community facilities districts which would allow people to borrow against a government bonding authority fund base to do renewable energy installations and then pay back the loan on their yearly property tax bills. The bill that actually passed allows cities and counties to create a renewable energy incentive district for streamlining regulatory processes, but not for creating the financing mechanism for renewable energy that was the intention of the original bills. At the federal level, the Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block Grant (EECBG) was not refunded in the FY 2010 budget.
- Staff reminded the committee that the CCC web address is:
www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd/climatechangecommittee
- Barbara Warren provided information about Congresswoman Giffords’ Solar 101 series, the upcoming conference Meeting Arizona’s Water Needs Today and Tomorrow August 28, 2009 (www.arizonaic.org), and the newly released book Unquenchable by Robert Glennon (UA Law Professor).
- Phil Swaim provided information about the upcoming USGBC GreenBuild Expo in Phoenix November 11-13, 2009 (<http://www.greenbuilddexpo.org/>).

5. Discussion of revised Mitigation Plan roadmap

- Staff distributed copies of the roadmap for creating a Climate Change Mitigation Plan that was developed at the June CCC meeting.
- David discussed some additional educational topics that would be valuable for the committee, including building energy efficiency programs, electric, gas and water utility programs, transportation, and energy supply concerns.
- Concerns were raised about spending too much time on education. It was suggested that some basic information sharing occur on a few important subject areas, but that more in-depth education on specific topics could occur on an as-needed basis.
- A suggestion was made to extend the timeframe for committee education on the roadmap through December.
- It was commented that staff should direct the committee in terms of appropriate education and prevent redundancies in their efforts.
- David introduced Mariana Gonzalez, an intern for Dr. Lopez and OCSD. Mariana is compiling an inventory of GHG mitigation measures that will be presented to the CCC in August. Once the inventory is complete, staff hopes to have some of Dr. Overpeck’s students complete an analysis of the measures to determine which would be most effective in Tucson by assessing cost, outputs, etc. This analysis will take place through the fall.

- It was suggested that the mitigation measures be categorized by sector and at each meeting there can be an educational presentation about that subject prior to reviewing and discussing the measures for that topic.
- It was commented that everybody has different areas of expertise and not everybody needs to be brought up to speed on all of the various subjects that will be addressed.
- A question was raised about who will bear the costs of the various GHG mitigation measures. This is something that should be considered, as well as the cost per unit of GHG reduction achieved.
- Staff distributed a list of the screening criteria that was used in the Denver process. The committee was asked to review the list and think about other screening criteria that might be relevant for discussion at a future meeting.
- It was suggested that representatives from Davis Monthan be invited to the next CCC meeting because of the energy-related work they are doing.
- Staff reminded the committee that they should focus on measures that the City could implement or has authority over since the Mitigation Plan will be adopted by Mayor and Council and implemented by the City.
- The committee was reminded that the subcommittees are a way to engage additional people in the community as well.
- Staff clarified that the committee was created to make recommendations to Mayor and Council about how to meet the goal of the MCPA (reduction in GHG emissions to 7% below 1990 levels by 2012) and to develop an adaptation plan. It is the committee's role to determine what measures and strategies go into the Mitigation and Adaptation Plans.

6. Presentation on Climate Change Adaptation Planning

- The following is a summary of the presentation given by David Schaller. A copy of the presentation is available at: www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd/climatechangecommittee
- Types of GHGs: carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide, hydrofluorocarbons, perfluorocarbons, and sulfur hexafluoride.
- Carbon dioxide equivalents (CO₂e) is the unit used to standardize the greenhouse gas intensity of each gas. For example, one unit of methane has 25 times the greenhouse gas intensity as one unit of carbon dioxide.
- Adaptation is the ability of society to accommodate changes in climate with minimal potential social damage or economic cost.
- Direct impacts of climate change: increasing temperatures, longer droughts, less frequent but more intense rain storms
- Indirect impacts of climate change: loss of agricultural productivity in other areas affects local food security, population movements from climate impacted areas
- Existing City adaptation plans: Drought Preparedness and Response Plan, Emergency Evacuation Plan
- A primary resource the committee and staff will use is ICLEI's Guidebook for Preparing for Climate Change which will be posted on the CCC website.
- The following is a summary of the discussion following the presentation:
 - o One perspective is that mitigation is doing things for the world here in Tucson and adaptation is doing things for ourselves here in Tucson.
 - o Staff clarified the relationship between mitigation and adaptation. Care should be taken not to defeat the goals of either mitigation or adaptation by implementing the measures and strategies of each. We also don't want to mitigate where can't adapt, such as by putting solar on a house in a coastal area that will be flooded by sea rise.
 - o Mitigation is reducing GHG emissions. Adaptation would be conserving water and getting used to using less water.
 - o It was commented that the synergies between mitigation and adaptation are more obvious than the conflicts.
 - o One example provided was installing large solar arrays in the Mohave Desert that would impact sensitive species and require a water source that may not be available in the future.

- A comment was received that it might not make sense for a Climate Change committee to develop an adaptation plan because there are a lot of other entities working on related emergency preparedness plans that have better expertise.
- It was commented that coordination with a number of different entities will be necessary for adaptation planning.

7. Creation of subcommittees

- Staff suggested a few options for moving forward with adaptation planning:
 - Focus on the Mitigation Plan first and wait until next year to start working on the Adaptation Plan;
 - Develop both plans simultaneously and divide the committee’s work over the next year accordingly;
 - Continue to focus on the Mitigation Plan but create an Adaptation subcommittee to begin working on the Adaptation Plan.
- It was suggested that a subcommittee be created to assess what the City’s role is in adaptation planning and how the City interfaces with other related planning efforts.
- It was commented that creating an Adaptation subcommittee would be helpful because the topic is so new, some background research and education will be necessary.
- The subcommittee could also look for synergies between the mitigation measures and adaptation.
- Motion was made by Terry Galligan to create an Adaptation subcommittee and to appoint the following CCC members to the subcommittee:
 - Barbara Warren
 - Gregg Garfin
 - Julie Evans
 - Paul Green
 - Michael Rosenzweig
- The motion was seconded by John Schwarz. Motion passed by a unanimous vote of 12-0.
- Staff will follow-up with the Clerk’s Office regarding subcommittee membership questions and will contact the appointed Adaptation subcommittee members to schedule the first meeting.

8. Future Agenda Items

- Motion made by Terry Galligan to approve the following future agenda items:
 - Presentation from the electricity and natural gas utilities on related programs.
 - Review draft inventory of potential GHG mitigation measures.
 - Discussion of screening criteria for evaluating mitigation measures.
 - Any other items necessary to follow-through with the roadmap for creating a Climate Change Mitigation Plan.
- The motion was seconded by Pat Patton. Motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 12 to 0.

9. Call to the Audience

10. Adjournment at 4:15 p.m.