



CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

October 13, 2009

MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, October 13, 2009, 2:00 PM at 2250 E. Broadway at the Community Foundation for Southern Arizona, Tucson, Arizona.

Primary CCC Members in Attendance

- Phil Swaim, Swaim Associates
- Paul Green, Tucson Audubon Society
- Jane Poynter, Paragon Space Development Corp
- Varga Garland, Community Food Bank
- John Schwarz, University of Arizona
- Joanie Sawyer, PRO Neighborhoods
- Tomas Leon, Community Foundation for Southern Arizona
- Jonathan Overpeck, UA Institute of the Environment
- James MacAdam, Watershed Management Group

Alternate CCC Members in Attendance

- Barbara Warren, Physicians for Social Responsibility
- Rich Michal, Adolfson and Peterson Construction
- Gregg Garfin, UA Institute of the Environment
- Curtis Lueck, Curtis Lueck and Associates
- Michael Rosenzweig, UA Tumamoc: People and Habitats
- Julie Evans, Native Seeds/SEARCH

Staff in Attendance

- David Schaller, Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development (OCSD)
- Leslie Liberti, OCSD
- Nicole Urban-Lopez, OCSD

Public in Attendance

- Lee Comrie, PAG
- Sue Cotty, PAG
- Tres English, Sustainable Tucson
- Alyson Cartwright, UA
- Dr. Julia Cole, UA

AGENDA ITEMS

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

- A quorum was established and the meeting commenced at 2:00 p.m.

2. Welcome and Introductions

3. Approval of Amended Minutes for September 8, 2009

- Phil Swaim moved to approve the September 8, 2009 meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Barbara Warren. Motion passed unanimously by a voice vote of 9 to 0.

4. Legislative Updates

- David Schaller reported that the Clean Energy Jobs and American Power Act (Kerry-Boxer bill) has been introduced into the U.S. Senate. This is the Senate version of the Waxman-Markey cap and trade bill (American Clean Energy & Security Act) that was passed by the House on _____. The Senate version has more aggressive targets and allocates some of the allowance monies to local government energy efficiency projects through the Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block Grant (EECBG) program. A summary of the bill is available from ICLEI that will be posted on the CCC website.
- The U.S. EPA has finalized the first GHG reporting system. Large emitters will have to start reporting their GHG emissions in 2010. The EPA is also moving to start regulating GHG emissions in case Congress fails to legislatively regulate GHGs.

5. General Updates

- John Schwartz requested that the CCC send a letter of thanks to the OCSD intern, Mariana Gonzalez, who completed the GHG mitigation measures inventory over the summer. The Co-chairs agreed to send a letter on behalf of the CCC.
- PAG completed an update of the Regional Greenhouse Gas Inventory using 2007 data and it will be posted on the CCC website.
- The current issue of Science Magazine has a large article on carbon sequestration that may be of interest.
- Phil reported that he and staff will be meeting with Dr. Nader Chalfoun at the UA College of Architecture to explore possibilities for collaboration with the CCC.

6. Building Energy Education Overview

- Phil Swaim and Rich Michal gave a presentation which is summarized below.
 - o Buildings contribute more CO₂ emissions in the U.S. than transportation and industry.
 - o One of the impediments to green building is the up-front costs, despite lower operating costs and increased values. Options for overcoming this include education, incentives, or regulations that require green building.
 - o An idea was presented that government could offset the additional up-front cost of green building in exchange for repayment from the energy cost savings. This is a common model similar to Performance Contracting.
 - o Another factor to consider is that a building can be built to the highest energy efficiency ratings, but if the people occupying it don't know how to operate the building properly, the energy and water savings won't be realized.
 - o It was clarified that an exterior envelope system includes the windows/doors, walls, floor and roof.
 - o A copy of the LEED checklist for the LEED Platinum Reid Park Zoo Conservation Learning Center was distributed.
 - o It was asked if a company can get an energy rebate from the electric companies for their energy savings.

7. Update on the Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Measure Analysis Project with the University of Arizona

- Dr. Julie Cole and Alyson Cartwright were present to discuss the GHG mitigation measures analysis her UA Global Change class is undertaking this semester.
- The Global Change class has 15 graduate and 30 undergraduate students from a range of majors.
- The first class assignment is due on Thursday, October 15th. Dr. Cole will review with staff at that time to determine how the students are progressing on the evaluation.
- Sue Cotty from PAG has been assisting the class with use of the software that was used for the Regional Greenhouse Gas Inventory.
- Staff distributed copies of a sample GHG mitigation measure analysis that was given to the class as an example.
- Dr. Cole's class will complete their analysis by the December CCC meeting.

- Students will report on the unexpected costs and benefits of the measures.
- It was suggested that the cost per unit (ex. houses) be included for each measure in addition to the cost per ton of GHG reduced.
- It was clarified that the City of Tucson's GHG emissions total 5.4 million tons. Thus, the mitigation measures have to achieve a reduction of 2.25 million tons of GHGs to accomplish the goal of reducing GHG emissions to 7% below 1990 levels.
- It was suggested that an evaluation of who might oppose each measure be included.
- It was suggested that the cost of externalities be included in the analysis or otherwise addressed.
- It was commented that creating a list of current projects in the community would be useful. A suggestion was made to email projects so a list can be compiled.
- Dr. Cole will coordinate closely with staff and the CCC if the students need to make assumptions in their analyses.

8. Briefing on Adaptation Subcommittee's Initial Meeting

- Staff reported that the first subcommittee meeting was held on September 14, 2009.
- The committee did not select a Chairperson, but will rotate leadership each meeting.
- The next Adaptation subcommittee meeting will be on October 19, 2009.
- Staff distributed copies of the Legal Action Report from the 9/14/09 subcommittee meeting.
- The goals and objectives of an Adaptation Plan were discussed during the subcommittee meeting.
- The subcommittee is going to research/explore the use of futures scenarios.
- The subcommittee began identifying educational needs and existing community resources that can be utilized.
- The subcommittee discussed the possibility of doing risk/vulnerability assessments to determine what scenarios most need to be addressed.
- There are three primary ways that other cities are addressing adaptation planning: integrated mitigation and adaptation, parallel mitigation and adaptation, and special case adaptation needs (largely focusing on infrastructure issues related to sea level rise).
- The subcommittee has not determined which model to use.

9. Discussion and Creation of Subcommittees

- The potential need for an Outreach subcommittee was identified. This will be discussed further at the next committee meeting.
 - o It was commented that outreach can occur in advance of finalizing the list of mitigation measures to start to get buy-in from the community.
 - o Staff reported that the CCC will receive copies of the Tucson Spotlight Conversation on Climate Action Summary Report. The intention of this event was to get the community's feedback about the types of policy changes they would support to mitigate GHGs.
 - o It was commented that we do not have any baseline data about how the community feels about climate change.
 - o Gregg Garfin provided data from a report by Resource Media on public perceptions related to climate change: Nationally, 52% of the public thinks that climate change is important, 18% thinks that it is extremely important. In Arizona, 54% of the public thinks climate change is a reality and 43% thinks it is unproven.
 - o One challenge to address will be the cost of mitigation and adaptation measures. It will be important to also include the costs of not implementing the measures.

10. Future Agenda Items

- Discussion of public education/outreach strategy
- Review of Community Conversation on Climate Action Summary Report
- Report from the City of Phoenix on their climate planning process
- Progress report from Dr. Cole on mitigation measures analysis
- Transportation and Land Use educational overview
- 2010 CCC meeting schedule
- Briefing on The Local Trust (local carbon offset program)

11. Call to the Audience

- a. Tres English introduced himself as the president of a local non-profit called Empowering Local Communities that trains people on how to do home maintenance repairs and is now starting a co-op. The goal is to train several thousand people on how to do “green” retrofits. He commented that there is an extreme under consideration of retrofits as a GHG emissions reduction strategy.

12. Adjournment at 3:58 p.m.